

**CITY OF DETROIT
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL**

INVESTIGATION REPORT

OIG FILE No. 22-0005-INV



JUNE 24, 2022

**Ellen Ha, ESQ. CIG
INSPECTOR GENERAL**

I. Summary

The Office of Inspector General (OIG) received an anonymous complaint from a City of Detroit Department of Elections (DOE) employee who attended a training session held at the DOE. The employee alleged that during the training, which was held at the DOE and conducted by DOE Deputy Director Rueben Washington that he informed the attendees that Detroit City Clerk, Janice Winfrey was running for a congressional seat in the 12th District. It is further alleged that Mr. Washington distributed the nominating petitions for Clerk Winfrey's congressional campaign to the attendees during the training session and requested assistance in circulating the petition and obtaining signatures on behalf of Candidate Winfrey.

Based on our investigation, the OIG finds that a City of Detroit election training was held at the DOE on March 1, 2022. Based on the evidence presented to the OIG, we further find Mr. Washington informed the attendees at the meeting that Clerk Winfrey was running for a congressional office, and he distributed nominating petitions for Candidate Winfrey to the election trainers who were attending the training session for the City, at the DOE. The OIG concludes that Mr. Washington abused his authority by using City resources and City property for political activities during work hours in violation of Section 2-106.7 of the 2012 Charter of the City of Detroit. (the Charter), as well as the City's Universal Work Rules¹. As to whether Mr. Washington's conduct also violated Section 2-6-73 of the City of Detroit Ethics Ordinance, we will defer the matter to the City's Board of Ethics (BOE).

As to Clerk Winfrey, for the reasons stated in the body of this report, we find no evidence that she violated the Charter when she requested Mr. Washington's assistance in distributing petitions for her congressional campaign. Specifically, we find no evidence that she directed Mr. Washington to distribute the petitions at the March 1st DOE training session. Moreover, based on the testimonies provided by Clerk Winfrey and Mr. Washington, we do not find Clerk Winfrey violated the Charter or abused her authority in this instance.

More importantly, our investigation revealed the DOE does not have any departmental policy to inform and train its staff on the specifics of prohibited political activities. Further, based on the actions of Mr. Washington in this instance and the testimonies provided by witnesses in this investigation, the OIG finds that the City of Detroit and the DOE would be better served if DOE personnel receive training on prohibited political activities.

The OIG recommends that the DOE create a policy on prohibited political activities and train all DOE staff on this policy. Further, Clerk Winfrey should ensure that volunteers in her campaign team, who are also City employees are adequately trained on prohibited political activities. Lastly, the OIG recommends appropriate discipline for Mr. Washington for abusing his authority and violating the Charter and the Universal Work Rules.

¹ Corrective Disciplinary Action Guidelines & Attendance Policy

II. Background

Based on OIG's preliminary review of the complaint and follow up inquiries, the OIG initiated an investigation to determine whether Rueben Washington abused his authority by using City resources and property for political activities during work hours in violation of the Charter. In addition, because Mr. Washington is an appointee of Clerk Winfrey, the OIG also sought to determine whether Clerk Winfrey abused her authority by using City resources and property in her political pursuit in violation of the Charter.

Department of Elections

Under the Charter, the DOE is responsible for planning, monitoring, and administering all elections in the City of Detroit.² The DOE is headed by the Election Commission composed of the City Clerk, who is Chairperson; the President of the City Council; and the Corporation Counsel.³ In addition, the Charter requires the City Clerk to appoint the Director and the Deputy Director of the DOE.⁴

Presently, the City Clerk and therefore the Chairperson of the DOE is Janice Winfrey. The current Director of the DOE is Gina Avery-Walker. In addition, there are 3 Deputy Directors of the DOE: George Azzouz, who oversees matters concerning the DOE's technical supplies and equipment, Melissa King, who oversees matters concerning election registration and absentee ballots for the City of Detroit, and Mr. Washington, who oversees recruitment and training of DOE personnel.⁵ All three deputy directors were appointed by the City Clerk.

