

**Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners**  
**Date of Meeting: Thursday, December 12, 2019 – 6:30 PM**  
**Location: Historic Little Rock Baptist Church, 9000 Woodward, Detroit, MI 48202**

**BOPC Chairperson Lisa Carter called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 6:30 PM (December 12, 2019)**

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Lisa Carter, Chairperson	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Willie E. Bell	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Excused	
Willie E. Burton (6:45 p.m.)	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for Thursday, December 12, 2019.**

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes: Thursday, December 5, 2019**

**BOPC Chairperson Lisa R. Carter:** (Chairperson Carter said): “Good evening! I am Police Commissioner Lisa Carter, I represent District #6. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting today. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Commissioner Shirley Burch has asked to be excused from tonight’s meeting. Tonight, we have invited Chaplain Ron Chapman to provide the invocation. Chairperson Carter requested introductions of individual Commissioners, BOPC Staff Members, DPD Members, Elected Officials, VIPs, Civic Leaders, or their representatives.

Additionally, Chairperson Carter noted a few business items for consideration:

- Business Item: (1) Approval of the Agenda – (Approval vote required); (2) Minutes for December 5, 2019
- Introduction of BOPC Staff and DPD Staff
- Introduction of Elected Officials, VIPs, civic leaders or their representatives.

Chairperson Carter stated, “Tonight, we are meeting in the 3rd Precinct. Both Commissioner Burton and I represent this precinct. Commissioner Burton is not here at this time to provide a welcome to the residents of the Third Precinct, but I extend my warmest welcome to you all and thank you for attending this evening’s meeting. We are delighted to meet at the Historic Little Rock Baptist Church, where our very own Commissioner Rev. Dr. Jim Holley is the Senior Pastor. We thank Commissioner Holley for hosting this last Board meeting of the year, and we invite him to welcome us to his church and share some history about the church. In any community effort there are various partnerships. In policing, the work of the Police-Community Relations’ teams is critically important. I want to acknowledge Mr. Ernest Little, Community Relations President of the 3rd Precinct Police Community Relations Organization.”

**Chairperson's Report: Chairperson Lisa Carter:** On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers and their families. Again, we’re reminded by the recent deaths of Corporal Bryant Lavant and Officer Rasheen McClain. We are truly thankful for their service. Our concerns for officers’ safety and citizens’ protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask the Chief of Police during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers.

I want to again express the Board’s deepest condolences to the Department and the family of Officer Rasheen McClain, Badge 3520. We attended a beautiful Homegoing service for Officer McClain, and we thank him for his selfless service and heroism. He is an American Hero. I want to also wish Officer Phillippe Batoum-Bisse, Badge 118, a speedy recovery from his gunshot wounds.

Our prayers and thoughts continue to be with both families and the Department's rank and file as we collectively work through this difficult time.

The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters (3) weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 p.m. We also meet in the community every 2nd Thursday of the month at 6:30 p.m.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our Board investigates non-criminal citizens' complaints, monitor Department operations and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to establish police policies, rules, and regulations. As an oversight agency, the Board has the broad responsibility to protect the citizens, protect the city of Detroit from frivolous lawsuits, and create policies to enforce strict adherence to Department policies. Additionally, the Board works to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices, and unnecessary use of force by police. The Board also believes in transparency, community input, and accountability. As a civilian oversight agency, we protect the rights of citizens. Our objective is to increase the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. December 12, 2019, is the last date scheduled for the Board to meet this calendar year. We are scheduled to return to our normal business on Thursday, January 9, 2020. The Board of Police Commissioners will not meet on December 19th, December 26th, nor January 2, 2020, because of our observance of the Christmas and New Year's holidays.

On this past Monday, December 9, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. – 9:00 p.m., the Board received extensive training on the Open Meetings Act and Parliamentary Procedures from the Michigan Municipal League. The presenters were Mr. William Mathewson, Municipal Consultant, and Ms. Eleanor "Coco" Siewart, Professional Registered Parliamentarian. This training focused on basic parliamentary information and procedures for effective meetings utilizing correct parliamentary procedures and Open Meetings Act requirements. This was a very important and informative training that confirmed many of our current practices are within the meaning and the spirit of the Open Meetings Act. Every public servant should be familiarized with the Open Meetings Act and Parliamentary Procedures. If you were unable to attend, copies of the material are included in your Weekly packet. Please review all materials to stay informed.

