

David Whitaker, Esq.
Director
Irvin Corley, Jr.
Executive Policy Manager
Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Senior City Planner
Janese Chapman
Deputy Director

John Alexander
LaKisha Barelift, Esq.
M. Rory Bolger, Ph.D., FAICP
Elizabeth Cabot, Esq.
Tasha Cowan
Richard Drumb
George Etheridge
Deborah Goldstein

City of Detroit

CITY COUNCIL

LEGISLATIVE POLICY DIVISION

208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
Detroit, Michigan 48226

Phone: (313) 224-4946 Fax: (313) 224-4336

Christopher Gulock, AICP
Derrick Headd
Marcel Hurt, Esq.
Kimani Jeffrey
Anne Marie Langan
Jamie Murphy
Kim Newby
Analine Powers, Ph.D.
Jennifer Reinhardt
Rebecca Savage
Sabrina Shockley
Thomas Stephens, Esq.
David Teeter
Theresa Thomas
Kathryn L. Underwood, MUP
Ashley A. Wilson

TO: Keith Hutchings, Director
Municipal Parking Department

FROM: David Whitaker, Director 
Legislative Policy Division

DATE: March 17, 2020

RE: 2020-2021 Budget Analysis

Attached is our budget analysis regarding your department's budget for the upcoming 2020-2021 Fiscal Year.

As you know, your scheduled budget hearing on Monday, March 23, 2020 at 1:00 pm has been CANCELLED in order for City Council to reduce the number of budget hearings due to the coronavirus crisis. However, we would still appreciate a written response to the issues/questions raised in this budget analysis as soon as possible. Please forward a copy of your responses to the Councilmembers and the City Clerk's Office as well.

Please contact us if you have any questions regarding our budget analysis.

Thank you for your cooperation in this matter.

Attachments

cc: Councilmembers
Auditor General's Office
David Massaron, Chief Financial Officer
John Wallace, Agency CFO
Tanya Stoudemire, Budget Director
Stephanie Washington, Mayor's Office

Municipal Parking Department (34)

FY 2020-2021 Budget Analysis by the Legislative Policy Division

Issues and Questions

- 1) Please briefly explain the new expense initiatives the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2021. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives will affect in FY 2021.
- 2) Please briefly explain the new capital funding requests the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2021. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new requests will affect in FY 2021.
- 3) Please briefly explain the operational reform and savings proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2021. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new reforms/proposals will affect in FY 2021.
- 4) Please briefly explain the new revenue initiatives/proposals the Municipal Parking Department is planning to implement in FY 2021. Please provide which appropriation/cost center the new initiatives/proposals will affect in FY 2021.
- 5) According to the Office of the Chief Financial Officer (OCFO), the Municipal Parking Department had three vacancies through December 2019. As a result of the three vacancies, the actual number of positions is 92 as of January 1, 2020. Please explain why the proposed budgeted level of positions has dropped from 95 to 92 starting in FY 2021.
- 6) For FY 2021, expenditures for Appropriation 00102 – MPD Parking Violations Bureau has decreased by \$457,611 or 6.5%. Please explain the cause for the decrease. In particular, please explain why Parking Violation Bureau-Towing & Storage is decreasing by \$279,000 in FY 2021.
- 7) For FY 2021, expenditures for Appropriation 04108 – MPD Operations and Maintenance has decrease by \$1,120,643 or 19.7%. Please explain the cause for the decrease.
- 8) For FY 2021, expenditures for capital projects for the Municipal Parking Department were eliminated. Please explain the reason for eliminating these expenditures.
- 9) For FY 2021, revenues for Appropriation 00102 – MPD Parking Violations Bureau have decreased by \$655,000 or 5.2%. Please explain the cause for the decrease. Is the resident discount program a cause for the decrease?

10) For FY 2021, revenues for Appropriation 05976 – MPD Auto Parking Operations have increased by \$272,000 or 2.9%. Please explain the cause for the increase.

11) Has the parking discount program increased collections?

MUNICIPAL PARKING (34)

AGENCY PLAN: MISSION, GOALS AND ACTIVITY SUMMARY

MISSION:

The Municipal Parking Department (MPD) provides economical on and off-street public parking services; enforces the City's parking ordinance; and coordinates parking with economic development projects of the City of Detroit.

DESCRIPTION:

The MPD operates and maintains two divisions: the Automobile Parking System and the Parking Violations Bureau.

The Department's Automobile Parking System, pursuant to City ordinance, operates and maintains two garages with approximately 1,023 spaces and on-street parking comprised of three Tariff zones and 14 sub-zones. All revenue goes to the General Fund of the City of Detroit.

The Parking Violations Bureau, pursuant to City ordinance, manages the City's parking ticket processing and fine collection program and supervises the enforcement of parking regulations through its civilian ticket writing personnel (Parking Enforcement Officers).

AGENCY GOALS:

1. Enhance business strategy.
2. Improve organizational efficiencies.
3. Increase marketing and public relations efforts.
4. Maximize revenue sources.

