

Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners

Date of Meeting: September 12, 2019 – 6:30 PM

Location: Kemeny Recreation Center, 2260 South Fort Street, Detroit, MI 48217

BOPC Chairperson Lisa Carter called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 6:30 PM (September 12, 2019)

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance		
	Attend	Not-Attend
Lisa Carter, Chairperson	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Willie E. Bell	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton (7:08 PM)	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	11	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for September 12, 2019.

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes: Thursday, September 5, 2019

BOPC Chairperson Lisa R. Carter said "Good Evening! I am Police Commissioner Lisa Carter, I represent District #6. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting tonight. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Tonight, we have invited Chaplain Samuel Wilson to provide the invocation." Chaplain Wilson provided the invocation for the meeting. Chairperson Carter requested each Commissioner to introduce themselves. Chairperson Carter invited Mr. Andrew Bryant, Assistant Recreational leader here a Kemeny Recreation Center AND Ms. Erminia Ramirez, President, 4th Precinct Community Relations Council to welcome us to their facility. Ms Ramirez and Bryant welcome the audience and Board to the District and Precinct. Chairperson Carter requested additional introductions of BOPC staff, Deputy Chief Todd Bettison (representing Chief of Police James Craig), and DPD staff and other civic leaders and representatives.

Chairperson's Report – Lisa R. Carter said "On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask the Chief of Police during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers. The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2nd Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our Board investigates non-criminal citizen complaints, monitors the Department for compliance with all laws, and reviews and modify police policy to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. As a civilian oversight agency, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Our objective is to increase the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. The NACOLE conference is fast approaching. I remind the Board, we are continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the same time, Detroit will be celebrating our 45th year as a civilian oversight organization. The BOPC has secured an exciting keynote speaker for our 45th Anniversary Dinner, Christy E. Lopez. The 45th Anniversary dinner is Tuesday, September 24, 2019 at 5:00 PM to 7:00 PM at the Renaissance Marriot Hotel. Christy E. Lopez is a former member of the U. S. Department of Justice in the Special Litigation Section as well as a visiting Professor at Georgetown Law School. Professor Lopez's work has centered on criminal justice reform and constitutional policing. Professor Lopez led the DOJ in conducting pattern-or-practice investigations of local police departments and negotiated settlement agreements in Ferguson, Chicago, New Orleans, Los Angeles Sheriff's Department, Newark, New Jersey and several

other important oversight initiatives across the country. Again, the planning process is well underway, and we invite your participation. Yesterday, our staff e-mailed a memorandum to the Board outlining key responsibilities, dates and locations for Board participation. A copy of this same document is included in your Board package. I want to thank Board member Elizabeth Brooks for leading an effort to secure sponsorships for the dinner. The BOPC met its fund raising goal to secure sponsors for the 45th Anniversary Dinner. Because of this effort, all current and past Commissioners and their guest will be allowed to attend the dinner at no costs. We are actively attempting to notify Commissioners of this opportunity. I ask that each current Commissioner reach out to former Commissioners and help express our gratitude for their work as public servants and extend our offer to join us at the dinner.”

Chairperson Carter continued, “I also want to thank Commissioners Bell, Dewaelsche and Brooks for attending the 18th annual recognition ceremony of the 911 attack on our nation. I understand the ceremony was well organized and well attended. Our prayers and our thoughts continue to be with the victims of 911 and the thousands of first responders who came to their aid. I understand that Commissioner Bell gave an impressive tribute to the efforts behind the victim’s compensation fund passed by congress.

Tonight, we have one resolution to honor the contributions of Ms Marie Overall a strong community voice. At the appropriate time I will ask Ms. Overall to come forward and receive her resolution. Also, tonight, we have two presentations scheduled. The first presentation is our Monthly Personnel Report from Dr. Marcella Anderson, Director of Police Personnel. The report will cover the recruitment, processing and hiring procedures for both sworn and civilian employees of the Police Department. The second Presentation is from Commander Kari Sloan and Captain Russell Solano who will discuss crime fighting strategies in the precinct as well as partnerships that they use to deliver services within the precinct.

Under the Chief’s Report, I am requesting an update on our crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department.

