

**Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners**

**Date of Meeting: July 11, 2019 – 6:30 PM**

**Location: Durfee Community Innovation Center, 2470 Collingwood, Detroit, MI 48206**

**BOPC Chair Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 6:30 PM (July 11, 2019)**

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Lisa Carter, Chair-elect	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche, Vice Chair-elect	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jim Holley	Excused	
Evette Griffie (6:38 PM)	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	10	

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for July 11, 2019.**

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:  
Thursday, June 27, 2019**

**Chairman Willie Bell**, said “Good Evening! I am Police Commissioner Willie Bell, I represent District #4. I am the Immediate Past Chair of the Board and will be conducting the first part of the meeting. Later in the meeting, we will have the installation of new officers and I will turn over control of the meeting to the new Chair. As per the Charter, the Board is required to change officers annually. At our June 13, 2019 meeting, the Board elected Lisa R. Carter, District #6 to the position of Chair, and Eva Garza Dewaelsche, Member at Large, to the position of Vice Chair. I note tonight, Police Commissioner Jim Holley has asked to be excused. Reverend Holley recently had surgery and is recovering. I ask that each of our Commissioners find a way to express our support to Reverend Holley. Commissioner Annie Holt has already delivered flowers to his church as a testimonial of support. After the adoption of today’s agenda and the approval of the Minutes from our June 27<sup>th</sup> meeting, we will have the installation of new officers. We have invited Wayne County District Court Judge Craig Strong to convene over the installation process. Again, after the installation of new officers, I will turn the meeting over to Lisa Carter who will assume control over the meeting.

On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Today, we have invited Chaplain James Powell to provide the invocation.” Chaplain Powell provided the invocation.

Chairman Bell asked for introduction of each Commissioner in attendance, BOPC and DPD staff and elected officials in attendance. Bell continued, I want to invite Denise Lyles, Director of the Durfee Community Innovation Center to welcome us to the Center and briefly outline some of their work at the Center. Ms. Denise Lyles welcomed the Board and the community to the Durfee Community Innovation Center.

Bell added, “Since this is my last meeting as Chair, I want to thank several people who have contributed to the work of the Board. I want to thank my colleagues for the opportunity to serve. As a Board, we have managed to stay afloat and discharge many of our responsibilities as outlined by the Charter. Attention to detail and hard work on the part of Commissioners is what makes a difference toward effective policing and the protection of citizen civil rights. I want to thank the BOPC staff and the staff of the Office of the Chief Investigator. I also want to thank the Chief of Police and his Command staff for their efforts to fight crime while respecting the rights of our citizenry. But, most importantly, I want to acknowledge and thank the lower ranks of our Department, the patrol officers, corporals and the front line leadership within our ranks of Sergeants and Lieutenants. Finally, I want to thank Alvin Stokes and the City-wide and Precinct based Police Community Relations Organizations and the many support auxiliary organizations that help support law enforcement.

----- Swearing in Program -----

Bell, “I ask Commissioners Lisa Carter and Eva Dewaelsche join me in the center of the Board table. I invite the Honorable Craig Strong, Wayne County District Court Judge to swear in new officers for the 2019-2020 BOPC Leadership Cycle.

> Judge Strong gave the Oath of Office for Chairperson Lisa Rene Carter. Chairperson Lisa Carter responded by affirming the Oath of Office.

> Judge Strong gave the Oath of Office for Vice Chairperson, Eva Garza Dewaelsche. Vice Chair Eva Garza Dewaelsche responded by affirming the Oath of Office.

Bell congratulated the new officers of the Board, and turn over control of this meeting to the new Chairperson of the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, Commissioner Lisa Carter.

-----

**Chairperson’s Report** – Lisa R. Carter thanked Commissioner Willie Bell for his leadership over the last year as Chair. Chairperson Carter also said, “On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask the Chief of Police during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers.

The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM. Tonight’s meeting is the eighth (8) meeting that we have held in the community this year. We have and will continue to meet in every District in Detroit. If you and your facility would like to be added to our list of community meeting locations, please contact us so that we can make any necessary arrangements to meet in your community.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking “How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?” Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit.

The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens’ complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.

