

David Whitaker, Esq.
Director
Irvin Corley, Jr.
Executive Policy Manager
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Director, City Planning Commission
Janese Chapman
Director, Historic Designation
Advisory Board

John Alexander
Megha Bamola
LaKisha Barclift, Esq.
Nur Barre
Paige Blessman
M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP
Christopher Gulock, AICP


City of Detroit

CITY COUNCIL

LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION
208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

Derrick Headd
Marcel Hurt, Esq.
Kimani Jeffrey
Edward King
Jamie Murphy
Kim Newby
Analine Powers, Ph.D.
Laurie Anne Sabatini
Rebecca Savage
Ryan Schumaker
Sabrina Shockley
Renee Short
Thomas Stephens, Esq.
Dr. Sheryl Theriot
Theresa Thomas
Ashley A. Wilson

TO: Denise Starr, Director
Human Resources Department

FROM: David Whitaker, Director 
Legislative Policy Division Staff

DATE: March 11, 2022

RE: 2022-2023 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding your department's budget for the 2022-2023 Fiscal Year.

Please be prepared to respond to the issues/questions raised in our analysis during your scheduled hearing on **Friday, March 18, 2022, at 10:00 a.m.** We would then appreciate a written response to the issues/questions at your earliest convenience before or after your budget hearing. Please forward a copy of your responses to the Council members, the City Clerk's Office, and the Legislative Policy Division.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis.

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

DW:dh:ss
Attachments:
Issues and Questions
HR Department Budget Pages

CC: Councilmembers
Auditor General's Office
Hakim Berry, Group Executive
Jay Rising, Acting Chief Financial Officer
Tanya Stoudemire, Chief Deputy CFO
Steve Watson, Budget Director
Felix O'Aku, Agency CFO
James Tatum, Budget Analyst
Gail Fulton, Mayor's Office

Human Resources Department (28)

FY 2022-2023 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

Issues and Questions

The mission of the Human Resources Department (HR) is to provide services and implement programs that attract, hire, retain, and support a qualified and talented workforce committed to providing timely, quality services to City of Detroit citizens, employees, businesses, and visitors in an environment that contributes to the City's objectives.

The Human Resources Department consists of several divisions and sections that provide a full range of personnel and other services to City departments and agencies in accordance with the City Charter:

- **The Office of Recruitment**
- **The Office of Employee Services**
- **The Office of Labor Relations**
- **The Benefits Administration Office**
- **The Office of Policy, Planning and Operations**
- **The Office of Talent Development and Performance Management**
- **Classification and Compensation**

Issues and Questions

(Page B28-4) General Fund expenses for HR increases by \$1,417,077 (10.6%) in **FY 23**, due primarily to a \$1,521,889 increase in Salary & Wages (21%), a \$109,066 increase in Employee Benefits (4%), a \$16,900 (34.2%) increase in Operating Supplies, a \$47,022 (5%) increase in Operating Services and a \$2,000 increase in Other Expenses, which is offset by \$279,800 (-12.1%) decrease in Professional & Contractual Services.

Positions (by FTE):	1/1/2022 Actual	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend
General Fund	92	105	105
Non-General Fund	-	-	-
Total Positions	92	105	105

As illustrated in the chart above, as of 1/1/22, the department has 13 vacancies.¹ The Mayor has recommended no changes in positions in FY 23.

- 1) Please discuss the status of the 13 vacancies.
- 2) How long have the vacancies existed?
- 3) What is the level of turnover savings² budgeted for HR in FY 23?

¹ As of 1/1/2022, there were 92 actuals out of 105 budgeted positions for FY 22 (Page B28-3).

² Turnover savings reflect the amount of money saved when a budgeted position remains unfilled or is under-filled.

- 4) What are the vacant positions in HR and how will filling them affect the department's day-to-day operations?
- 5) Please explain why salaries & wages increase by \$1.52 million, or by 21%, in FY 2023 when there is no increase in the number of budgeted positions in FY 2023.
- 6) Does HR know of any departments where City employees working remotely on a hybrid basis has negatively impacted the delivery of City services?
- 7) How has HR worked with departments to ensure the safety of City employees as more come back to work in person?
- 8) Besides the Policy Department, in what City departments is there a high level of turnover due to the City not providing competitive wages?
- 9) Does HR feel City employees could take advantage more of the training that is offered by HR?
- 10) Please briefly detail the department's new expense initiatives, new capital funding requests, operational reforms and savings proposals, and new revenue initiatives/proposals to be implemented in FY 2023. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiative/request/proposal are impacting in FY 2023.