Department Name: Municipal Parking Department
 Department #: 34

Budget Summary:

	FY2019 Actual		FY2020 Adopted		FY2021 Mayor Recommended	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	11,955,888	23,806,129	21,938,000	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000
Total Expenditures	5,842,519	13,906,864	12,711,682	17,768,182	11,133,398	11,133,398
Net Tax Cost	(6,113,369)	(9,899,265)	(9,226,318)	(4,169,818)	(10,421,602)	(10,421,602)

	FY2022 Forecast		FY2023 Forecast		FY2024 Forecast	
	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds	General Fund	All Funds
Total Revenues	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000
Total Expenditures	10,699,601	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,769,289	10,843,433	10,843,433
Net Tax Cost	(10,855,399)	(10,855,399)	(10,785,711)	(10,785,711)	(10,711,567)	(10,711,567)

Positions (by FTE):	1/1/2020 Actual	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor Recommended	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
	General Fund	92	95	92	92	92
Non-General Fund	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total Positions	92	95	92	92	92	92

MUNICIPAL PARKING (34)

ACTIVITY DESCRIPTION

AUTOMOBILE PARKING SYSTEM DIVISION

This division is responsible for planning, supervising, operating and maintaining the City of Detroit's Auto Parking and Garage System (General Fund). The Automotive Parking Fund is being re-classified to a General Fund business entity. This is due to significant changes to the asset mixture and operating components.

PARKING VIOLATIONS BUREAU

The Parking Violations Bureau is in charge of enforcing on-street and off-street ordinances within the city of Detroit, the processing of parking violation notices and the subsequent collection of the funds from these notices.

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	17,768,182	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433
Salaries & Wages	3,692,968	3,283,980	3,348,478	3,414,266	3,481,371
Employee Benefits	1,254,873	1,068,209	1,074,975	1,081,875	1,088,914
Professional & Contractual Services	5,679,323	5,633,734	5,128,673	5,128,673	5,128,673
Operating Supplies	191,043	104,753	104,753	104,753	104,753
Operating Services	6,861,286	1,015,533	1,015,533	1,015,533	1,015,533
Equipment Acquisition	56,500	-	-	-	-
Other Expenses	32,189	27,189	27,189	24,189	24,189
Grand Total	17,768,182	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433

CITY OF DETROIT
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
 REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - ALL FUNDS
 DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Summary Category	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000
Revenues from Use of Assets	9,238,000	9,510,000	9,510,000	9,510,000	9,510,000
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	12,700,000	12,045,000	12,045,000	12,045,000	12,045,000
Grand Total	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000

**CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
EXPENDITURES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT**

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	17,768,182	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433
1000 - General Fund	12,711,682	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433
Salaries & Wages	3,692,968	3,283,980	3,348,478	3,414,266	3,481,371
Employee Benefits	1,254,873	1,068,209	1,074,975	1,081,875	1,088,914
Professional & Contractual Services	5,679,323	5,633,734	5,128,673	5,128,673	5,128,673
Operating Supplies	191,043	104,753	104,753	104,753	104,753
Operating Services	1,861,286	1,015,533	1,015,533	1,015,533	1,015,533
Other Expenses	32,189	27,189	27,189	24,189	24,189
4533 - City of Detroit Capital Projects	5,056,500	-	-	-	-
Operating Services	5,000,000	-	-	-	-
Equipment Acquisition	56,500	-	-	-	-
Grand Total	17,768,182	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433

CITY OF DETROIT
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
 REVENUES BY SUMMARY CATEGORY - FUND DETAIL
 DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Summary Category	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000
1000 - General Fund	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000
Revenues from Use of Assets	9,238,000	9,510,000	9,510,000	9,510,000	9,510,000
Fines, Forfeits, & Penalties	12,700,000	12,045,000	12,045,000	12,045,000	12,045,000
Grand Total	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000

CITY OF DETROIT
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
 FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - EXPENDITURES
 DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
Fund # - Fund Name					
Appropriation # - Appropriation Name					
Cost Center # - Cost Center Name					
34 - Municipal Parking Department	17,768,182	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433
1000 - General Fund	12,711,682	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433
00102 - MPD Parking Violations Bureau	7,025,369	6,567,728	6,195,847	6,238,032	6,281,061
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	3,339,306	3,161,006	2,789,125	2,831,310	2,874,339
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	886,063	606,722	606,722	606,722	606,722
340085 - Parking Violation Bureau - Processing & Collection	2,800,000	2,800,000	2,800,000	2,800,000	2,800,000
04108 - MPD Operations & Maintenance	5,686,313	4,565,670	4,503,754	4,531,257	4,562,372
340010 - Parking Administration	1,090,192	967,798	979,441	988,317	1,000,430
340020 - Parking Maintenance	505,037	476,836	483,580	490,458	497,475
340030 - Parking Operations	2,664,010	1,184,700	1,093,718	1,094,574	1,095,448
340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance	992,478	1,516,761	1,521,559	1,526,453	1,531,445
340050 - Parking Meter Collection	434,596	419,575	425,456	431,455	437,574
4533 - City of Detroit Capital Projects	5,056,500	-	-	-	-
00102 - MPD Parking Violations Bureau	2,500	-	-	-	-
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	2,500	-	-	-	-
04108 - MPD Operations & Maintenance	5,054,000	-	-	-	-
340020 - Parking Maintenance	5,054,000	-	-	-	-
Grand Total	17,768,182	11,133,398	10,699,601	10,769,289	10,843,433

