

STAFF REPORT: 03/13/2024 MEETING

PREPARED BY: J. ROSS

APPLICATION NUMBER: HDC20204-00068

ADDRESS: 3769-3783 STURTEVANT

HISTORIC DISTRICT: RUSSELL WOODS-SULLIVAN

APPLICANT: FRANK MASTROIANNI (ITALY AMERICAN CONSTRUCION)

OWNER: ERIC RAGLAND

DATE OF PROVISIONALLY COMPLETE APPLICATION: 02/19/2024

DATE OF STAFF VISIT: 2/27/2024

SCOPE OF WORK: Erect new garage, alter existing garage, install driveways

EXISTING CONDITIONS

Erected ca. 1935, 3777 Sturtevant is a two-story, single-family dwelling that is located in the Russell Woods-Sullivan Historic District. The dwelling features a central hipped asphalt shingle roof with projecting gabled wings at the front façade. Exterior walls are primarily clad with brick. Stone also appears at front façade window surrounds and first-story bay window. Windows are steel casement units, some which include decorative stained glass with lead caming. Aluminum storms are visible at all windows. The parcel also includes a detached, hipped-roof, single-car garage, which is located to the rear of the house. The garage is one-story in height and is clad with brick which matches that found at the home's exterior walls. A single, steel overhead door is at the garage's front façade. The parcel addressed as 3769 Sturtevant is an empty/vacant lot located that is located to the east of 3777 Sturtevant. The parcel to the west of 3777 Sturtevant, addressed as 3783 Sturtevant, is also an empty/vacant lot.



3769 Sturtevant (vacant lot to the left) and 3777 Sturtevant (house and garage), current condition. Staff photo taken on 2/27/2024



3777 Sturtevant garage and vacant lot at 3783 Sturtevant (to the right) current condition. Staff photo taken on 9/28/2023

PROPOSAL

With the current submission, the applicant is seeking the Commission's approval for the following:

- Retain and rehabilitate the existing garage at 3777 Sturtevant according to the following:
 - Remove the existing overhead metal garage door (save for reinstallation) and wood trim/framing from front elevation

- Add a new 2'-0" deep, 18'-0' wide extension to the existing garage's front façade. The new front elevation will include a 14'-0" wide, 8'-0" high door opening. The existing/salvaged door will be reinstalled within this opening. Historic brick which will be removed from the existing front elevation and the rear wall will be installed at the new front elevation.
- Salvaged brick from other sources (see sample photos), selected to match the brick at the home and existing garage, will be installed at the rear where necessary/to replaced missing brick at that elevation
- The existing front-facing portion of the roof will be rebuilt/extended 3'-6" to accommodate the new front addition and allow for a 2'-0" overhang.
- Erect a new 24'x24' garage to the east of the home and existing garage, within the rear portion of the adjacent lot addressed as 3769 Sturtevant per the submitted drawings. Salvaged brick, from other sources (see sample photos) selected to match the brick at the home and existing garage, will be installed at the new garage's front façade. Fiber cement siding with a faux wood grain texture is proposed for installation at the garage's side and rear walls.
- At 3777 Sturtevant, replace the existing 9'-0" wide driveway and curb cut with a new 12'-0" wide concrete driveway and curbcut. As the driveway extends to the east/to the adjacent parcel at 3769 Sturtevant to accommodate the new garage it will widen to 14'-0' and will terminate with a 24'-0" wide apron in front of the new garage door opening. A 21'-0" wide apron is proposed for the existing garage.



Sample of brick mix/brick salvaged from an offsite source, that will be used for the front elevation for the new garage and the rear elevation of the existing garage (where necessary)

STAFF OBSERVATIONS AND RESEARCH

- The applicant submitted the below proposal to the Commission for review at the October 13, 2023 regular meeting:
 - Demolish the existing historic-age, two-car garage at 3777 Sturtevant

- Erect a new six-car garage to the rear of the home. The garage's footprint would have extended into the adjacent parcel to the east/3769 Sturtevant. Brick which is salvaged from the existing/historic garage was proposed for installation at the new garage's front façade. Fiber cement siding was proposed for installation at the side and rear walls.
- Replace the existing 9'-0" wide driveway and curb cut with a new 18'-0" concrete driveway and curbcut. Also, a new 57'-0" wide concrete apron was proposed for addition towards the front of the new garage.

The Commission **Denied** the above proposal because they determined that existing garage proposed for demolition was Contributing to the subject parcel and the wider neighborhood/historic district, the application did not provide sufficient documentation that the garage was deteriorated beyond repair, and the proposed new garage's extension into the adjacent parcel and the width of the new driveway was inconsistent with extant properties within the district.

- The proposal was therefore modified to include the rehabilitation of the existing historic-age garage, the erection of a new garage on the adjacent lot, and the addition of a new curbcut and driveway which measures 4'-0" wider than the existing. Specifically, the difference between the 10/13/2023 application and the current includes the following:
 - Per the current proposal, the existing historic garage will be kept. In order to address structural issues associated with the door framing and to provide additional space, a small, 2'-0' addition will be appended to the front elevation. The size of the door opening will not change from the existing and the wall will be clad with brick which has been salvaged from the building. The wood trim which currently frames the overhead door at the front, which is not of historic age, will not be reinstalled.
 - A new 24'x24' garage will be erected on the adjacent parcel/3769 Sturtevant. The previous proposal sought approval to erect a new 54'x24' garage.
 - The new curbcut and driveway proposed with the current application will measure 4'-0" wider than the existing versus the previous/denied application, which sought to widen the existing driveway and curbcut by an extra 9'-0".
- A review of data maintained by the City of Detroit indicated that 3769 and 3777 Sturtevant were combined into a single legal parcel (#14004655-6) on 2/12/2024. The majority of lots within the district are single lots although double lots do appear in small numbers.
- The field visit revealed that the majority of homes within the 3700-3800 blocks of Sturtevant retain their original two-car, historic-age garages
- It is staff's opinion that the work proposed for the existing garage is in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- Its is staff's opinion that the proposed new garage design is compatible with the historic property and its adjacent surrounds.
- The new project will result in widening the driveway and current curbcut by 4'-0". Although the majority of driveways are 9'-10' wide within the 3700-3800 block of Sturtevant, there are 12'-0" wide driveways throughout the district. Furthermore, it is common that parking aprons extend the full width of their associated garage. Therefore, the 24'-0" wide apron proposed for the new garage and the 21'-0" wide apron proposed for the existing garage are compatible with the property's and district's historic appearance.

ISSUES

- None

RECOMMENDATION

Section 21-2-73, CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (COA)

It is staff's opinion that the project as proposed is appropriate to the property's historic character. Staff therefore recommends that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for this project because it meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standard's for Rehabilitation and conforms to the district's Elements of Design.