HUMAN RESOURCES (28)

Department Overview

MISSION:

The Human Resources Department provides services and implements programs that attract, hire, retain, and support a qualified and talented workforce committed to providing timely, quality services to City of Detroit citizens, employees, businesses, and visitors in an environment that contributes to the City's objectives.

STRATEGIC PRIORITIES:

- 1 Identify, develop and support Human Resources technological needs to enhance process efficiencies, effectiveness and Department staff productivity.
- 2 Ensure the City's workforce needs are met using various tools such as succession and workforce planning.
- 3 Provide consistent application of human resources policies, practices, and procedures.
- 4 Improve internal business practices to save time, money, and resources.
- 5 Evaluate and improve classification and compensation programs to attract, retain, motivate, and reward employees, by improving current processes, taking the lead in aligning the City's system to industry standards, and creating and revising position descriptions/specs to ensure we are increasing our talent pool and offering equal opportunities to hire Detroiters and others.
- 6 Create a new HR Business Model that achieves excellence through the use of predictive analytics, workforce planning tools/software, sourcing strategies, and competitive total rewards.
- 7 Develop an HR Business Model that sets forth the Department's philosophy, goals, and priorities, and provide the tools and resources required to fully implement the Model.

Operating Programs

- **Office of Talent Acquisition** is responsible for the timely, full life cycle recruitment needs of the City of Detroit, including but not limited to, Sourcing, Screening, Testing, Selection, working with our Community Partnerships and Administering the Internship and Ambassador Programs. Assist with Career Readiness Programs to position employees for growth opportunities and create an internal talent pool.
- **Office of Employee Services** supports operational needs, promotes employee engagement, and fosters an environment that contributes to the City's objectives. Responsibilities include: Onboarding, Employee Relations, Talent Retention, Employee Engagement, Leave Administration, Payroll, and Unemployment.

B28-1

HUMAN RESOURCES (28)

- **Office of Labor Relations** negotiates and administers 33 collective bargaining agreements and supplementals in accordance with the City Charter and state law, ensuring consistent and equitable contract terms and uniform application of those terms. This division is charged with preventing or lessening labor-management disputes. This includes developing and implementing labor policy, managing the grievance procedure to handle disputes with unionized employees, work rules and interpretation of the collective bargaining agreement. Staff are familiar with current trends, competitive benefits and work rules and have extensive knowledge of labor laws and approaches for resolution, and advocate for the City in umpire hearings, panel hearings, M.E.R.C. hearings, arbitration hearings, other administrative tribunals and special conferences.
- **Benefits Administration Office** administers medical, dental, optical, and life and supplemental insurance benefits for approximately 9,000 active employees. This office is also focused on wellness, prevention activities, employee communications, and health education.
- **Office of Policy, Planning and Operations** undertakes broad analytical studies of HR and related functional issues; initiates policy planning and formulation to fill gaps; and serves as an institutionalized "second opinion" on policy matters. This office supports the Civil Service Commission (CSC) and drafts revisions to the Civil Service Rules for CSC review.
- **Office of Talent Development and Performance Management** leads the digital transformation and traditional for the design, development and implementation of learning and development solutions and interventions to support and the strategic, operational and organizational goals and objectives for the city's 9000+ employees. This includes, employee training, organizational transformation initiatives, career readiness, custom learning initiatives, city-wide special projects, leadership development, organizational development interventions, certification programs, performance evaluation and performance management.
- **Classification and Compensation** provides classification and compensation services, which include job analysis, organizational design, compensation analysis, maintenance of the classification systems, salary equity reviews, and job specification system validation.

B28-2

Department Name: Human Resources Department
Department #: 28

Budget Summary:

	FY2021 Actual		FY2022 Adopted		FY2023 Mayor Recommend	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	947,851	947,851	1,185,512	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,209,223
Total Expenditures	11,773,660	11,773,660	13,360,299	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,777,376
Net Tax Cost	10,825,809	10,825,809	12,174,787	12,174,787	13,568,153	13,568,153

	FY2024 Forecast		FY2025 Forecast		FY2026 Forecast	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	1,233,408	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,258,075	1,283,236	1,283,236
Total Expenditures	14,866,054	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,163,902	15,354,706	15,354,706
Net Tax Cost	13,632,646	13,632,646	13,905,827	13,905,827	14,071,470	14,071,470

Positions (by FTE):	1/1/2022 Actual	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
General Fund	92	105	105	105	105	105
Non-General Fund	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total Positions	92	105	105	105	105	105