As the new Chair, I will continue to use this weekly report to highlight the work of the Board. I will also detail for our attendees and the viewing audience the order of the meeting and pose critical questions about our Department to the Chief of Police and his Command staff. I will also continue to point to special events that require the attention of the Board or are of interest to the community.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. Recently, the Board of Police Commissioners had its annual Board Training. Among many of the high caliber discussions held in the training sessions, I want to note the work of Dr. Marilyn French Hubbard who joined us on Friday. Dr. Hubbard, acting as a facilitator, challenged us by asking a simple question. What motivates us to be a Police Commissioner? We also received a presentation from Professor Richard Friedman of the University of Michigan Law School. Dr. Friedman discussed his experience in police oversight with the University of Michigan and the City of Ann Arbor. Both exchanges with Dr. Hubbard and Professor Friedman provided food for thought for the Commissioners attending the training session. We also had several discussions on administrative and procedural issues that will be scheduled for Board discussion and action within the next few months.

Again, I remind the Board, we are continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the Board’s training we reviewed many of our responsibilities related to the NACOLE Conference. During the same time, we discussed Detroit’s celebration of our 45<sup>th</sup> year as a civilian oversight organization. Our anniversary date is July 22, 2019. We discussed the need to organize and recruit volunteers for our anniversary dinner to be held in the week of the NACOLE conference. We also discussed

other volunteer needs for the BOPC Anniversary Dinner. At the back table are volunteer signup sheets that I encourage you to read and consider volunteering for these two special events. Also, at the back table is a 45<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Celebration brochure. The brochure has a brief history of the BOPC and a list of the Official and Honorary Hosts of the Conference. Again, we are inviting law-enforcement and other civic minded individuals and organizations to join us at the conference. The planning process is well underway, and again we invite your participation.

Chairperson Lisa Carter continued, today, we have a full agenda, so I ask for your cooperation as we make it through the agenda. We have one resolution for presentation. The Command staff at the 10<sup>th</sup> Precinct selected to honor Ms. Theodora Ragland. We will take up the resolution for Ms. Ragland under resolutions on our agenda. Originally, we had planned for two resolutions. The second to honor the life and contributions of former police Commissioner Richard P. Kughn. Commissioner Kughn served as a Commissioner from 1982 to 1987. We passed a resolution honoring Commissioner Kughn at our June 20, 2019 meeting. Commissioner Kughn's family hoped to join us tonight for the presentation, but are unable to do so. The Kughn family requested that the following statement be read.

**Dear Board of Police Commissioners:**

**I had planned to attend, however things are such that I will not be able to.**

**My sisters and I appreciate, and thank all of you on behalf of our father, for this very kind recognition. I remember when dad served as a Police Commissioner and the honor he felt to be able to serve Detroit, a city he truly loved.**

**Please extend our thanks to the Police Department and all who serve daily, for your service to a wonderful city, and especially during a time of such resurgence and vitality...pretty exciting! And to you again Teresa, thank you your very dear words during this time.**

**All the best.**

**Regards, Gary Kughn**

Also, at today's meeting we will have two presentations. The first presentation is our monthly Human Resources Report. The report will be given by Dr. Marcella Anderson, Director of Police Personnel. The second presentation will be on crime statistics and crime fighting strategies in the 10<sup>th</sup> Police Precinct. The Presentation will be given by Commander Nick Kyriacou and Captain Jonathan Pamell.

As our last meeting, Chief of Police James Craig pulled back the proposed directive on facial recognition. I understand that he is making some technical changes to the proposed directive. The Board will consider this directive after it is returned from the Chief's office. I will also make every accommodation to the request from Police Commissioner Jim Holley who has requested that we take up this items upon his return. Additionally, I want to acknowledge that Michigan State Representatives Isaac Robinson (House District #4) and Sherry Gay-Dagnago (House District #8) have introduced in the Michigan Legislature House Bill 4810. The bill seeks to place a five year moratorium on Facial Recognition Technology. Should this bill pass, it will become state law and preempt local law.

Under the Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on our crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department.

At the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the beginning of public comments. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. I ask that everyone turn off your cell phones and other electronic devices. This request does not include the devices held by DPD personnel as many of you are on emergency standby. I ask DPD personnel to put their phone on vibrate so that ringing phones will not interrupt our meeting."

