

Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners

Date of Meeting: June 27, 2019 – 3:00 PM

Location: Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street, Detroit, MI 48226

BOPC Chair Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (June 27, 2019)

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Lisa Carter	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton (3:06 PM)	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	11	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for June 27, 2019.

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:
Thursday, June 20, 2019**

Chairman Willie Bell, said “Good Afternoon! I am Police Commissioner Willie Bell, I represent District #4. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting today. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Today, we have invited Chaplain Tate to provide the invocation.” Chaplain Tate provided the invocation for the meeting. Chairman Bell request each Commissioner to introduce themselves. Also introduced were staff (BOPC and DPD), visiting elected officials and representatives of various organizations.

Chairperson’s Report; Chairman Willie Bell said “On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask First Assistant Chief of Police during her remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers.

The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2nd Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM. Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking “How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?” Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit. The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens’ complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. The Board of Police Commissioners will have its annual Board Training on Friday, June 28th and 29th, 2019. Please mark your schedules and plan to attend this annual training. We will be reviewing the mission and goals of the Board as well as a few of our operational procedures. The training

session is scheduled to start tomorrow, Friday, June 28th at 12:00 Noon and conclude at 5:00 PM. We will return to the training session Saturday, June 29th at 8:30 AM and work until 5:00 PM. The staff has pulled together a large amount of training materials that will be distributed before the end of our meeting today. Additionally, staff released a draft agenda Monday and distributed it to each Commissioner. If you need any additional information or materials, please see staff before the end of the meeting today.

Again, I remind the Board, we are continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the same time, Detroit will be celebrating our 45th year as a civilian oversight organization on July 22, 2019. We are inviting law-enforcement and other civic minded individuals and organizations to join us at the conference. The planning process is well underway, and again we invite your participation. Also, please expect to receive a detailed update on the NACOLE conference and the BOPC 45th Anniversary Dinner during our training session this weekend.

I want to remind everyone that our next meeting scheduled for July 4th has been cancelled. The next meeting of the Board will take place on July 11, 2019 at 6:30 PM at Durfee Innovation Center, located at 2470 Collingwood Street in the 10th Precinct. The July 11th meeting is a community meeting. New Board officers will be sworn in and take office. I will turn over the Chair responsibilities to Chair-elect, Commissioner Lisa Carter who will convene the meeting after she is sworn in.

Today, we have a full agenda, so I ask for your cooperation as we make it through the agenda. We have two resolutions for retiring officers.

- Lieutenant Paul Jones has 33 years of service and retires from the ranks of the 6th Precinct.
- Sergeant Lynn Carpenter has 25 years of service and retires from the Office of Civil Rights.

Also, at today's meeting we will have two presentations. The first presentation is on the Department's Integrity Unit. Director Christopher Graveline of Professional Standards and Constitutional Policing will provide information on the mission and objectives of DPD's Integrity Unit. The second presentation will be from OCI Chief Investigator, Dr. Polly McCalister who will provide OCI's monthly report.

I have also changed the order of the agenda to move Old Business after the Chief of Police Report. My intent is to take up the proposed Directives 307.6 – Traffic-light Mounted Cameras.” Chairman Bell continued indicating that Chief of Police James Craig has pulled back his request for approval of proposed directive #307.5 Facial Recognition Technology at this time for technical refinements. Bell added, “Given the large turnout at our recent Board meeting where we heard from 37 members of the community this matter requires addressing early in the meeting. Please note there are approved copies of the minutes from our June 13, 2019 meeting with the comments from 37 people who attended and shared their views with us are available on the back table. Procedurally, Assistant Chief James White reported to the Board last week on the Department's intent to adopt 15 of the 17 recommendations from the Policy subcommittee. My hope is that all of these recommendations are incorporated in the final version of the Directives that have been given to the Board. Copies of these directives are in the back of the room for the audience. I also indicated in our last meeting that my plan was to vote today. I asked that Commissioners come to the meeting with the intention to vote on proposed Directives 307.6 (Traffic Light Mounted Cameras) and 307.5 (Facial Recognition Technology).” Bell added, with the request from the Chief of Police to pull back the proposed directive related to facial recognition, we will only take up the traffic-light mounted cameras.

Bell continued, Under the Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on our crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department.

Chairman Bell also acknowledged the recent death of Highland Park Mayor Linsey Porter. Bell said Linsey Porter was the youngest Mayor to serve the City of Highland Park (1992 - 2004). Mayor Linsey Porter passed away on Tuesday, June 18, 2019 at the age of 65.

Bell, continued, “Again, at the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the beginning of public comments. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. I ask that everyone turn off your cell phones and other electronic devices. This request does not include the devices held by DPD personnel as many of you are on emergency standby. I ask DPD personnel to put their phone on vibrate so that ringing phones will not interrupt our meeting.”