A. Board of Ethics (BOE) Training

When asked about DOE's policy concerning prohibited political activities during work hours or involving usage of City resources and properties, Clerk Winfrey, DOE Director Avery-Walker, and DOE Deputy Director Washington confirmed the DOE does not have any such policy.⁶ Clerk Winfrey however stated in her interview that DOE staff received training on prohibited political activities involving City resources and property during a recent BOE training.⁷

In fact, the Charter requires the BOE to provide annual ethics training to all public servants.⁸ The training is intended to provide a general overview of the City of Detroit Ethics Ordinance that guides all City employees, boards, commissions, elected officials, and appointees in their official capacities. The information provided in the training is also intended to help City employees to understand their responsibilities and obligations as an employee, vendor, and business partner in maintaining ethical behavior and practices while working and conducting business with and on behalf

² City Charter Sec. 3-101.

³ City Charter Sec. 3-102.

⁴ City Charter Sec. 3-104.

⁵ OIG Interview of DOE Director Gina Avery-Walker dated May 11, 2022.

⁶ OIG Interviews of Rueben Washington dated April 28, 2022, and Clerk Winfrey, dated May 5, 2022, and DOE Director Gina Avery-Walker, dated May 11, 2022.

⁷ OIG Interview of Clerk Winfrey dated May 5, 2022.

⁸ City Charter Sec. 2-106.9(4) and (5).

of the City of Detroit.⁹ The training is mandated by the Charter to ensure that City employees understand and adhere to the requirements of the City's Ethics Ordinance.¹⁰

According to Dawn Widman, BOE Investigator, the BOE Training Specialist designed an online annual training schedule, broken into quarters, for all City public servants.¹¹ This information is disseminated via several sources, including directly to the departments with a letter providing direction, via a mass emailing to all public servants, and is posted on several City websites including the BOE website.¹²

The online Ethics training course is comprised of six sections¹³:

1. Module 1: Introduction to Ethics
2. Module 2: Detroit Ethics Ordinance and Charter Sections
3. Module 3: Standards of Conduct
4. Module 4: Six Pillars of Character
5. Module 5: Ethical Dilemmas
6. Module 6: The Board of Ethics Summary

Each section contains information, resources, and reference guides that the employee can download, print, and save to a computer for future reference. After successfully completing each section, the employee receives an electronic certificate of completion.¹⁴

Module 3 of the online training outlines several prohibitions within the Ethics Ordinance. One of the examples under Module 3 covers exploiting City property and resources for campaigning. This prohibition is outlined in Sec. 2-6-73 of the Ethics Ordinance which states in part:

- (a) Elective officers are prohibited from soliciting appointees, appointive officers, and employees to work on political campaign activities using City property or during work hours.
- (b) Appointees, appointive officers, and employees are prohibited from engaging in campaign activities by using City property or engaging in such activities during work hours.

We also note the online training includes an example of a supervisor distributing campaign flyers to local businesses during work hours which is used to illustrate this prohibition. At the end of the Module 3, the same example is used to test the knowledge of the employee about the prohibited conduct of exploiting City property and resources for campaigning.¹⁵

⁹ https://www.detroitethics.org/trainings_

¹⁰ *Id.*

¹¹ OIG Correspondence with Dawn Widman, BOE OIG Liaison, dated May 13, 2022

¹² *Id.*

¹³ https://www.detroitethics.org/trainings_

¹⁴ <https://elearning.easygenerator.com/9abe7e01-d0dc-4768-9ff0-c0163c3c5858/#/>.