CITY OF DETROIT
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
 FINANCIAL DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER - REVENUES
 DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name Fund # - Fund Name Appropriation # - Appropriation Name Cost Center # - Cost Center Name	FY2020 Adopted	FY2021 Mayor	FY2022 Forecast	FY2023 Forecast	FY2024 Forecast
34 - Municipal Parking Department	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000
1000 - General Fund	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000
00102 - MPD Parking Violations Bureau	12,700,000	12,045,000	12,045,000	12,045,000	12,045,000
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	10,675,000	10,600,000	10,600,000	10,600,000	10,600,000
340083 - Parking Violation Bureau - Towing & Storage	2,025,000	1,445,000	1,445,000	1,445,000	1,445,000
05976 - MPD Auto Parking Operations	9,238,000	9,510,000	9,510,000	9,510,000	9,510,000
340330 - Revenue Fund Trustee	3,038,000	2,810,000	2,810,000	2,810,000	2,810,000
340331 - On Street Meter Collections	6,200,000	6,700,000	6,700,000	6,700,000	6,700,000
Grand Total	21,938,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000	21,555,000

CITY OF DETROIT
BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name	FY2020 Adopted by FTE	FY2021 Mayor by FTE	FY2022 Forecast by FTE	FY2023 Forecast by FTE	FY2024 Forecast by FTE
34 - Municipal Parking Department	95	92	92	92	92
1000 - General Fund	95	92	92	92	92
00102 - MPD Parking Violations Bureau	59	59	59	59	59
340080 - Parking Violation Bureau - Administration	59	59	59	59	59
010838 - Manager II - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
012017 - Principal Clerk - Parking Violations	1	1	1	1	1
012089 - Assistant Administrative Supervisor - Parking Viola	1	1	1	1	1
013131 - Office Assistant III	1	1	1	1	1
041543 - Principal Governmental Analyst - Municipal Parkin	1	1	1	1	1
099168 - Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
099170 - Supervising Parking Enforcement Investigator	1	1	1	1	1
339210 - Parking Enforcement Control Specialist	5	4	4	4	4
339220 - Parking Enforcement Officer	41	42	42	42	42
339230 - Senior Parking Enforcement Officer	5	5	5	5	5
339245 - Head Parking Enforcement Officer	1	1	1	1	1
04108 - MPD Operations & Maintenance	36	33	33	33	33
340010 - Parking Administration	9	7	7	7	7
010152 - Director - Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010153 - Deputy Director - Municipal Parking Department	1	1	1	1	1
010729 - General Manager - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
010944 - Manager I - Municipal Parking	2	1	1	1	1
012261 - Administrative Assistant - Grade II - Municipal Park	1	1	1	1	1
013131 - Office Assistant III	1	1	1	1	1

CITY OF DETROIT
 BUDGET DEVELOPMENT
 POSITION DETAIL BY DEPARTMENT, FUND, APPROPRIATION, & COST CENTER
 DEPARTMENT 34 - MUNICIPAL PARKING DEPARTMENT

Department # - Department Name	FY2020 Adopted by FTE	FY2021 Mayor by FTE	FY2022 Forecast by FTE	FY2023 Forecast by FTE	FY2024 Forecast by FTE
013327 - Executive Legal Secretary	1	0	0	0	0
013373 - Executive Administrative Assistant I	0	1	1	1	1
041543 - Principal Governmental Analyst - Municipal Parkin	1	0	0	0	0
340020 - Parking Maintenance	10	10	10	10	10
619107 - Laborer A	2	2	2	2	2
621031 - Building Trades Worker - General	1	1	1	1	1
622031 - Building Operator I	1	1	1	1	1
641045 - Building Maintenance Operations Supervisor	1	1	1	1	1
712011 - Mechanical Helper	2	2	2	2	2
721523 - Vehicle Operator I	3	3	3	3	3
340030 - Parking Operations	1	1	1	1	1
081007 - Customer Service Supervisor - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
340040 - Parking Meter Maintenance	8	7	7	7	7
712331 - Parking Meter Repair Worker	7	6	6	6	6
712341 - Parking Meter Service Foreman	1	1	1	1	1
340050 - Parking Meter Collection	8	8	8	8	8
012017 - Principal Clerk - Parking Violations	1	1	1	1	1
012078 - Head Clerk - Municipal Parking	1	1	1	1	1
047342 - Parking Meter Revenue Collector	6	6	6	6	6
Grand Total	95	92	92	92	92