Resolutions: **Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche** read into the record a resolution honoring the service history of retiring Detroit Police Lieutenant Paul Jones.

RESOLUTION HONORING RETIRING LIEUTENANT PAUL JONES

- WHEREAS** Paul Jones was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on May 5, 1986. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Officer Jones began his career at the Fourth Precinct; and
- WHEREAS** Officer Jones' assignments with the Detroit Police Department included the Narcotics Section, reassignment to Fourth Precinct, Special Crimes Section, and the Gang Enforcement Crew; and
- WHEREAS** Officer Jones displayed tremendous knowledge and leadership skills as a Police Officer and was promoted to the rank of Sergeant on November 9, 2001. He was transferred from the Gang Enforcement Crew to the Homicide Section. He also served the Eastern District and later the Gang Enforcement Crew, again; and
- WHEREAS** Sergeant Jones was promoted to the rank of Lieutenant on November 22, 2013 and was assigned to the Sixth Precinct, and later served at the First Precinct, Downtown Services and the Sixth Precinct, again where he served until his retirement; and
- WHEREAS** Lieutenant Jones was the deserving recipient of the following awards: Perfect Attendance, Perfect Driving, Lifesaving Citation and Medal, Chief's Unit Award, Fireworks Award, both Consent Judgment Awards, two Chief's Merit Awards, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, as well as numerous letters of commendation from citizens and superiors; and
- WHEREAS** Lieutenant Jones has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 33-plus years. He has served the Detroit Police Department and the citizens of the City of Detroit with loyalty, professionalism, integrity and dedication, and is widely respected throughout the law enforcement community as the consummate professional.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of the great City of Detroit recognize and honors the lifelong contributions and commitment to excellence in public service of Lieutenant Paul Jones. His display of courage and unwavering community spirit has improved the quality of life for the citizens of Detroit. We wish you all the best in your future endeavors. We thank and congratulate you, Lieutenant Paul Jones.

Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche moved the resolution honoring the service history of retiring Detroit Police Lieutenant Paul Jones. **Commissioner, Elizabeth Brooks, Second.**

VOTE – Yes = 11, No = 0, MOTION APPROVED

Resolution: **Commissioner Yvette Grifflie** read into the record a resolution honoring the service history of retiring Detroit Police Sergeant Lynn Carpenter. **Second, Commissioner William Davis**

RESOLUTION HONORING RETIRING SERGEANT LYNN CARPENTER

- WHEREAS** Lynn M. Carpenter was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on June 13, 1994. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Police Officer Carpenter began her career at the Eighth Precinct; and
- WHEREAS** She dutifully served the Eighth Precinct and Twelfth Precinct. On February 6, 2004 she was promoted to the rank of Sergeant and assigned to the Western District, reassigned to the Twelfth Precinct, Homicide, Communication Operations, Ninth Precinct, and Office of Civil Rights until her retirement; and
- WHEREAS** During her law enforcement career, Sergeant Carpenter was the deserving recipient of the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, both Consent Judgment Awards, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, and the Ford Fireworks Award as well as commendations from supervisors, and numerous letters of appreciation from citizenry; and
- WHEREAS** Sergeant Carpenter has tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 25 years. Her professionalism, commitment to public service, integrity, and dedication has been a credit to the Detroit Police Department. She is highly respected as a consummate professional.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, award this resolution in recognition of Sergeant Lynn Carpenter's 25 years of dedicated and diligent public service. Her professionalism, integrity, and lifelong commitment to the city of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards. We thank and congratulate you, Sergeant Lynn M. Carpenter.

Commissioner Yvette Griffie moved the resolution honoring the service history of retiring Detroit Police Sergeant Lynn Carpenter.
Commissioner Jim Holley, Second.
VOTE – Yes = 11, No = 0, MOTION APPROVED

COP Police Report: First Assistant Chief of Police Lashinda T. Stair representing Chief of Police James Craig reported that crime is continuing to trend downward as against last year. First AC Lashinda Stair reported crime and Statistical data utilizing DPD Department report dated June 27, 2019. First AC Stair reported year-to date data by category including, -6% decrease in Homicides, Sexual Assaults 10% increase, Aggravated Assaults -2% decrease, non-fatal shootings -2% decrease, Robbery -11% decrease, Carjacking -41% decrease, Burglary -8% decrease, Larceny -5% decrease, Stolen Vehicle -3% decrease and Part 1 offenses -5% decrease. First AC Stair reported on injured officers and a recent incident involving a graffiti artist (Mr. McFly) who was detained by the police while working on an authorized city project and advised the Board that this areas is under review so that sufficient protocols are in place to prevent this type of detainment in the future.

Old Business: Commissioner Lisa Carter moved the approval of proposed Directive #307.6, as proposed by the Chief of Police – Use of Traffic-light Mounted Cameras. Commissioner Yvette Griffie, Second. After discussion, the questions was called.