Again, at the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker’s card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the end of the Chief of Police Report. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. I ask that everyone place your cell phones and other electronic devices on vibrate to make sure that they are not interrupting the meeting.”

At the conclusion of Chairperson Carter’s remarks, Carter announced the Board of Police Commissioners will be voting on the facial recognition revised directive submitted by the Department, September 12, 2019, at the BOPC next Board meeting, dated September 19, 2019 at 3:00 PM at the Detroit Public Safety Headquarters Building.

Resolutions:

Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche read into the record the following resolution acknowledging the contributions to Marie Overall for her contributions to law enforcement.

RESOLUTION HONORING MS. MARIE OVERALL

WHEREAS Ms. Marie Overall has been an active volunteer within the boundaries of the Fourth Precinct. Retired from her field, her career spans over 40 years of nursing experience. She is currently an Administrative Assistant to the Michigan State Representative for the Sixth District Tyrone Carter; and

WHEREAS Ms. Overall is a board member of the Congress of Communities, a Precinct Delegate since 2018, a member in the Original United Citizens of Southwest Detroit, and a Big Sister in Sister/Friends Detroit through the City of Detroit Health Department. Her efforts have always been involved in community relations and focus on the quality of life for the community; and

WHEREAS Ms. Overall is the Vice-President of the Fourth Precinct Community Relations Council and is now in her second term. She has tutored students at Mt. Zion Missionary Baptist Church and served as a mentor in VIP prevention program. She attends numerous meetings throughout Detroit, providing transportation and assistance to those in need by connecting them to community resources; and

WHEREAS Ms. Overall is a caring individual and believes in Detroit and her community. When you tell her, it can’t be done--she will search out and find the solution.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of the City of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, acknowledges the loyal support of Ms. Marie Overall. Her service and dedication to the community of the Fourth Precinct and the citizens throughout the city of Detroit merit our highest regards. We thank and congratulate you, Ms. Marie Overall.
DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Annie Holt moved the approval of the resolution acknowledging Marie Overall for her support to law enforcement.

Motion by: Holt Second by: Davis Vote: Yes=10, No=0 Results: Motion Approved.

COP Police Report: Deputy Police Chief Todd Bettison representing Chief of Police James Craig reported crime and statistical data utilizing DPD Department report dated September 12, 2019. DC Bettison reported year-to date data by category including, 1% increase in Criminal Homicides, Sexual Assaults 1% increase, Aggravated Assaults -3% decrease, non-fatal shootings 2% increase, Robbery -3% decrease, Carjacking -26% decrease, Burglary -7% decrease, Larceny -4% decrease, Stolen Vehicle 1% increase and Part 1 offenses -3% decrease. DC Bettison also comment on a recent Detroit News article by George Hunter suggesting the widespread crime up and alone the Gratiot business corridor on Detroit eastside.

Presentation to the Board: (A) Monthly Human Resources Report, Dr. Marcella Anderson, DPD Personnel Director
(B) 4th Precinct Report, Commander Karl Sloan and Captain Russell Solano

(A) Monthly Human Resources Report, Dr. Marcella Anderson, DPD Personnel Director, provided statistical data for August 2019 (September 12, 2019 Report). Dr. Anderson indicated that of the total positions (2,671 Sworn) in the Department, DPD has 177 vacant Police officers. Of the 667 (Civilian) positions in the Department, 63 are vacant. Dr. Anderson discussed recruitment and MCOLES processing indicating the Department has 1294 applications from 7/1/2019 to 8/31/2019 the Department hired 9 individuals. Anderson reported 569 are awaiting MCOLES certification, 23 are in process. Anderson also indicated that our residency data as of 8/31/2019 reflect Detroit residents at 573 Sworn, 332 Civilian and 30 Police Assistants. For non-Detroit residents for the same period, 1861 Sworn, 272 civilians and 30 Police Assistants. Anderson also provide attrition data and leaves of absence and restricted duty data. Dr. Anderson indicated that her report covered officers suspended and not at work (9 Police Officers suspended, 1 Detective, 2 Sergeant, 1 Command Officer for a total of 13 individuals).