Tonight, we have one resolution to honor the contributions of Mr. Daniel Washington, a strong community advocate. At the appropriate time, I will ask Mr. Washington to come forward and receive his resolution.

Also, tonight's agenda has two formal presentations to the Board – the first is our Monthly Personnel Report from Dr. Marcella Anderson, Director of Police Personnel. The report will cover the recruitment, processing, and hiring procedures for both sworn and civilian employees of the Police Department. You have a copy of the Human Resources report in your packet. The second presentation is from Commander Franklin Hayes and Captain Rodney Cox, who will discuss crime-fighting strategies in the precinct as well as partnerships that they use to deliver services within the precinct.

Under the Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on our city-wide crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department. Also, I am requesting an update on the Department's investigation and probe into its Narcotics Unit and measures the Department has taken to eliminate police criminal misconduct. Lastly, I am requesting an update on the investigation involving a white officer who allegedly used an inappropriate and derogatory racial slur repeatedly while speaking with a black officer.

Under Unfinished Business, we have several items that require a vote. First, the Chief's Promotional Request for 4 Lieutenants/16 Sergeants stemming from DPOA Grievance #19-044 and 19-064. The Board has previously received several communications on this item. Please see the list of items included in your package, entitled "Informational Reports" that includes support material on this item, including but not limited to the recent Arbitration Award associated with the DPOA Grievance 19-044 and Grievance 19-064. The Arbitration awarded promotions of (15) DPOA members to the rank of Sergeant under the order of Arbitrator George Roumell. I will ask for a vote on each promotional request.

Lastly, under Unfinished Business, the Board received a proposed amendment to the Bylaws over 30 days ago. Today, I will request a vote on the Bylaws Amendment. Attorney Jermaine Wyrick, Attorney to the Board, will provide the Board with a presentation on the proposed amendments.

Under New Business, we must vote on the Board's Proposed 2020 Calendar. I will ask for a vote on this item.

Also, in your Board Package are copies of (4) Manual Directives transmitted from the Detroit Police Department. They include the following:

1. Manual Directive 101.6 Human Resources
2. Manual Directive 102.10 Brady/Giglio Disclosure Requirements
3. Manual Directive 203.12 Polygraph Examinations
4. Manual Directive 307.4 Criminal Justice Information Systems (CJIS)

Also, in the package is the Department's Facial Recognition Report, Report No. 6, dated December 10, 2019. There is also a Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) Request from the ACLU seeking Facial Recognition Technology information.

In your packet today, there is a copy of the agenda, minutes from the last meeting, and various reports. At the end of the meeting, we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back table or can be obtained by seeing Ms. Teresa Blossom. She will need your card before the end of the Chief of Police's Report. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. I ask that everyone place your cell phones and other electronic devices on vibrate to make sure that they are not interrupting the meeting.

As a final matter, I would like to encourage cooperation and order at our meetings. We have discussed this in the past. Please treat each other with respect and control our behavior within the limits of professionalism. Commissioners do not have the floor and should not speak until they are recognized by the Chair. I'm asking Commissioners to address their comments to issues that are relevant to the agenda and to be brief so that we have ample time for public comments. For the attending audience, please note there is a time on the agenda for citizen input and feedback. My objective this evening is to run an orderly meeting, including public comments, and have us out within a reasonable time. Thank you for your attention and cooperation."

**Resolution:** Commissioner Elizabeth Brooks presented the following resolution to Mr. Daniel Washington:

Chairperson Lisa Carter and Commissioner Willie Burton discussed the procedures for presenting resolutions and certificates of recognition to members of the community.

#### RESOLUTION HONORING

#### DANIEL A. WASHINGTON

**WHEREAS,** Daniel A. Washington grew up in Northwest Goldberg, where he purchased his own home at the age of 18. He attended Wayne State University earning an Bachelor of Arts in Broadcast Journalism; and

**WHEREAS,** Neighborhood revitalization has always been on Mr. Washington's heart and mind. In an effort to make a difference, he founded NW Goldberg Cares as a way to formalize the work he had been doing as a child to revitalize Detroit's NW Goldberg neighborhood. He has worked tirelessly to remove blight and stabilize the neighborhood in creative and intentional ways. As president and founder, he has worked on three main projects: creating a neighborhood garden, building the Holland Maze in conjunction with Detroit Future City's Working with Lots program, and building an art park; and

**WHEREAS,** He has worked with residents and outside volunteers alike to build a neighborhood garden that provides free, fresh produce to NW Goldberg families. In the summer of 2018, the first year of the garden, over 20 households received free produce. In 2019, the households participating has increased; and