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
28 - Human Resources Department	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706
Salaries & Wages	7,241,565	8,763,454	8,938,723	9,117,498	9,208,673
Employee Benefits	2,730,682	2,839,748	2,676,977	2,718,041	2,751,101
Professional & Contractual Services	2,307,146	2,027,346	2,076,001	2,125,824	2,168,342
Operating Supplies	49,350	66,250	67,840	69,469	70,860
Operating Services	931,556	978,578	1,002,065	1,026,115	1,046,635
Other Expenses	100,000	102,000	104,448	106,955	109,095
Grand Total	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
28 - Human Resources Department	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
Sales & Charges for Services	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
Grand Total	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236

B28-5

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
28 - Human Resources Department	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706
1000 - General Fund	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706
Salaries & Wages	7,241,565	8,763,454	8,938,723	9,117,498	9,208,673
Employee Benefits	2,730,682	2,839,748	2,676,977	2,718,041	2,751,101
Professional & Contractual Services	2,307,146	2,027,346	2,076,001	2,125,824	2,168,342
Operating Supplies	49,350	66,250	67,840	69,469	70,860
Operating Services	931,556	978,578	1,002,065	1,026,115	1,046,635
Other Expenses	100,000	102,000	104,448	106,955	109,095
Grand Total	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
28 - Human Resources Department	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
1000 - General Fund	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
Sales & Charges for Services	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
Grand Total	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236

B28-7

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
28 - Human Resources Department	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706
1000 - General Fund	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706
29280 - Human Resources Department Administration	3,768,277	3,732,082	3,789,468	3,873,471	3,937,846
280008 - HRMS	639,105	708,355	708,535	721,911	729,505
280110 - Human Resources Administration	3,129,172	3,023,727	3,080,933	3,151,560	3,208,341
29281 - Workforce Management	9,592,022	11,045,294	11,076,586	11,290,431	11,416,860
280010 - Employee Services Administration	2,331,097	2,710,362	2,711,052	2,762,232	2,791,287
280154 - HR Risk Management Operations	519,208	627,974	628,584	640,550	647,476
280320 - Talent Development & Performance Management	1,992,364	2,123,313	2,136,134	2,179,174	2,207,238
280410 - Recruitment & Selection	1,384,869	1,983,811	1,992,897	2,031,017	2,052,146
280430 - Classification & Compensation	592,247	577,384	577,530	588,432	594,621
280520 - Benefits Administration	740,390	807,783	809,217	824,609	833,367
280530 - Labor Relations Administration	1,314,434	1,390,572	1,396,867	1,424,551	1,442,024
280540 - Policy, Planning, & Operations	717,413	824,095	824,305	839,866	848,701
Grand Total	13,360,299	14,777,376	14,866,054	15,163,902	15,354,706

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - REVENUES
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2022 Adopted	FY2023 Mayor Recommend	FY2024 Forecast	FY2025 Forecast	FY2026 Forecast
28 - Human Resources Department	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
1000 - General Fund	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
29281 - Workforce Management	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236
280010 - Employee Services Administration	573,529	585,000	596,700	608,634	620,807
280320 - Talent Development & Performance Management	85,000	86,700	88,434	90,203	92,007
280410 - Recruitment & Selection	407,389	415,537	423,848	432,324	440,970
280530 - Labor Relations Administration	119,594	121,986	124,426	126,914	129,452
Grand Total	1,185,512	1,209,223	1,233,408	1,258,075	1,283,236

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name		FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name		Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name			Recommend		
Job Code - Job Title					FY2026
					Forecast
28 - Human Resources Department		105	105	105	105
1000 - General Fund		105	105	105	105
29280 - Human Resources Department Administration		10	10	10	10
280008 - HRMS		6	6	6	6
13119951 - Human Resources Information Systems Administ		2	2	2	2
13119952 - Human Resources Information Systems Administ		2	2	2	2
13119962 - Human Resources Information Systems Manager		1	1	1	1
15114234 - Information Technology Special Systems Adminis		1	1	1	1
280110 - Human Resources Administration		4	4	4	4
013376 - Executive Administrative Assistant II		2	2	2	2
11312001 - Human Resources Director		1	1	1	1
11312004 - Chief Employee Services Officer		1	1	1	1
29281 - Workforce Management		95	95	95	95
280010 - Employee Services Administration		30	30	30	30
012002 - Record Systems Specialist II		1	0	0	0
041977 - Business Systems Support Specialist I - Human Resc		1	0	0	0
107101 - Human Resources Specialist I		0	1	1	1
119921 - Employee Services Manager I		3	4	4	4
13107103 - Human Resources Specialist III		1	2	2	2
13107113 - Human Resources Specialist III Employee Service		1	1	1	1
13119902 - Employee Services Consultant II		2	2	2	2
13119903 - Employee Services Consultant III		5	5	5	5
13119925 - Employee Services General Manager		1	1	1	1