(B) 5th Police Precinct Report, Commander Karl Sloan and Captain Russell Solano discussed with the Board precinct level statistical data of crimes that took place in the 4th Police Precinct and outlined the several of the crime fighting measures conducted by the precinct. Also discussed were some of the outreach and partnerships underway in the precinct along with grant programs and deployments supported by the grant programs..

BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.

Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks indicated that on the agenda ten items have come into the Board (see list below). Hicks summarized several of the items for the Board's attention.

1. Request from Chief of Police to appointment/promotion for Commander and Captain
2. COMPSTAT Map 4th Precinct
3. Request from Chief of Police promotion of (4) Lieutenants, (15) Sergeants Re: Grievance#19-044
4. 911 Flyer (Memorial) at Campus Martius
5. Notification to LS&A Re: SWOP for Sgt. Raytheon Martin Badge #S-157
6. 25th Annual NACOLE Conference Memorandum
7. 2019 NACOLE Conference Schedule
8. Correspondence from Tawana Petty Re: Objection to Police Use of Facial recognition (9/11/2019)
9. Update, Facial recognition Directive 307.5 from Chief of Police Office reflecting BOPC recommendations and DPD Internal Review.
10. Four e-mails Re: Facial Recognition submitted to BOPC website (9/12/2019)

Old Business: None.

New Business: None.

Announcements: The next meeting is scheduled for September 19, 2019 at 3:00 PM at Detroit Public Safety Headquarters Building, 1301 Third Street, Detroit, MI 48226. The following month's community meeting is scheduled for October 10, 2019 @ 6:30 PM at St. John Presbyterian Church, 1961 East Lafayette, Detroit, MI 48207 (7th Precinct).

Oral Communications – Ms. Bernice Smith applauded the work of the local precinct in addressing her complaint in her neighborhood involving various nuances. Ms. Faith acknowledged the work of the Department and the Board of Police Commissioners. Ms. Mary Lacy questioned the Board and its operations as being that of a corporate board responding to

stakeholders. Ms. Lacy indicated the meetings are public meetings, suggesting the Board give more attention to the public and public comments should not be placed down at the bottom of the agenda, they should be moved to the top of the agenda. Mr. Eric Williams, Detroit Justice Center indicated that he and his organization are opposed to facial recognition technology. Mr. Williams also said the Board has only received information on facial recognition technology from one source and offered to provide another perspective in a presentation to the Board before the Board's scheduled vote. Mr. Williams also indicated the Board should wait to vote on facial recognition technology until after they obtain a copy of a study on the impact of the Detroit Greenlight Program conducted by Michigan State University was complete. He indicated such a report could help determine the issues impacting crime. Eric Blount indicated he was opposed to facial recognition and called for each of the appointed members of the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners to resign from office. Mr. Blount again called for the Chief of Police to release a taping of a meeting between the Chief, himself and others recorded by George Hunter, Detroit News reporter inasmuch as the tape should verify that the security guard in the hospital struck the first blow to a naked female and Corporal Jones should have step back as opposed to engaging the naked female with several blows. Sayla Ou indicated he was a graduate from Stanford University and study extensively for 5 years computer algorithmic language and programs related to facial recognition. He indicated the technology is flawed and is biased against people of color. Mr. Oue indicated he was opposed to facial recognition technology. Mr. Tyler Vosgerchain (?) voiced his objection to the Chief of Police's continued reference to breaking a case using facial recognition technology involving a crime that occurred at a LGBTQ party. Mr. Vosgerchain also objected to the police providing protective cover for the Nazi's at the recent Gay Pride march. Mr. Otis Mathews inquired about crime statistics in the African section of the 6th District. He indicated that he was more concerned with crime that was immediately approximate to his community as opposed to Greektown which is in the same District. Ms. Crystal Bonner indicated she was opposed to facial recognition and the DPD should stop protecting Nazi's. She also inquired as to why this meeting had so many police officers in attendance while the Precinct Commander reported a 63% increase in homicides in the precinct. She indicated that Department need boots on the ground not technology.

Commissioner Willie Burton led a call to shut down police use of facial recognition. The meeting became unruly and the Chair struggled to regain control over the loud voices in the audience.

Commissioner Evette Griffie moved for adjournment, the motion was seconded by Bell. The Board voted in the majority to adjourn the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 8:05 PM.