VOTE: Yes. –Holt, Burch, Brooks, Cater, Holley, Dewaelsche, Griffie and Bell = 7
No. - Davis, Burton and Brown= 3
Abstained from voting = 1 (Holley)
Results – Motion Approved.

Presentations to the Board: (A) Integrity Unit, Christopher Graveline, Director Professional Standards and Constitutional Police.
(B) OCI Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallster, OCI Chief Investigator.

(A) Integrity Unit, Christopher Graveline, Director Professional Standards and Constitutional Police reported that the Integrity Unit is part of Internal Affairs and is used to provide for covert investigations as needed. Graveline indicated the Unit has 16 open cases and 25 preliminary inquiries

(B) OCI Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallster, OCI Chief Investigator reported from May 2019 OCI received 118 complaints, a 22 increase over the same period of last year. For the month OCI investigated and closed 105 Citizen Complaints inclusive of 162 allegations. OCI investigations involved allegations - use of profanity, incident involving “hit & run” incidents, and electronic evidence (Body Worn Cameras and Electronic Control Weapons). McCallster also reported on false allegations via Body Worn Cameras. Below, please see a table for closed May 2019 Citizen Complaints.

105 OCI CCRs CLOSED – May 2019							
162 ALLEGATIONS' FINDINGS							
Allegation	Total	Admin_ Closure (31%)	Exonerated (16%)	Inconclusive (19%)	Sustained (16%)	Unfounded (22%)	
Arrest (1%)	6	2	3	0	0	0	1
Demeanor (24%)	45	5	1	12	15	12	
Entry (1%)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Force (3%)	4	2	0	1	0	1	
Harassment (2%)	5	3	0	1	0	1	
Procedure (43%)	77	23	16	10	13	15	
Property (6%)	3	1	0	2	0	0	
Search (1%)	4	1	2	0	0	1	
Service (18%)	18	13	1	1	1	2	
Total (135 CCRs Closed)	162	50	23	27	29	33	

BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.

Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks presented and summarized 5 items as incoming/outgoing items into the BOPC and placed informationally on the agenda as follows,

1. Letter dated 6/20/2019 from Todd Russell Perkins, Esq., Perkins Law Group Re: Civil Right Violation
2. Draft Schedule of Board Training, June 28 & 29, 2019
3. Letter dated 6/25/2019 from Hakim W. Berry, Chief Operating Officer, Mayor's Office Re: Summary of Changes UAW Local 212 Police Commission Investigators, CBA.
4. Letter of support for neighborhood real time intelligence program submitted by Commissioner Ravis 6/27/2019 on behalf of Barbara Matney (Warrendale Community Organization).
5. Proposed Directive 307.6 Use of Traffic-light Mounted Cameras and Proposed Directive 307.5 Facial Recognition Technology with BOPC Recommendations emailed to BOPC 6/27/2019.

New Business: Commissioner Jim Holley acknowledge the work and commitment of Chairman Bell over the course of the past year. Other Commissioner's joined in offering their acknowledgements for the same. Commissioner Holley also requested the Board hold it's vote on facial recognition for a few weeks because Holley wanted to discuss and vote on this important issue. Holley shared with the Board his plans to receive medical attention. Commissioner Holley also asked Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche to read a prepared statement into the record on his behalf,

**Statement by Reverend Jim Holley, Pastor of Historic Little Rock Baptist Church
and Member of the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners.
6-26-2019**

As a member of the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, I invite Detroit Police Chief James Craig and members of the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners to host a late summer criminal justice summit to address both the frustrations that are apparent in our community and discuss positive solutions to the current uptick in crime.

In my mind, this effort is not a platform to besmirch, ostracize or embarrass anyone including the good works of the Detroit Police Department. The summit reflects, my judgement that the community and policy makers stand far afield in seeking solutions. We need a practical and candid discussion of what is possible to change both our community and our institutional cultures to create opportunities.

In the final analysis, the way out of poverty driven crime is hope and real access to jobs and education. My hope is to convene this summit within the next 60 days. I ask the support of the Mayor, Chief of Police and the Board of Police Commissioners along with policy makers, philanthropic and business partners. Join me in an effort to show that Detroit lives matter!

Announcements: The next meeting is scheduled for July 11, 2019 (Community Meeting) @ 6:30 PM at Durfee Innovation Center, 2470 Collingwood Street, Detroit, MI 48206. The following month community meeting (August, 2019) is scheduled for August 8, 2019 at 6:30 PM at the Samaritan Center, 5555 Conner Street, in the Carolyn Cheeks Kilpatrick Room at 6:30 PM (5th Precinct).