B28-10

CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name		Recommend			
Job Code - Job Title					
303121 - Accounting Technician Manager I	0	1	1	1	1
43416102 - Human Resources Assistant II	1	1	1	1	1
43416103 - Human Resources Assistant III	9	8	8	8	8
43416104 - Human Resources Assistant IV	4	3	3	3	3
43601104 - Administrative Assistant IV	1	1	1	1	1
280154 - HR Risk Management Operations	7	7	7	7	7
042035 - Risk Manager	1	1	1	1	1
079037 - Safety Officer	1	0	0	0	0
079047 - Supervising Safety Officer	1	1	1	1	1
092033 - Worker's Compensation Specialist	3	3	3	3	3
13107103 - Human Resources Specialist III	1	1	1	1	1
43416104 - Human Resources Assistant IV	0	1	1	1	1
280320 - Talent Development & Performance Management	13	13	13	13	13
071050 - Talent Development and Performance Managemen	2	2	2	2	2
11313101 - Chief Learning Officer	1	1	1	1	1
13115002 - Talent Development And Performance Specialist	2	2	2	2	2
13115003 - Talent Development And Performance Specialist	4	4	4	4	4
13313122 - Talent Development And Performance Managerr	4	4	4	4	4
280410 - Recruitment & Selection	15	15	15	15	15
111003 - Project Manager & Analytics Specialist III	1	1	1	1	1
11312005 - Chief Recruitment Officer	1	1	1	1	1
13119932 - Recruiter II	3	3	3	3	3
13119933 - Recruiter III	4	4	4	4	4

B28-11

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Job Code - Job Title		Recommend			
13119936 - Recruitment Manager I	1	1	1	1	1
13119942 - Test Development And Scoring Specialist II	1	1	1	1	1
13119943 - Test Development And Scoring Specialist III	1	1	1	1	1
43416102 - Human Resources Assistant II	1	1	1	1	1
43416103 - Human Resources Assistant III	1	1	1	1	1
43416104 - Human Resources Assistant IV	1	1	1	1	1
280430 - Classification & Compensation	6	5	5	5	5
11311001 - Chief Classification Compensation Officer	1	1	1	1	1
13114002 - Classification Compensation Analyst II	2	1	1	1	1
13114003 - Classification Compensation Analyst III	1	1	1	1	1
13114004 - Classification Compensation Analyst IV	1	1	1	1	1
43416103 - Human Resources Assistant III	1	1	1	1	1
280520 - Benefits Administration	9	10	10	10	10
114142 - Benefits Supervisor II	1	1	1	1	1
114145 - Benefits Supervisor II - Deferred Compensation	1	1	1	1	1
13114152 - Benefits Manager II	1	1	1	1	1
43417104 - Benefits Clerk IV	6	6	6	6	6
929101 - Administrative Special Services Staff I	0	1	1	1	1
280530 - Labor Relations Administration	8	8	8	8	8
013376 - Executive Administrative Assistant II	1	1	1	1	1
11312002 - Labor Relations Director	1	1	1	1	1
11312003 - Deputy Labor Relations Director	1	1	1	1	1
13107504 - Administrator Of Labor Relations IV	4	4	4	4	4
43601104 - Administrative Assistant IV	1	1	1	1	1

B28-12

CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
DEPARTMENT 28 - HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name					
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name	FY2022	FY2023	FY2024	FY2025	FY2026
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	Adopted	Mayor	Forecast	Forecast	Forecast
Job Code - Job Title		Recommend			
280540 - Policy, Planning, & Operations	7	7	7	7	7
107104 - Human Resources Specialist IV	1	1	1	1	1
111003 - Project Manager & Analytics Specialist III	1	1	1	1	1
11312006 - Chief Policy Planning Officer	1	1	1	1	1
13107103 - Human Resources Specialist III	1	1	1	1	1
13111141 - Operations General Manager	1	1	1	1	1
43416103 - Human Resources Assistant III	2	2	2	2	2
Grand Total	105	105	105	105	105

B28-13