¹⁵ *Id.*

B. Prohibition of Political Campaign Activities

According to the Charter, appointees, appointive officers, and employees are prohibited from engaging in campaign activities using City property or engaging in such activity during work hours.¹⁶ Likewise, the Mayor, City Council members and the City Clerk are also prohibited from soliciting appointees, appointive officers, and employees to work on political campaign activities using City property or during working hours.¹⁷

C. Training Sessions for Election Trainers

Mr. Washington is the DOE Deputy Director who is responsible for recruitment and training on matters concerning City elections.¹⁸ He trains the election trainers responsible for training poll workers and managing their receiving boards.¹⁹ Some of the election trainers work for the City full time, while others work for outside entities.²⁰ Election trainers submit timesheets for the trainings they attend and are paid by the City on a weekly basis.²¹

On March 1, 2022, the DOE held a meeting for the election trainers at 6pm on the third floor assembly room at the DOE.²² There were fifteen people²³ who attended the meeting and signed in for the training session.²⁴ According to the agenda for the meeting, there was a video presentation and a discussion on expectations for the upcoming election season, training schedule for April and May, election redistricting, training availability from June 6 to August 2, and recruiting for the receiving boards.²⁵ The instructors for the meeting were Mr. Washington and Chaundra Haynes.²⁶

On March 14, 2022, the DOE held another meeting for the election trainers, again at 6pm on the third floor assembly room at the DOE.²⁷ There were eleven people²⁸ who attended and signed in for this meeting.²⁹ According to the agenda for the meeting, there was discussion on receiving workers list, supervisor list, trouble shooter list, precinct changes, receiving board position clerk changes, and a review of check of operations.³⁰ Again, the instructors for the meeting were Mr. Washington and Ms. Haynes.³¹

¹⁶ City Charter Sec. 2-106.7.

¹⁷ *Id.*

¹⁸ OIG Interview of Rueben Washington dated April 28, 2022.

¹⁹ A Receiving Board is an independent board established to ensure the recountability of election precincts. Receiving Board Guide Provided by the Michigan Bureau of Elections Updated as of 7.18.2016

²⁰ *Id.*

²¹ *Id.*

²² *Id.*

²³ Kimberly Vinson, Sharyl Chatman, Joyce Taylor, Nakia Campbell, Darrell Garth, Raquel Branch, Mia James, Jaleesa McIntosh, Yvonne Brookins, Marcia Toney, Patricia Perry, Tony Davis, Chaundra Frierson-Haynes, Alona Rhodeman, and Hazel White.

²⁴ DOE 2022 Trainers August Hands on Training Sign-in Sheet.

²⁵ March 1, 2022 Agenda.

²⁶ OIG Interview of Rueben Washington, dated April 28, 2022.

²⁷ *Id.*

²⁸ Michelle Collins, Jaleesa McIntosh, Nyellca Denham, Darrell Garth, Sharyl Chatman, Hazel White, Joyce Taylor, Patricia Perry, Alona Rhodeman, Chaundra Frierson-Haynes, and Nakia Campbell.

²⁹ DOE 2022 Trainers August Hands on Training Sign-in Sheet.

³⁰ March 14, 2022 Agenda.

³¹ OIG Interview of Rueben Washington, dated April 28, 2022.

By all account, the OIG confirmed both election trainings at issue were held at 6pm at the DOE, in a City property. In addition, it is irrefutable that Mr. Washington was present, in his capacity as the Deputy DOE and as one of two instructors for both election training sessions at the DOE.

D. Clerk Winfrey's Nominating Petitions for Congress

According to Clerk Winfrey, sometime in late January or early February staff meeting, she informed her office administrative team that she was running for United States Congress in the 12th District.³² Clerk Winfrey's administrative team include Andre Gilbert, Gina Avery-Walker, Daniel Baxter, George Azzouz, Rueben Washington, and Michelle Collins. She informed the team to make them aware that she may be away from the office more than usual for campaign-related matters.³³

The OIG requested Clerk Winfrey's nominating petitions from the State of Michigan Bureau of Elections to confirm whether the names of the trainers who attended the March 1st DOE training session were listed as circulators and signatories on the petitions. The OIG received and reviewed 178 petitions containing the signatures supporting Clerk Winfrey as a candidate of the Democratic party for the office of United States Congress in the 12th District for the primary election to be held on August 2, 2022.