**WHEREAS,** Mr. Washington has also led the charge to bring the first Holland Maze lot design to the city of Detroit and operate it as a literacy park for Detroit students in grades K-5. He helped secure over \$13,000 to bring this design to life. He also helped develop and implement the Reading in the Holland Maze Program, which will help activate the lot for neighborhood kids to have a safe space to read and play; and

**WHEREAS,** The third project, and one closest to his heart, is the 6102. ART PARK. It includes a pathway, a sculpture created by a neighborhood artist, and greenery. It will be a safe space where residents can gather, kids can play, and neighbors can meet neighbors. Mr. Washington spent more than 100 hours of physical labor to make the park a reality at the corner of 16<sup>th</sup> and Marquette Streets; and

**WHEREAS,** In all of these projects, he has not just focused individually on these lots, but has ensured that when volunteers are available, that brush and blight are removed from surrounding areas to help create a safer and more walkable neighborhood. He has built a partnership with the Detroit Police Academy, located right across the street from the Neighborhood Garden, to ensure that cadets are present at all volunteer clean-up days; and

**WHEREAS,** Mr. Washington has made his intentions to helping revitalize the neighborhood by creating the Dough That Makes A Difference Fund in partnership with the company he co-founded, Detroit Dough. Through the fund, Detroit Dough

pledges 5% of all sales to go directly back to NW Goldberg, the neighborhood the company is founded in. He is working diligently to create jobs in the neighborhood through Detroit Dough as well.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT**

**RESOLVED** That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of the City of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, acknowledge the loyal support of Mr. Daniel Washington. His commitment and years of dedication to supporting the community of the Third Precinct and the citizens throughout the city of Detroit merit our highest regards.

**Chief of Police Report: Deputy Chief Todd Bettison:**

**Deputy Chief Bettison** thanked the Honorable Board of Police Commissioners for their support last week for Corporal Bryant Lavant and Officer Rasheen McClain. Deputy Chief Bettison provided an update on injured officers including Officer Philippe Batoum Bisse who is at home recuperating. Deputy Chief Bettison also reported crime and statistical data utilizing DPD Department report dated **December 2, 2019**. Deputy Chief Bettison reported year-to date data by category including the following:

**Part I Crimes:** 7.0% increase in Criminal Homicides, Sexual Assaults 1% decrease, Aggravated Assaults 5% decrease, Non-Fatal Shootings 4% increase, Robbery 1% increase, Carjacking 22% decrease, **Overall Part I Crimes:** 4% decrease

**Property Crimes:** Burglary 9% decrease, Larceny 9% decrease, Auto thefts 5% increase and **Property Crimes Overall Reduction:** 2% decrease.

The Honorable Board and the Department held an extensive discussion on the Department's recently initiated Department led internal investigation into the alleged corruption in the Major Violators' Unit (also known as the Narcotics' Unit). Deputy Chief Bettison reported an update on the Department's internal investigation based on Chief of Police James E. Craig's recent press conference. Based on Chief Craig's press conference, the initial investigation has expanded into a larger team of investigators (17) and more investigators will be required. The following updates were provided: DPD seized 50 computers, files date back 10 years, analyzed about a year and a half of files, alleged corruption such as narcotic officers planting evidence, embezzling funds using the voucher system, falsifying information to prosecutors to secure warrants, and stealing money and other property from drug traffickers. Chief of Police Craig stated the Department will remain transparent, will be led by Retired U.S. Prosecutor Chris Graveline, Director of Professional Standards and Constitutional Policing, and the hotline number to report additional information is (313) 596-3190. Deputy Chief Bettison noted additional preventative measures regarding transferring all narcotics members with over 5 years to other units. Additionally, during the press conference, Chief Craig pledged to keep the Board and the community informed on all updates relating to the corruption investigation.

**Commissioner Davis** inquired about outside agencies assisting with the investigation. **Director Chris Graveline**, Director of Professional Standards and Constitutional Policing, Detroit Police Department, noted the Department is coordinating with the Federal Bureau of Investigations and the Michigan State Police (assigning agents, analysts, and task force officers). **Commissioner Davis** inquired about whether there are any persons in jail as a result of false information of the alleged corruption. **Director Graveline** indicated that the Department has noticed one of the patterns where the Narcotics Bureau has seized drugs and firearms, conducted raids, but has failed to make any arrests. The Department is looking to ensure that no one is incarcerated as a result of a false affidavit.