Chairperson Carter called upon Commissioner Annie Holt to read into the record the resolution for Theodora Ragland. Chairperson Carter also recognized Commissioner Willie Burton who made several inquiries about what the new Chair would do differently and issues related to BOPC office space. Chairperson Carter indicated that the inquiries by Burton were out of order. Burton continued and the Chair ruled Burton out of order three time and requested that because of his disorderly conduct that he be removed from the meeting. The Chair also allowed for a five minute recess to restore order to the meeting.

Chairperson Carter restored order and resumed the meeting. Commissioner Annie Holt read into the record a resolution for Ms. Theodora Ragland acknowledging her many contributions to the 10<sup>th</sup> Police Precinct.

## RESOLUTION HONORING MS. THEODORA RAGLAND

**WHEREAS** Ms. Ragland has been a resident of the Tenth Precinct for the majority of her life. She has been an active member of the Tenth Precinct Community Relations team for several years and is currently the Financial Secretary of the Tenth Precinct Community Relations Executive Board; and

**WHEREAS** Ms. Ragland is a proud graduate of the Detroit Public School system. She then went on to study Secondary Education/Mathematics at the University of Michigan, where she received her degree. She became a teacher in several schools in the Metro Detroit area. Ms. Ragland is still teaching and has contributed her talents to the youth of Thirkell Elementary school in the Tenth Precinct. She was part of the Beyond Basics Reading Program, which promotes literacy and creative thinking for students at school; and

**WHEREAS** Ms. Ragland is a proud member of the Detroit Police Citizen's Academy Alumni Association (DPCAAA), has always been involved in community relations and has always contributed her efforts to quality of life for the community. Ms. Ragland started the Ragland Community Garden located in the Tenth Precinct, which is sponsored by the Coalition of Black Trade Unions and supported by Keep Growing Detroit; and

**WHEREAS** Ms. Ragland participates in various programs at the Tenth Precinct, such as the yearly National Night Out event and Halloween celebration. She is a key component in bringing people together to support the community, by organizing blocks clubs and neighborhood cleanup events. Ms. Ragland is a firm believer that "Learning and sharing information with each other helps us grow and Build as a Community."

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of the City of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, acknowledges the loyal support of Ms. Theodora Ragland. Her service and years of dedication to supporting the community of the Tenth Precinct and the citizens throughout the city of Detroit merit our highest regards. **DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS**

**Commissioner Eva Dewaelsche** moved the resolution for Ms. Theodora Ragland acknowledging her many contributions to the 10<sup>th</sup> Police Precinct. **Commissioner, Yvette Griffie, Second.**

**VOTE – Yes = 8,**

**No = 0,**

**MOTION APPROVED**

**COP Police Report: Assistant Chief of Police David LeValley** representing Chief of Police James Craig reported that crime is continuing to trend downward as against last year. AC LeValley reported crime and Statistical data utilizing DPD Department report dated July 11, 2019. AC LeValley reported year-to date data by category including, -4% decrease in Criminal Homicides, Sexual Assaults 8% increase, Aggravated Assaults -1% decrease, non-fatal shootings 6% increase, Robbery -8% decrease, Carjacking -36% decrease, Burglary -8% decrease, Larceny -5% decrease, Stolen Vehicle -2% decrease and Part 1 offenses -5% decrease. AC LeValley reported on injured officers and made the following announcements. (1) The department will be conducting promotional examinations this weekend at COBO Hall. (2) July 25, 2019 will be a retirement party for retiring Deputy Chief of Police Elvin Barren. Mr. Barren is to become the new Chief of Police in the city of Southfield, Michigan.