Based on our review of the records we received from the State, we identified the following circulators and signatories of the petitions: Clerk Winfrey, George Azzouz, Rueben Washington, Hazel White³⁴, Timothy Williams, Chikita Farris, Vanola Williams, David Nathan, Nakia Campbell³⁵, Virginia Saleem, Muhsin Muhammad, and Geralyn Rogers. Clerk Winfrey and Mr. Washington collected the highest number of signatures. Of the petitions reviewed by the OIG, we confirmed at least two individuals identified as signatories of the petitions were at the March 1 and 14, 2022 DOE training session. In addition, one petition lacked a name and the signature of the person who circulated the petition.³⁶

III. Analysis and Findings

The complainant alleges that they attended the training sessions for election trainers that were held at the DOE. The OIG confirmed that complainant was present at the trainings held on March 1, 2022, and March 14, 2022, at the DOE.³⁷ The complainant alleges that during the March 1, 2022 training session, Mr. Washington informed the trainers of Clerk Winfrey's congressional campaign and distributed an envelope with nominating petitions. He further requested the trainers to collect signatures and to return the signed petitions to him by the March 14, 2022 training session. At the

³² OIG Interview of Clerk Winfrey, dated May 5, 2022.

³³ *Id.*

³⁴ The OIG interviewed Ms. White. She stated that she does not recall collecting any petitions at the DOE training. The OIG could not contact her to confirm where she received the petitions she signed.

³⁵ The OIG interviewed Ms. Campbell. She stated that she collected the petitions from the DOE training and turned the completed petitions back in to Mr. Washington.

³⁶ Nominating Petition 000174.

³⁷ March 1, 2022 and March 14, 2022 Sign-In Sheets.

training held on March 14, 2022, Mr. Washington informed the trainers that the deadline to return Clerk Winfrey's signed petitions had been extended to March 25, 2022, but if they complete it earlier, they should return the petitions before the 25th deadline. The complainant returned their petitions to Mr. Washington at the DOE. The complainant stated that they have not received any compensation from their attendance at the meeting or for collecting the signatures for Clerk Winfrey's petitions.

The OIG interviewed eight election trainers³⁸ who attended the DOE training sessions held on March 1 and 14, 2022. Three attendees confirmed that Mr. Washington informed them of Clerk Winfrey's congressional campaign and distributed nominating petitions for her congressional campaign. In addition, they confirmed that they did not receive any compensation for attending the training sessions or collecting signatures on behalf of Candidate Winfrey.³⁹ The other election trainers who attended the March meetings stated that they were present at the trainings but could not recall whether Mr. Washington mentioned Clerk Winfrey's campaign or whether he distributed the petitions.

A. OIG Interview of Rueben Washington

On April 28, 2022, the OIG interviewed Mr. Washington. He stated that he has worked on election matters since 2017. He further confirmed that he is responsible for education, training and recruiting for the DOE. Mr. Washington also ensures that the poll workers are assigned to the correct precincts and are trained. He confirmed that he held a training session on March 1, 2022, on the third floor assembly room at the DOE. He stated that the training was an introductory meeting where he sought to inform the trainers of the recent changes from the State of Michigan. During the meeting he showed a video on elections, reviewed the availability of the trainers, put together a calendar for the upcoming training sessions, reviewed changes on even-year elections, and discussed matters pertaining to the previous November elections. Mr. Washington stated that his lead trainer, Chaundra Haynes also led portions of the meeting, especially relating to the receiving boards.

Mr. Washington stated that towards the end of the training, he mentioned that Clerk Winfrey would be running for another position and would need volunteers to collect signatures for her. He reported that some of the trainers had already left the room or were in and out of the room when he made the announcement. Additionally, he confirmed that he distributed Clerk Winfrey's petitions to the trainers, but not all the trainers took the petitions. During his interview with the OIG, Mr. Washington stated that he stressed to the trainers that gathering signatures was on a volunteer basis.