Oral Communications – Public Comments. Janice Gates: My name is Janice Gates. First of all, I can't see how you watch a documentary like "When They See Us" and come away with facial recognition is a great way to prevent that. On to my comment, (Commissioner Bell interjects to clarify "the Commissioner (Griffie) did not say that, just stick to your comments please.") exactly. This trend towards mass surveillance is a gross violation of the privacy and security of the people who live and work in this city. It does not gather their consent, or value their privacy. To impose a technology like this in a city that is primarily and majority black and brown, we were consistently and constantly being squeezed in and forced out, (Commissioner Bell interjects) To impose a technology like this in a city where its citizens are primarily and majority black and brown are constantly and consistently being squeezed in and forced out is dangerous and irresponsible. Its violation of their rights and civil liberties. Where is the data that shows that this technology will help you better investigate a crime? Are you seriously promoting this idea that analyzing every single face that you come across is going to make me safe? Is going to make this city and this community safe? It is done in a way that devalues their consent, doesn't respect their privacy, and does not make us feel safe. This technology has been proven to be inaccurate and misidentifies particularly people of color, people who look like me, people who live and work in my community. I have every right to be able to move through this city without my movements being tracked and watched, under the guides that this will make me safer. So what I really want to understand....want people to understand is that this technology give

the police the power to analyze everyone, not just those people it chooses to brand as a criminal. This city is becoming more and more gentrified by the day, and it is not a coincidence that this technology is being rolled out primarily black cities like Detroit and Chicago. At the same time when there are discussions about new jails being built. So if you can't even conduct a vote with integrity, how do you expect to use facial recognition with integrity? Thank You.

Eric Blount: Good afternoon Board. My name is Eric Blount, lifelong Detroit. And I just want to share with you what it feels like from the community. It feels like this meeting agenda switch is a slight of hand trick, so many people came out thinking that they were going to understand and better express themselves on racial, on uh, facial recognition and at the last minute switch. So I just ask you to stick to the agenda, if there is any possibility there will be change, do it far and advance because these meetings are very inconvenient for people to have to work. As far as recruitment, it's a hard sell. But one of things I think we can do is make, at a minimum, rookie police officers making at least 50,000 a year. There is no way you can compare a police officer's pay to an assembly workers pay when they, like you said and everybody agree, they put their lives on the line every day. There's no comparison to an assembly line worker. Lastly, I wear this shirt in honor of an organization that's asked me to keep track of a police officer that brutally beat a naked poor black woman in the hospital. I'd like to have an update on Corporal Jones. Is he still on the force? Is he still a Corporal? And what is the status of his discipline? Is there a timeline on this?

Tawanna Petty: Hi, my name is Tawanna Petty, this will be my second time commenting on facial recognition technology. I understand that you said that's not the agenda item today. But you move forward and voted on traffic cameras that will have the capabilities of that technology prior to public comment and that inherently is a violation of our civil and human rights. So I really want you to reconsider putting through something like that without giving us an opportunity to continue voicing our concerns. This facial recognition technology has been being utilized for a couple of years without transparency and now that we get a minute to vocalize our concerns on it, it's rushed through with little accountability. This technology has been removed from body cameras in other police departments, it's been banned in San Francisco, the very technologists who created said that it's harmful and bias. It doesn't recognize darker skins, it couldn't recognize Michelle Obama and Oprah Winfree. The two most famous black women in the world this technology misidentified them. So I have to, have to, have to, push you all to at least understand the technology that you're implementing. This will be the largest experiment on black people in the United States, we are the last remaining black mecca. This is 700,000 plus black people being submitted to an experiment that has already failed all over the world and if you want to create a China, a social credit system that violates human rights, that targets Muslims that targets black people, you will move forward in this trajectory. I pray, I pray that you do not use our advocacy for you pushing against this as us being against law enforcement. My mother raised me, she was a police sergeant. My sister is a police captain who earned her dues on the force. So I'm standing up here pleading with you as someone who loves and respects many officers on the force. And telling you that this technology puts us in danger at a level that you could never understand.

Kristyn Sonnenberg: My name is Kristyn Sonnenberg. So whether or not the police currently plan to use facial recognition technology, there is very little keeping them from changing that or keeping the system from being abused. The fact that's San Francisco, home to the people developing surveillance and facial recognition technology have now banned its use on them is telling. The system is coded with algorithmic bias, older white men are most often correctly identified, while black women, as Tawanna was saying, are most often misidentified. Though there would be further investigation obviously, into hopefully proving the innocence of this misidentified person, an innocent person has still been brought into contact with the criminal justice system through that system. Even without facial recognition technology, widespread police surveillance in traffic light is a violation of our rights. Communities of color are always the ones disproportionately surveilled and criminalized. And this will only advance the long standing narrative that Detroiters are dangerous and need to be watched. Surveillance does not prevent crime it just captures it on video. And while this could help fill up the jails, crime will still continue. To really prevent crime, funds and time would be better spent on neighborhood wealth, resources, programs and economic development. That along with community building is what will make our neighborhoods safer and more stable. So I just urge you to take a more holistic look at what is actually necessary in preventing crime and how to build our communities up. Thank You