**Presentations to the Board: (A) Human Relations Report, Dr. Marcella Anderson, Director of Police Personnel  
(B) 10<sup>th</sup> Police Precinct Report, Commander Nick Kyriacou and Captain Jonathan Parnell**

**(A) Human Resources Report – Dr. Marcella Anderson, Director of Police Personnel, provided statistical data for June 2019 (July 9, 2019 Report).** Dr. Anderson indicated that of the total positions (2,640 Sworn) in the Department, DPD has 175 vacant Police officers. Of the 701 (Civilian) positions in the Department, 75 are vacant. Dr. Anderson discussed recruitment and MCOLES processing indicating the Department has 3792 applications from 7/1/2018 to 6/30/2019 the Department hired 14 individuals (0 sworn, 12 civilian and 2 police assistants). Anderson reported 182 are awaiting MCOLES certification, 67 are in process. Anderson also indicated that our residency data as of 6/30/2019 reflect Detroit residents at 569 Sworn, 353 Civilian and 31 Police Assistants. For non-Detroit residents for the same period, 1833 Sworn, 273 civilians and 32 Police Assistants. Anderson also provide attrition data and leaves of absence and restricted duty data. Dr. Anderson indicated that her report covered officers suspended and not at work (10 Police Officers suspended, 1 Detective, 3 Sergeant, 1 Command Officer for a total of 15 individuals).

**(B) 10<sup>th</sup> Police Precinct Report, Commander Nick Kyriacou and Captain Jonathan Parnell** discussed with the Board precinct level statistical data of crimes that took place in the 10<sup>th</sup> Police Precinct and outlined the several of the crime fighting measures conducted by the precinct. Commander Kyriacou also briefly outlined some of the outreach and partnerships underway in the precinct.

**BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.**

**Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks presented and summarized 5 items as incoming/outgoing items into the BOPC and placed informationally on the agenda as follows,**

1. Letter from Mahmoud M. Awad, APA Re: Subpoena 18-34
2. 10<sup>th</sup> Precinct GIS Crime Map Report
3. Human Resources Report from Dr. Marcella Anderson
4. HB 4810 Introduced by Representative Robinson, Gay-Dagnogo and Jones Re: Facial Recognition Technology.

**Announcements:** The next meeting is scheduled for July 18, 2019 at 3:00 PM at Public Safety headquarters Building, 1301 Third Street, Detroit MI 48226. The following month community meeting is scheduled for August 8, 2019 at 6:30 PM at the Samaritan Center, 5555 Conner Street, in the Carolyn Cheeks Kilpatrick Room at 6:30 PM (5th Precinct).

**Oral Communications –**

**Mary McKenzie:** My name is Mary McKenzie, I'm the former president of the Detroit citizen police academy alumni association, but I'm here to talk on behalf of the 10th precinct senior activities group Which I'm very proud to be a part of you and I came to say thank you because remember those days when I kept begging for a van so that the police to take us to our activities. Now we have access to 2 vans. We didn't get a replacement but we at least we have access to two or three vans and I wanted to thank you on behalf of our Board.

**Eric Blunt:** Good afternoon board, for the record my name is Erie Blunt. A lifelong Detroitier I have asked this board for many years to consider the seriousness of your job here. Your continual downward spiral of relevance is evident more and more after each and each meeting. I asked that for the policeman department, as you list the fallen and injured officers, I have asked before and I'll ask again to detail out suspended officers, the reason why, and if they have returned to service. Specifically I have been here on various occasions asking for an update on Corporal Jones the officer that brutally beat a naked woman in the hospital. Please let me continue. Thirdly for the precincts and all precincts operation CeaseFire sounds like a good idea, but it's another program designed just to lock them up. We need employment, we need livable wages. You will continue to chase criminals as long as people cannot adequately supply what they need for their families. Lastly, I am delighted to hear that House Bill 4810 is being introduced, I ask you to seriously consider it. It is a national issue. And it is nothing more than some type of system to lock up people of color. Thank you.

**Eric Williams:** Good evening my name is Eric Williams. So as an initial matter and I could be wrong on this but I actually think the removal of Commissioner Burton was improper even under Robert's rules of order requires a motion. I mean I may be wrong but in the interest of the fears of the public it would be good if you could verify that and bring back the site at the next meeting, and if it turns out that was appropriate that's fine. But if not I think you owe both Commissioner Burton and the people that he represents an apology. That's the first thing. The second thing is, I have concerns because this board's job is oversight of the police department, but it's kind of what is typically referred to as a captive oversight group. Everybody applauds and thanks the police officers. And I have no problem with the police. In fact, my father Amos Williams told me to tell you Commissioner Bell, hello. You know, I have no problems with the police but the way you rolled your eyes, half of you, any time somebody criticizes the police. I mean it's just as though you really seem to think all of the problems are rooted in the people. Respect has to go both ways. And there are really issue as far as disclosure and transparency with our police department. We have been promised for over a year, for example, that we would get evidence that project green light in fact worked. There was a study, apparently commissioned, from Michigan State, we haven't seen the results. Preliminary results show that if there is any benefit for project Greenlight at all, it's not coming from the cameras. So we'd like to see the evidence. The lack of transparency, the clear utter disregard for the public and I hate to say this but it's been kind of condescending the way you've been taking to the public and it's not a good look. And I think it's actually kind of inappropriate, but I thank you for your time.