According to Mr. Washington, Ms. Winfrey asked him to assist her with collecting signatures for her petitions and he agreed to do so. He stated that he did not receive any directive from Clerk Winfrey or anyone else to distribute Clerk Winfrey's petitions to the trainers at the meeting which was held at the DOE. He made the sole decision to request assistance from the trainers and other people he knew outside the city to collect signatures for Clerk Winfrey's petitions. Mr. Washington stated that this was the first time he asked the trainers to collect signatures on Clerk Winfrey's behalf.

³⁸ Jaleesa McIntosh, Raquel Branch, Tony Davis, Patricia Perry, Mia James, Nakia Campbell, Hazel White, and Chaundra Haynes.

³⁹ The other five election trainers stated that they were present at the training but could not recall whether Mr. Washington mentioned Clerk Winfrey's campaign or distributed petitions.

Mr. Washington further confirmed that he held a follow-up meeting on March 14, 2022, on the third floor assembly room at the DOE. The purpose of the meeting was for the trainers to pick up their receiving board list and to call people to see who would be able to work at the election polls. At the meeting, Mr. Washington admitted that he reminded the trainers to return the signed and completed petitions for Clerk Winfrey as soon as possible. Once the election trainers were done with collecting signatures, Mr. Washington stated that he would pick them up from the trainers at their home or other offsite location. However, he admitted that some trainers dropped off the completed petitions to him at the DOE. After Mr. Washington collected the petitions from the trainers, he gave them to Clerk Winfrey.

According to Mr. Washington, the trainers did not receive compensation for their attendance at the March 1st or March 14th meetings because those meetings were considered informational and not official trainings. The official training schedule began on April 28, 2022. He also stated that the trainers did not receive compensation for collecting signatures for Clerk Winfrey's petitions.

The DOE staff was required to complete the online Ethics training in the first quarter of 2022.⁴⁰ According to Mr. Washington, he completed his online Ethics training sometime in February 2022. Our review of the BOE record which identifies DOE employees who participated in the Ethics training confirm that Mr. Washington successfully passed the online training course, including Module 3.⁴¹ He recalls some, but not all the topics that were covered during the online Ethics training. Mr. Washington stated that he did not recall the training covering any prohibition from political activities.⁴² Mr. Washington stated that as staff members of the DOE, they are required to be non-partisan. However, as to his knowledge of any DOE policy or rules regarding prohibition against political activities during work hours or at City properties, Mr. Washington claimed he was not aware of any.

While we acknowledge the fact that the DOE does not have any written policy, we find in his role as a Deputy Director at the DOE, Mr. Washington abused his authority. He is responsible for managing and training of DOE staff and volunteers on elections matters. In addition, he recently received Ethics training from the BOE. Therefore, in his capacity as the Deputy Director of the DOE, we find Mr. Washington should have known that soliciting assistance for a political candidate, distribution and collection of petitions on City property during work hours are prohibited political activities.

We find, in his role as a Deputy Director in DOE, Mr. Washington carried gravitas among everyone who attended these training sessions. Mr. Washington admits that he did in fact solicit the distribution and the collection of petitions on behalf of Congressional Candidate Winfrey from the attendees of the March 1st training session. This is concerning for the OIG, as at the time, Clerk Winfrey was and is currently the highest authority in the DOE. Clerk Winfrey also appointed Mr. Washington as a Deputy Director for the DOE. Based on the foregoing facts, the OIG finds that Mr. Washington abused his authority by using City property for political activities during work hours in

⁴⁰ OIG Correspondence with Dawn Widman, dated May 13, 2022. The last in-person training for the DOE occurred more than four years ago.

⁴¹ OIG Interview of Rueben Washington, dated May 6, 2022.

⁴² *Id.*

violation of the Charter and the City’s Universal Work Rules.