**Commissioner Bell** stated the corruption investigation should not be led by the Department, and the investigation should be turned over to the FBI for an impartial and objective investigation. He urged the Board to weigh in on the matter and make the request for the FBI to fully conduct this corruption investigation. **Director Graveline** noted that the Department is in contact with the FBI Public Corruption Unit on a daily basis, they have an active role in the investigation, have developed (5) investigation teams, which includes the following personnel: 1 DPD Officer, 1 FBI Task Force Officer/FBI Agent. **Deputy Chief Bettison** noted the Chief of Police initiated the investigation into a pattern and practice of corruption based on former officer Michael Mosley's actions.

**Commissioner Brown** asked how long ago the corruption files date back. **Deputy Chief Bettison** noted that the issue had been ongoing since the 1970s based on an article written by George Hunter and urged attendees to watch the Press Conference.

**Commissioner Griffie** asked what kind of random monitoring and processes takes place regarding emails, files, and processes for proactive measures. **Director Graveline** stated random monitoring is a recent development based on the transfer from hard copies to electronic formats. More monitoring is occurring regarding supervisory actions. Deputy Chief Marlon Wilson, Organized

Crime, is in the process of developing a new Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) Handbook for the Organized Crime Unit to identify and address the systematic failures and deficiencies.

**Commissioner Burton** requested that the Department submit an environmental report to the Honorable Board of Police Commissioners after the completion of the investigation. **Deputy Chief Bettison** cited several DPD audits and noted the Department will continue the audit of the Major Crimes Unit and provide the report to the Board accordingly. **Director Graveline** noted the Department will conduct real structural change and expressed that at the end of the investigation/audit, a report will be completed based on the findings, the new procedures, and other pertinent information relating to the Major Violator's Unit.

**Director Graveline** also provided updates based on the Internal Affairs' racial incident complaint lodged by an African American officer against a Caucasian officer who used a racial epithet several times during a facetime phone call. The Department has interviewed all parties, reviewed the social media sites of the focus officer assigned to the Ninth Precinct, conducted additional interviews, and is currently searching for body-worn camera footage of the incident. The Department anticipates completion of the investigation within the next week.

**PRESENTATIONS TO THE BOARD: (A) Monthly Report Human Resources: Dr. Marcella Anderson, DPD Personnel Director  
(B) 3<sup>rd</sup> Police Precinct: Captain Rodney Cox and Commander Franklin Hayes**

- (A) Monthly Human Resources Report, Dr. Marcella Anderson, DPD Personnel Director provided a summary of activities and statistical data during the month of November 2019. For employment with the DPD, interested persons may visit [www.detroitmi.gov](http://www.detroitmi.gov). Dr. Anderson indicated that of the total 2671 Sworn Positions in the Department, DPD 169 Vacant Police Officer positions, and 2502 filled positions. Of the 667 Civilian budgeted positions in the Department, 48 are vacant, and 619 positions are filled. Dr. Anderson discussed recruitment and MCOLES processing indicating the Department has 2247 applicants from July 1<sup>st</sup> to Nov. 30<sup>th</sup> and the Department has hired 73 individuals. Dr. Anderson reported that 573 are awaiting MCOLES certification, 42 are in the process, 146 consist of lack of interest, 1125 temporarily disqualified, and 290 are permanently disqualified. Dr. Anderson provided statistical data on the MCOLES testing. Additionally, regarding agility, 203 were scheduled, 114 appeared, 55 passed, and 59 failed. The Mayor and the Chief of Police have agreed to a cadet program to mentor and prepare applicants, which will start in January 2020, due to 70% loss in numbers for failure to pass the agility test. There were no hires during the month of November, 19 cadets graduated from the police academy, there are 40 civilians, and 2 police assistants. Dr. Anderson also indicated that our residency data as of November 2019 reflects Detroit residents at 563 Sworn, 345 Civilian, and 31 Police Assistants, totaling 939 employees. Dr. Anderson also provided attrition data, leaves of absence, and restricted duty data. Dr. Anderson indicated that her report covered officers suspended and not working. Dr. Anderson also provided numbers on populations and staffing based on a request from the Board last month. Additionally, the job descriptions were provided for the Honorable Board's Staff for the Board's review. Regarding the promotional exam, the new list was distributed on Monday, December 9, 2019. The discrepancy remains regarding whether the Board has the right to vote on Department promotions. According to Dr. Anderson, Deputy Chief Grant Ha has a differing interpretation of Section 7-814. However, Attorney Laketa Crespo, City Law Department, states the City Charter prevails based on the collective bargaining agreement failing to discuss promotions. Dr. Anderson recommended a meeting between the Board, the Law Department, and Deputy Chief Grant Ha.