**Tawanna Petty:** Hello my name Tawanna Petty, I represent Detroit Community Technology Project. I want to introduce the fact that this is a bipartisan issue. The resistance to facial recognition technology you should know that in addition to HB 4810 there's also **Locito's** bill in the senate which is SB 342 that offers a total ban on police use of facial recognition technology. This is one of the few bipartisan resistances that you all should be aware of. Secondly, I understand that the mayors argument, let me get my words together here, The argument right now by the Mayor and the Chief of Police is that they won't be using live stream video they will be using still photos. However, racial bias issues were first detected using still photos so facial recognition technology performing worse on darker skin tones, women, black and brown people will persist on still photos. And also, why would the Mayor and Chief say that they are not using something that they pay \$1,045,843.20 to contract for the use of real time screening application software, which monitors 100 concurrent videos feeds in addition to mobile facial recognition licenses, for unlimited

users. So you're not just talking about the live stream cameras, you're not just talking about driver's license photos, you're not just talking about third-party sketches, you are also talking about cell phone photos at an unlimited option to have officers walking around with this technology and capability of the surveilling and profiling residents until they find who they're looking for on faulty technology. I am going to plead with you and until you make the right decision on this and we will take it as far as we have to go. This is wrong I don't know why you want to experiment on 700,000 black and brown people using a technology that has proven to be faulty. It's proven across the world. Don't do this to Detroit you say you represent the Detroiters don't do this to Detroit.

**Valerie Glenn:** Good afternoon I'm talking loudly because you can't hear much below the first three rows here. This is horrible this is absolutely horrible. All of you that are sitting there that did not get up for Willie Burton. None of you need to be re-elected or appointed again. None of you. Now you can sit there and look stupid. At least William Davis asked a question. You all are treating us as though we don't even count. I lived through the 67 riots, and I can tell you we're headed for another one. The way you treated us at the police commissioner meeting, I mean not the police, at the charter commissioner meeting, you over killed us with police officers. You didn't need 30+ top ranked police officers at that meeting. How much did it cost us as tax payers? The lowest officer I saw was a Lieutenant. And all of you. I know many of you personally. This is really bad. I'm very disappointed in each and every one of you. I am very disappointed. You all are terrible and you treat us like we don't even count. You don't follow any rules, you don't follow the Charter, we know that. You don't follow nothing else. I'm really very very disappointed. We are going to have to reconsider everything. This is worse than STRESS and I grew up with STRESS. Thank you.

**Brenda Hill:** My name is Brenda Hill and I came here to voice my concerns about what happened at the Charter Commission with the police department. And this is the place I was supposed to come to make my complaint and tell you my concerns. And what happened to the people at the Charter Commission, just happened here with Willie Burton. And I'm going to tell you I don't agree with the Willie Burton most of the time, but for an elected official, or anybody who's a citizen of this city to be thrown upon the floor. They just turned this meeting into a police state. So it's not just the Charter Commission, it's the people in power. And we need to have more power in the people. I don't know who the guy was in the blue, he pushed the door. He doesn't have the right to do that. It's against the law to bar entrance and egress. That's against the rules. It is not, I spent all day looking up the facts. The facts it is not illegal to voice your concerns. It's not. That's not an order and that is not a concern and for another commissioner, because they don't like what the people want. We come to these meetings all the time. Not the people on Twitter not the people on Facebook. We take our time and we come to these meetings to address you. And to be treated like we've been treated. And no one is saying anything. We built a relationship with the police, and now we don't have it. We are now afraid of the police. This was overkill, and there was overkill at the Charter Commission. You all need to do something and check yourself. The Chief said you need to check yourself and put down your guns, no y'all need to check yourself and maybe get out of office.