B. OIG Interview of Clerk Winfrey

On May 5, 2022, the OIG interviewed Clerk Winfrey who is responsible for keeping all the official records for the City of Detroit and administering all elections in the City of Detroit.⁴³ According to Clerk Winfrey, some of her staff at the DOE and the City Clerk’s Office also work for her campaign on a volunteer basis. Clerk Winfrey stated that she and her husband meet with her campaign team members, also known as “Friends of Janice Winfrey,” on some evenings after work and some Saturdays, usually at a restaurant. Clerk Winfrey claims that she did not expect that Mr. Washington would ask for assistance from the City employees to circulate petitions on her behalf. More specifically, she was very clear in that she did not request Mr. Washington ask for assistance from the election trainers who work for the DOE.

Clerk Winfrey stated that she is aware that some DOE staff volunteer to help on her campaign, but she did not request for their assistance at the DOE or in the City building during working hours. Clerk Winfrey stated that she is aware of the trainings that Mr. Washington leads, however, she was not aware that he had asked for volunteers to collect signatures for her petitions at the March 1st meeting that took place at the DOE.

According to Clerk Winfrey, she never directly counseled or advised Mr. Washington that it would be inappropriate to conduct campaign activities on City property. However, she stated that Mr. Washington should have been aware that campaign activities are not to be held on City property because he attended an Ethics training earlier this year. Clerk Winfrey stated multiple times during her interview with the OIG that she is “very careful about mixing her work as City Clerk with her campaign,” so there is no way that a meeting with DOE staff should have spilled over to matters involving her campaign. As such, Clerk Winfrey states that she is not aware that election trainers who attended the March training session picked up or dropped off petitions for her candidacy as a congressional member at the DOE. Clerk Winfrey stated that she picks up blank petitions from the DOE, like other candidates who are running for public office. However, she advises people who collect signatures for her petitions not to deliver them to her at the DOE. Instead, she advises them to drop the signed petitions off with Mr. Washington.⁴⁴

Based on the foregoing facts, the OIG finds that Clerk Winfrey did not abuse her authority by using City resources or City property for political activities during work hours. However, we caution Clerk Winfrey to ensure her appointees and employees under her supervision who assist with her campaigns be adequately trained on prohibited political activities.

C. OIG Interview of Gina Avery-Walker

On May 11, 2022, the OIG interviewed Gina Avery-Walker. Ms. Avery-Walker is the Director of the DOE. Ms. Avery-Walker is responsible for ensuring fair and safe elections are provided to all Detroit registered voters. She also ensures that all procedures are done on time, there is accurate maintenance of registration records, provides training for all poll workers, and provides

⁴³ City Charter Sec. 3-102, 103.and City Charter Sec. 3.5-102.

⁴⁴ She did not specify where the drop-off will happen.

all election equipment.⁴⁵ According to Ms. Avery-Walker, the DOE only handles petitions for City of Detroit municipal elections, not any elections at the state or federal level. Candidates for non-municipal elections pick up their petitions from the County or the State, not from the DOE. At all times relevant to this investigation, Melissa King, is the DOE staff who is responsible for petitions for candidates who are running for City offices.

Ms. Avery-Walker stated that DOE staff are non-partisan and they do not participate in political activities during the work hours. As such, DOE staff undergoes Ethics training at the beginning of each year. The training is done online, and staff are given 2-3 weeks to complete the virtual training. The training is conducted by the BOE and covers what a public servant can and cannot do. She reported that the staff has not undergone any other type of training besides the Ethics training. Ms. Avery-Walker is not aware of any DOE policies or training that cover prohibited political activities.

Ms. Avery-Walker further stated that she was not aware of the training conducted by Mr. Washington on March 1st or the 14th of this year. Generally, Mr. Washington provides her with a copy of training schedule for election trainers and poll workers. However, she does not see the agenda or knows what occurs at the trainings. Ms. Avery-Walker stated that prior to the OIG interview, she was not aware of the allegations that Mr. Washington distributed Clerk Winfrey's petitions for her candidacy at a DOE training session held on a City property. Ms. Avery-Walker stated that it would be inappropriate for any DOE staff to distribute petitions on City time.