**Commissioner Holt** asked whether the applicant number of 2247 was impacted by the aggressive hiring that took place in connection with Fiat. **Commissioner Bell** reemphasized the necessity to concentrate manpower on providing service and responding to police runs, which are primarily functions of police officer responsibilities. **Commissioner Griffie** requested an adjustment to the first page of the data report provided, based on the comparisons of the police department recruitment data with other jurisdiction's recruitment data. Commissioner Griffie requested an accurate comparison with other cities to ensure an appropriate assessment is made about the Department. **Commissioner Brooks** requested information on the status of police recruiting at the meeting.

- (B) **3<sup>rd</sup> Police Precinct Report**, Captain Rodney Cox and Commander Franklin Hayes discussed with the Board precinct level statistical data of crimes that took place in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Police Precinct and outlined several of the crime-fighting measures conducted by the precinct. Also discussed were some of the outreach and partnerships underway in the precinct along with grant programs and deployments supported by the grant programs.

**Report from Interim Board Secretary/Communications (Submitted to BOPC as incoming information):** Ms. White reported the following:

1. Communication from Planning, Research & Deployment Transmittal of Written Directive 101.6 Human Resources

2. Communication from Planning, Research & Deployment Transmittal of Written Directive 102.10 Brady/Giglio Disclosure Requirements
3. Communication from Planning, Research & Deployment Transmittal of Written Directive 203.12 Polygraph Examinations
4. Communication from Planning, Research & Deployment Transmittal of Written Directive 307.4 Criminal Justice Information Systems (CJIS)
5. Human Resources Report (12-10-2019)
6. DPD Facial Recognition Report #6 (12-10-2019)
7. **Media FOIA Request A19-07986--ACLU--Facial Recognition, Dated December 4, 2019.**

**Unfinished Business:**

**Chief's Promotional Request of (4) Lieutenants:** Commissioner Dewaelsche moved that the Board of Police Commissioners approve Chief of Police James E. Craig's Promotion Request for (4) Sergeant. Commissioner Darryl Brown seconded the motion. Discussion.

1. Sergeant Tyrine Wheatley
2. Sergeant Derrick D. Griffen
3. Sergeant Charles L. Gregory
4. Sergeant Gregory A. Tomassini

Motion: Commissioner Dewaelsche      Second: Commissioner Brown      Results: Motion Approved

**Chief's Promotional Request of (15) Sergeants:** Commissioner Dewaelsche moved that the Board of Police Commissioners approve Chief of Police James E. Craig's Promotional Request for (15) Police Officers (reference names below) to the rank of Sergeant as per the Umpire's Arbitration Opinion and Award on DPOA Grievance 19-064. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. Discussion.

1. Detective Shameka M. Page
2. Investigator Terrence M. Washington
3. Corporal Tony W. Goins
4. Police Officer Javaris A. Reed
5. Police Officer Chad D. Smith
6. Police Officer Norman J. Miskelley
7. Police Officer Sara K. Johnson
8. Police Officer Adeela A. Green
9. Police Officer Louis G. Mueller
10. Police Officer Tamar J. Banks
11. Police Officer Delvecchio L. Thompson
12. Police Officer Deitrich M. Spidell
13. Police Officer Kenneth L. Dale
14. Police Officer Charles R. Barnes
15. Police Officer Brandon L. Pierce

Motion: Commissioner Dewaelsche      Second: Commissioner Brown      Results: Motion Approved

**Chief's Promotional Request of Officer Ronaldo Turner to the rank of Sergeant:** Commissioner Dewaelsche moved that the Board of Police Commissioners approve Chief of Police James E. Craig's Promotional Request for Police Officer Ronaldo Turner to the rank of Sergeant. Commissioner Brown seconded the motion. Discussion.

Motion: Commissioner Dewaelsche      Second: Commissioner Brown      Results: Motion Approved

**Amendments to the BOPC Bylaws: Attorney Wyrick presented on the proposed amendments to the BOPC Bylaws.**

Motion: Commissioner Griffiee moved that the Honorable Board amend Bylaws as presented. Commissioner Dewalesche seconded the motion. Discussion.



**Chairperson Carter adjourned the meeting at 8:51 PM.**