Thomas A. Wilson Jr.: Chairman Bell, Honorable Board members, fellow citizens. I'm going to read a letter that was in the Detroit Free press this past Sunday, letter to the editor written by me. My name is Thomas A. Wilson Jr. I read with great interest the June 13th article "Controversial Face Recognition Prompts Meeting as Relates to the Detroit Police Using Facial Recognition Technology for Policing Purposes." I attended the Board of Police Commissioners meeting held at St. John Lutheran Church Thursday evening and I spoke on the issue of facial recognition technology and I'm for any technology within reason that can help the police identify criminals, apprehend, prosecute them and send them to jail, thereby making the community safer. There's a concern raised about people's privacy. To which I said, there is no privacy anymore. I can google anyone's name in this church and get your name, address, phone number, age, name of relatives, and get your background check report. This facial technology

is a win win for the police and the community. Anything, like I said, within reason that will make Detroit's finest jobs easier and will make it easier for us to go out in the community and do our business, I'm for it. I hear these civil libertarians talk about well people's civil rights will be violated. My civil rights will be violated when one of these idiots picks up a gun, as Chairman Bell describes earlier, and decides to blow my brains out. My life and liberty to the pursuit of happiness ends, would you please let me finish. Like I said my life, liberty and pursuit of happiness ends when that fool picks up that gun and decided that because I was disrespected he's going to shoot me. And I say this too, in regards to Detroit's finest the police cannot win for losing they're outnumbered, they're outgunned. And if you had a police officer for every corner you know what people's complaint would be? There's too many police officers in here I'm living in a police state. You can't have it both ways, I'd rather see a police officer on every corner. Thank you.

Valeria Glenn: Valeria Glenn, a District 5 resident. Um I have in my possession a May 20, 2019, 25 page report that documents the recommendations and for the policy regarding this facial recognition and the lights. And it was addressed to the Chief of Police Chief Craig, James E White Administrative Operations, and cc: to the Commissioners. Were we the public ever going to get a copy of that report? Um, I was concerned about that, I'm aware that you gave us 2 reports today, one about the facial recognition, one about the lights. However, it's quite different from the report that I have in my possession. Was this document released to the citizens of Detroit, number 1. Two, there's a lack of awareness about the meetings, the committee meetings, when was this document actually discussed in front of the committee. And I have some concerns about the open meetings acts regarding that. Number 3, will there be another public hearing open to the public where we can actually hear. I was at the church I quite frankly got a little bit disgusted and I left. It was too hot, I could not hear, and I couldn't see any of your faces. And to me communications is two ways, I like to see your faces your reactions as you like to see mine. Number 4, regarding this policy I'm concerned about the fact that it appears to be a violation, we have a lack of awareness, awareness and concern about the accuracy of the facial recognition technology, it's my understanding its very inaccurate for women, and I'm a woman, African Americans, I'm African American, and other minorities. Other people of color, for me, a District 5 resident I am very concerned about the disrespect that is constantly shown to my Commissioner Mr. Willie Burton. I think that that's a violation.

Lorie Parks: My name is Lorie Parks and I just want to say that I do respect police officers. My best friend who's a retired police officer named Lee Richardson, he came on the police force before Coleman Young was in office so I know the stories about what they did to police officers who were African American before Coleman A. Young became our Mayor. So, I just want to say I respect you guys, and I love you, because whenever I need them they're there so. The next one is, I want a show of hands, I know you probably won't do it, of who was appointed by the Mayor. By the way write in Mayor because if you were appointed by the write in Mayor then you're a part of the doggone problem because you know doggone well didn't nobody get no 60,000 write in votes for no white man from Livonia; that's number 2. The police commissioners, when Coleman Young wanted police commissioners for the oversight for the citizens, he didn't want no ex-police officers. He wanted people from the community, that's what he wanted. He wanted citizens, everyday people like Me, Val, Brenda, all of us, you know. That's the number 2. The number 3 is, how many of the police officers that were hired just now, or within the recent year, live in Detroit. And I would like to know how many of them were hired from the southern states of the United States of America. I need to know, oh and the recruitments, every time we come up here she say the same thing. And they go to the same churches over and over. You can go to the little small churches, where there's a lot of members at, where there might be small membership, that's where you can recruit from if you keep going to churches. But there's other places to go to besides churches, you can go to playgrounds that they just built here in the city of Detroit and recruit where they all over at on the Eastside and Westside. There is a lot of places to go besides those big churches that y'all go to every month. Thank you.