Based on the information provided to the OIG, we find other than an annual BOE training, DOE staff does not receive any additional training pertaining to prohibited political activities. Therefore, the OIG finds the DOE staff would stand to benefit if the DOE had a clearly written internal policy and the staff receive training on prohibited political activities in addition to the annual BOE training.

IV. Conclusion

Based on the foregoing analysis, the OIG concludes that Mr. Washington abused his authority by using City property for political activities during work hours in violation of the Charter and the City's Universal Work Rules. It is also important to note that while the OIG does not make any assessment as to whether Mr. Washington's conduct was a violation of the City's Ethics Ordinance, we note the ordinance has a section which addresses prohibited political activities for City employees.

V. Recommendation

As evidenced by this investigation, the OIG believes that the issue pertaining to prohibited political activities may not be isolated and unique only to DOE staff. Therefore, we recommend that the City Law Department and the BOE consider drafting a City-wide policy addressing the issues raised in this report. Ideally, such a policy would clearly define prohibited political activities. The Law Department can provide legal guidance in creating the policy, as the policy must be in line with any existing law.

In addition, it is important that the policy should be made known and effective through

⁴⁵ OIG Interview of DOE Director Gina Avery-Walker dated May 11, 2022.

training sessions and/or by inclusion in the City website, newsletter, or other means to ensure all City employees who volunteer to work on anyone's campaign are adequately trained on prohibited political activities and are in compliance with the Charter and the City's Ethics Ordinance.

The OIG further recommends the Clerk to take appropriate disciplinary action against Mr. Washington for abusing his authority and violating the Charter in accordance with the City's Universal Work Rules. We make this recommendation so that City employees have a better understanding that the City has rules and policies in place pertaining to prohibited political activities during work and on City property; and those employees who violate such rules and policies will be held accountable. City resources are to be used for the benefit of the public, in public interest.

VI. Evidence Reviewed

a. Interviews

1. Complainant
2. Gina Avery-Walker, DOE Director
3. Janice Winfrey, City Clerk
4. Jennifer Redmond, Wayne County Department of Elections Deputy Director
5. Rueben Washington, DOE Deputy Director
6. Election Trainers
 - a. Chaundra Haynes
 - b. Hazel White
 - c. Jaleesa McIntosh
 - d. Mia James
 - e. Nakia Campbell
 - f. Patricia Perry
 - g. Raquel Branch
 - h. Tony Davis

b. Documents

1. BOE Ordinance Provisions.
2. BOE Annual Online Training Materials.
3. BOE Training Schedule.
4. City Charter Provisions.
5. Clerk Winfrey's Nominating Petitions for 12th Congressional District.
6. Employee timesheets.
7. March 1, 2022 Meeting Notice.
8. March 1, 2022 Meeting Agenda.
9. March 1, 2022 Sign-in Sheet.
10. March 14, 2022 Meeting Notice.
11. March 14, 2022 Meeting Agenda.
12. March 14, 2022 Sign-in Sheet.
13. Text Messages of Meeting Notices.

VII. Mr. Rueben Washington's Response

Per the Charter and the OIG Administrative Hearing Rules on June 16, 2022 the OIG emailed Mr. Rueben Washington a copy of the Draft OIG File No. 22-0005-INV. On June 23, 2022, Mr. Washington sent a response via email to the draft report stating in summary that he “accepts responsibility for the findings” in the report. Mr. Washington’s response is included with this report.

City of Detroit
DEPARTMENT OF ELECTIONS

GINA C. AVERY-WALKER
Director

JANICE M. WINFREY, *City Clerk*
Chairperson, Election Commission

MELISSA KING
Deputy Director

2978 W. Grand Blvd.
Detroit, Michigan 48202-3069
(313) 876-0190 Fax (313) 876-0053

June 23, 2022

I have received and read your Investigative Report, OIG File No. 22-0005-INV, concerning the distribution and circulation of petitions during meetings held on March 1 and March 14, 2022. I accept responsibility of the findings documented in your report and assure you that this type of activity will not occur again in the future.

Respectfully,



Ruebenstein Washington
Deputy Director of Elections