**Patricia Carter:** I am Patricia Carter with Oakland Boulevard Community Association. Our organization represents 700 households in this area. Williams was asking about the districts, we represent district 2, 5 and 7. The 10th precinct has been my precinct for most of my life. I was brought up in the third precinct, I've only lived in 2 precincts. I would like to congratulate our Commander K, he's there for the community. He comes to our association meetings. Sergeant Hall decided to leave us, but he had 50 some Greenlight's installed in the area before he left. Officer Hill is the traffic patrol officer. I have been on the street and he has stopped 2 cars, gives one a ticket and he's got another stopped just like that. He excellent with the traffic enforcers. Unfortunately, we need it quite badly. I'm a half block From I-96. The state took over west Davison. There was a traffic study done a few years ago, 1500 cars per hour making a connection with the Lodge, the Davison and the Chrysler. Accidents are there all the time because they're running the red light. I have sat there on you all Ewald Circle to get across, three people have run the red light. I mention it to our organization last month, the next morning a lady ran the red light and hit a man, he was taking his child to school. Unfortunately, it was an airbag injury. I would also like to compliment our neighborhood patrol officers, we have Officer Berry, Officer Barber, Officer Parker, Officer Sumter has been off for a while she's got a new little baby boy, but she's coming back soon. I just to welcome captain pier.

**Mr. Boman:** You know, by the way, first I filled out my comment card "he who shall not be named" but obviously a lot of people recognize me and the reason I did this is because it came to my attention at a previous meeting that the open meetings act specifically, I can read the clause, says, "A person shall not be required as a condition of attendance at a meeting of a public body to register or otherwise provide his or her name or other information or otherwise fulfill a condition precedent to attendance." So that's why I've been doing that, and the other part, the mask, what's this about? You know who I am. It's a low tech solution to a high tech problem. A high tech problem the Board of Police Commissioners has failed to rectify and in fact has helped embolden. The motion to table and the vote to table the facial recognition part of the policy was a joke because that part of the policy was really only a couple paragraphs. Meanwhile approving the expansion of the GreenLight technology to the traffic cameras and that policy, which it turns out as you've heard from other people tonight, is already implemented. It is basically what we have right now is a surveillance state in the city of Detroit without the existence of a policy to fully address it. The fact that the

facial recognition technology is stated to only be used in criminal investigations and legitimate purposes. Only cites intent not capability. It only takes one person to do something wrong. Edward Snowden found people using the NSA database of all our phone calls and so forth and emails and watch what they were doing and who they were talking to even though that was supposed to require a warrant. So once the ability to abuse is made available people will abuse it. Another abuse, big one tonight. The arrest of Commissioner Burton. When he was speaking after being recognized by the chair, because apparently what he said was not liked by the Chair. And that is, using the police who you're supposed to oversee to prevent abuse by police. Using police to instead arrest a fellow commissioner and go against a fellow commissioner is amongst a civil war, people using a paramilitary against another politician.

**Mr. Williams:** The Board of Police Commissioners are legally required to abide with the meetings act. All meetings shall be held in accordance with the Michigan open meetings act, Detroit city charter, article 7, chapter 8, section 7-802. My face is my identification, you can't require me to show it. Any person shall not be required as a condition at attendance or a meeting that is for a public body, to register or otherwise provide his or her name or any information otherwise to fulfill a condition precedent to attendance. Open meetings act 267 of 1976. Section 15-263 section 3-4. I have a right to record any interaction that happens in the city concerning a public meeting the right to a person to attend a meeting of a public body includes the right to tape record, video tape, or broadcast live on radio and telecast live on TV, the proceedings of a public body at a meeting, that's section 15-263 section 3-1. I cannot be excluded out of any meeting for attending the charter meeting, which I was wrongfully arrested. I was wrongfully accused of disorderly conduct. I have done nothing wrong, I proclaim my innocence. And to be here at this police commissioner meeting where I just watched you as a constituent of the Commissioner Willie Burton, of my district the 5th district. You wrongfully removed him. That is not in the open meetings act. That is a violation of the open meetings act. That is not Robert rules of order. That is not Roberts Rules of order to put your hands on anybody in this room. And all these police officers that could've been in the community fighting murderers, serial killers, and rapist, are attacking senior citizens and members of the community. I will say this one more time that you cannot move me, I am a tax payer citizen of the city of Detroit all my life. I am active, I am involved. I am proactive and come with a lot of solutions. And you cannot move me or anybody else of the public. And I sign off by saying, FTP ACAB and Chief Craig must resign or he'll be removed by the will of the people.