Malik Shelton: Yes, I'm Malik Shelton, a concerned citizen. I like to say hello to the community and hello to the Commissioners. One of the founding fathers said that those who trade liberty for safety deserve neither. This whole camera, monitoring the public surveillance cameras, its manifesting itself not only in sophisticated cameras, which can just about look inside your pocket now. And is getting even more advanced as time goes on. And human beings are imperfect. They have bias, they make mistakes, so even though its being said that the information will only be used in certain purposes, who is to ensure that? If the technology of the cameras are so sophisticated now, are so advanced to the extent that they are now, imagine what it will be like 10, 20 years from now. It is my understanding that they have the capacity, some cameras, to look under your clothes. And that some cities they are thinking about, or have already done it. To have what you call "Roving Vans", where they can drive around and monitor and look under the clothing to see what people have who they deem to be suspect, whatever that means. Is taking us down a slippery slope that leads to government tyranny, the 4th amendment to the constitution, the 14th amendment to the constitution, the 1st amendment to the constitution was written as a protection against government tyranny. It doesn't have anything to do but with government tyranny. It's just a protection against it. So this surveillance, theses advanced cameras, this facial recognition technology, is all going to take us down that slope. Thank You.

Brenda Hill: Yes, my name is Brenda Hill, and I'd like to say as well that I respect the police as well. And I'd like to let everyone know that I've never called for a meeting with the police chief and not gotten it. And if he doesn't show himself, he makes sure all of his top brass are at that meeting. In fact, I know every, probably know everyone here except you the white boy. Even we have a coalition, they came out to the coalition, and we were instrumental in catching, in apprehending the serial killer. Out of those meetings they boarded up 900 houses, not just boarded them up but cleared those houses of bodies. Which may or may not have been done before. With those officers in the neighborhood, some crimes that potentially may have happened would not have happened because they are in the neighborhoods right now, and we were in the neighborhoods as well. SO I want to state that first. However, this facial recognition maybe the greatest threat to our civil liberties that we've known in my lifetime. You can't undo it once it starts, and there will be no Negro company that gets this information. And once you change the contracts, what do they do with that? I remember when we found out Ma Bell was selling our names and numbers, we didn't know that we were paying for them to sell selling our names and numbers. The fact that we paid more to stay off that list. And that's just your telephone name and address. We have to stop this, if you care about our communities, let them do that in Livonia, and let's see how that works. This is more of a Dugganism, and they're trying to steamroll over our civil liberties that's how come our people don't have water. Why are we talking about facial recognition when we got 100,000 households without water, a human right, a basic water. Thank You.

Dietta Wilcoxsin: Good afternoon honorable Board. To the residents of the City of Detroit, both present and not present, I am Dietta Wilcoxsin. I am here to address the issue of facial recognition technology. It creates suspects because of features, and it forces them to prove their innocence rather than the government proving their guilt. Innocent until proven guilty becomes meaningless in our society. Our democracy cannot withstand that kind of assault. Our criminal justice system has inherent biases built into it, it is a fact that facial recognition technology is less accurate in the African American community, more so than any other community. Slightly underneath the African American community is the Latino community, we are going to further perpetuate discrepancies along racial and ethnic lines in our country. Facial recognition technology has been documented in its illegal use of targeting people who engage in protected speech. Thwarting democracy's goal of a free speech right, to petition ones government and to address grievances. The major concern with the facial recognition technology is that false positives are real. That is that identifying a person from a database incorrectly. The major question for facial recognition technology is who will "control" the databases. We must further ask ourselves, who will if anyone, audit these database(s). Free in their persons that is what our constitution guarantees us both at the national and state levels. Facial recognition technology claws away at that very right. We are asking this Board to use its power to be an opponent of facial recognition technology by whatever measures are available to it. Our residents deserve nothing less than your considered researched and a passionate fight/ advocacy on the part of the very residents that you are supposed to represent.

Kenneth Holloway: I'd like to say hi to everybody that's here today. My name is Kenneth Holloway, now Calloway. I'm against facial recognition one reason because it serves no purpose for stopping crime. My daughter got her head blew off for backing out of a parking space. I take my hat off to the police department because they did a great job without that. Mr. Bettison he stood by me, that was my only daughter, it didn't stop her from getting her head blew off. Maybe we can use that money and put it towards something else for the police department because it's not going to stop crime. We see it on the news all the time, people looking at the cameras and still doing the crime, that's not gone stop nothing. We have to get to the bottom of why people are doing this. We could use more officers in the community, I'm on the eastside. They fly up and down the street, we got the 4th of July coming up. We got people on the block popping all kind of fireworks on people cars, we have to call in. They should do something about that we know it's gone be a big holiday coming up and its fireworks that people are using that can do damage to people's property. I'm over there by the 5th precinct, that's one of the things I'd like to see. That they out and stopping folks that's on the block. They got special places they can go to and use that fireworks. Like I tell them they don't have money to pay for my property, they just out there popping them and thangs. Like I said, I just wanted to take my hat off to the Police Department, I appreciate them, and I hope that you guys vote no on that facial recognition. Thanks a lot for listening to me.

Nicole Small: Good afternoon Police Commissioners, my name is Nicole Small and I too am oppose to the facial recognition and a number of cameras being installed throughout the city of Detroit. First and foremost I totally agree, cameras do not stop crime. I think this is another attempt to have something in place that will be used against the people. We were told the same thing about getting the new water meters, DTE meters and it's nothing but another attempt for them to be able to cut your stuff off without having to come inside your house. And now we're talking about facial recognition with such a low accuracy rate for the majority of citizens that live in the city of Detroit. Why would you even want to consider something like that? And in addition to that you must consider that if it's not a 90% or higher accuracy rate for this facial recognition, then that leaves the decision to be made by another human being. There are so many dollars that are coming about in throughout the city of Detroit. All of a sudden we find money for bike lanes, now we're finding all this money for facial recognition technology and cameras. But why can't we find more money to invest into the police department and increase their wages? That would help cure the problem with recruiting, they need more money, the money that they are being paid they can't even afford to live in the city of Detroit and afford insurance.

Now that's just the facts. And to Commissioner Griffin with your comment about the central park five I would just like to strongly encourage you that you come outside of your community. We always hear you talking about what you see in District 2 in your community but I'm quite sure that if you came outside of your community you would understand that not only Central park five, that we have so many sisters and brothers out here that will tell you that this does not work in their favor, this does not work in their favor. It has been proven to fail in other communities of color and it will fail here as well, and I encourage everyone here on this board to take a look at The Georgetown studies on the facial recognition and cameras. Oh and I'm sorry, Commissioner Chair Bell, I wanted to let you know that if you guys are gonna come together for your retreat to find a proposal for the charter commission, can you please make that available online We do have a citizen focus group that would like to review it before and they make their proposals, thank you.

Dawn D Rose: My name is Dawn D Rose and I totally concur with most the people here that are against the facial recognition software. I am against the facial recognition software, and I just heard about this on the news yesterday. I watch the news and listen to the news as much as possible and I just heard it yesterday and I came to the meeting to make a public comment before a vote was taken so that's totally unfair for you to vote on it before hand and most people are uninformed about it. And so there are several other points if I can keep track of all the things. Housing, the Duggan should be putting people in those houses, and stopping the homelessness rate and not having people use our money to tear down the houses. I will vote no on that proposal, the Vaughn proposal because I don't want the houses torn down, I want people in them and fixing them up. And I want contracts in the city of Detroit that for any builder they cannot come in the city without building affordable housing, real affordable housing. Not just these big houses and condos, and things that allowed the gentrification to keep going on. That facial recognition software has been talked about on 60 minutes, I don't want corporate control advertising using it, manipulating the people. The residents of the city. We don't need corporate or a governmental takeover or control of this city, like the state has already took over Belle Isle and most of the assets of this city. We need to stop this just like in Hong Kong they are having millions of people come out and protest against China and their policies that are wanting to control those folks in China and Hong Kong because they know what they're doing in China already with the face recognition software. It's already been mentioned hear that they use it to rate you as far as what you can do. If you jaywalk, if you do anything wrong, they will know who you are, they track you, every 2 blocks they have those cameras and basically you can be stopped from renting an apartment, traveling, doing almost anything of everyday life based on the facial recognition. It's dangerous.

Michelle George: Thank you very much to the Assistant Chief, to Chairman Bell and this honorable Board, good afternoon. I wanted to comment first of all thanking Chief Craig about the efforts with trying to solve the crimes of the young lady. But I also wanted to comment on the law enforcement program, I was at the school board meeting that's connected with the city of Detroit and one of the young men was talking about not discontinuing the program. So I don't know, I was looking in 2015 when they did the partnership with the Detroit high schools and I guess chief Craig and Mayor Dugan mentioned the expansion of funds. So I would recommend that Assistant Chief let Chief Craig know that program, with so many dollars coming in and out of the city of Detroit and developments, we should have that program in place to stay in place to recruit young men in these high schools, not just one high school. He was about 15 years old asking for the law-enforcement program to stay in because a lot of young men have benefited from the program and also going to college; some went to go into a federal law enforcement program. So I'm going to work on it to make sure money is used for these young people. We can't just use one high school and I see Detroit is experiencing more and more inequities. I don't know a lot about the facial recognition program but I would say I would advise not to go for that. I know The Bible talks about in the last days knowledge will increase, but even though the word says that, I would say Chief Craig, Deputy Chief Bettison I did send you an email not too long ago, that Chief Craig needs to have a town hall meeting In every community dealing with this crime, dealing with the complaints of the citizens. I also want to comment on briefly about that officer with the white officer arresting the black officer that went to the degree of fox2, news one, Atlantic black star, That when you start having problems with policing in your community naturally you're going to have problems with policing among your own colleagues. So I hope that investigation will continue on and we looking forward to see the result of the investigation. Thank you

Scotty Boman: I am Scotty Boman from Detroit residents advancing civilian oversight (Draco for short). My last name is spelled b-o-m-a-n, there is no W in my last name or in my sole. I just noticed in here that my name from the last meeting was spelled with a W along with grammatical errors I didn't make in the statement. Now onto the present matter, first of all a lot of people are worried that the facial recognition cameras are not accurate, I am more worried that they are accurate. My worry is that we will live in a society where our every move is tracked and ultimately, you know you got your fingerprints and you got your face, right hand, and forehead. Ultimately I see this becoming some type of debit system where we can't buy or sale without using that digital Mark from our right hand or our forehead. That's where I see this going now you might say well we don't have any inferior intent and in the policy statement says that these will only be used to investigate serious crimes, Used in a legitimate matter, in a legitimate investigation. That's a fine principal but the problem is if you deployed the equipment those tools will be available for any other regime or any other person who does have inferior who gets in power or is in a position of authority, Or has access to

those cameras. There are rules about looking at the NSA records of all your telecommunications that are recorded at some NSA database to this day. Mr. Snowden of course that we've heard of Edward Snowden, he actually found out that people weren't following those rules that were supposed to keep all of the information nice and secure and secret and what happen to him, He tried to get the truth out there he's exiled himself in Russia to avoid what might happen to him here. There used to be a time where the Russians will come here for safety from their government but now it's turned around that our country has gone so far downhill that people are leaving the United States to seek asylum in Russia. Thank you

Ralph Simpson: Good afternoon my name is **Ralph Simpson** I'm an attorney in private practice and I have a number of associations but since my comments today are more my personal opinions I'm going to stick with only A couple; the former chair of the State Bar Civil Liberties Committee and former chair of The State Bar Criminal Law section. I have some comments about the facial recognition technology but I'm not going to go into all of the civil liberties argument, I'm just going to suggest that to the commission that they take very seriously Commissioner Burton's suggestions that there be a legal opinion on these matters before they are adopted. Among other things, there are serious questions about the scientific reliability for using criminal proceedings whether adoption of that type of technology would subject the city to civil proceedings whether the information would be available through the freedom of information act or other mechanisms to private individuals despite these procedures that are being considered. A second matter is quite different, I noticed today that people were being asked for identification when they entered. That's a straightforward violation of the open meeting act. Which says that with regard to identifying public attendees no one may be required to register or otherwise provide his or her information or his or her name or other information or otherwise to fulfill a condition precedent to attending a public meeting. I would assume that you are unaware of that. I, as a courtesy, will inform you and I'm happy to discuss with your legal counsel but I would expect that that would be addressed.

Tonya Ellison: Hello I am **Tonya Ellison** and I had an issue with the DPD officers involving orange barrels. On June 7, 2019, I was driving west on Livernois and 7 mile, it was very chaotic with no workers in the area at Warrington. Traffic was backed up to Palmer Park to Woodward, I tried to turn down Warrington to get out of the situation. These officers were more concerned about orange barrels, they stopped me, these officers demanded that I take a breathalyzer and a sobriety test; no alcohol found in my system, blew a zero four times on the breathalyzer test, took multiple sobriety tests, touch my nose, recite ABC. My car was commissioned to be towed before administering sobriety tests, they never told me why they towed my car. The intake investigator's report contains the minimum details and unacceptable. All parties involved in this incident wasn't listed, the multiple sobriety test were not contained in her report. I feel if I were a white female this would never happened, this was an abuse of a power, poorly and unprofessional behavior. The crimes that transpired in our city and these Officers are more concerned with protecting orange barrels. Frustrated because these officers abused their position they didn't get the results they wanted, I wasn't under the influence, No indication of drinking, I blew a zero four times on the breathalyzers. These officers are more concerned with getting money for tow truck drivers than serving the citizens of this city; they towed my car, I was issued Tickets that were illegible, I wasn't under the influence. I presented the correct documents to the tow lot I retrieve my car the same day. In conclusion I want a reimbursement of this \$255 for my tow fee etc. these are not the kind of officers we deserve in our community sworn in to protect and serve these citizens. They are violating the law against the citizens. I believe they're actually borderline on criminality. If these claims are filed to be substantiated through investigations they should be dismissed immediately. Names and documents available upon request. Thank you.

Chairman Bell: Indicating that if there is no other business before the Board he would accept a motion to adjourn. **Motion to Adjourn, Carter, Griffie, Second.**

Motion to Adjourn. Chairman Bell adjourned the meeting at 4:32 PM.