**Joanna Underwood:** Hi, my name is Joanna Underwood. I'm a Commissioner of the Detroit Charter Commission. Unlike some members on the Board, Ms. Lisa I was elected by 60,000 votes. So you need to respect elected officials, you will never get 60,000 people to vote for you. I got 60,000 people to vote for me regardless if you respect me or not. What you did was a violation because I also was trained and I also know what the open meetings rules act. And the open meetings act trumps Roberts Rules of Order which is not a legal binding documentation. It's what your board adopt and it don't trump state law. Which states that the police commission operates all public meetings under open meetings act. The conduct of this officer right here shows another tale. And I recommend that all citizens go file a citizen complaint form against what happened here. You can go to the local police department and file a citizen complaint form against every officer in this room and especially that David guy. I also want to say, that we got missing black children in the city of Detroit, we got black women being raped and kidnapped. And I have not seen a report or he hasn't talked about the missing black children. I find it very disgusting that we got 2,200 police officers and only 539 of them live in the city of Detroit. What is it you guys are doing to increase Detroit residents becoming officers in the city of Detroit? You guys are operating as a co-signer of the Mayor. You are supposed to represent the residents of the city of Detroit. You're not supposed to co-sign everything the police department does. We pay for the police department, 60% of our budget goes to public safety. Why are you not representing the residents that elected some of you? And that's the reason why I vow to you, god as my witness, every last one of y'all will be elected officials, not appointees.

**Lori Parks:** Alright my name is Lori Parks. Listen, I asked a couple of questions the last couple of meetings that I was at. One of them was, I wanna know how many police officers were hired here from the south. And how many police officers were hired here in the city of Detroit from other cities. I have not gotten that report yet, I need to know that, tonight. Also, I was very very upset about the police officer who beat the woman in the hospital. Yes. So one of your Commissioners told me the reason he voted that way was... Mr., yes. He told me he voted that way because the officer was a small man. I see that has nothing to do with why that police officer beat that woman 13 times and he still on the job right now. He never lost one penny of his pay. Also, Willie Bell told me at the last meeting, the reason, when Coleman Young he made sure that we had police commissioners in our city so that we could have police commissioners who were not ex police officers nor ex Wayne County Sheriffs. We needed people who were on the community, not ex police officers or ex Wayne County Sheriffs. Why? Because we all know that police officers and everybody have they certain code they go by, they stick together whether they on the force or off the force. Isn't that correct citizens? Ok. So that's my comment for today thank you.

**Raven Nobles:** Hi my name is Raven Nobles, I'm 17 years old. I'm currently, I just finished high school. I was on the west side of 7mile of Detroit and the gang intelligence unit pulled me over for no reason at all. They pulled me over and they said that my headlights wasn't working, which I flicked them and they were. It was 4 cars, it was 4 different Ford Explorer trucks. They pulled

me over for no reason at all. They towed my car willingly and I told them I could've had my parent to come get my car but they towed it anyway and gave me 2 tickets for \$500 for no reason. Also they had me handcuffed in the middle of 7 mile for 30 minutes. They made me shake my chest out and she searched me down for weapons. We were standing there for 30 minutes, they didn't allow me to call my parent. I went to get my car at the pound the next morning, we had the money and everything. They put a hold on my car for no reason at all. It was \$250, also the officer personally gave me his number to get it removed but he only pulled me over because somebody that was involved in something else that didn't have anything to do with me. We had no weapons, they searched my car. When we got to the pond they wouldn't let me get my registration out the car.

\_\_\_\_\_, First of all, I want to take the time to introduce who I am and also it's very important what I'm getting ready to say to everybody on this audience. Especially you Commissioners. I am a Minister of the Gospel and I have never seen the travesty of leadership among the civil to restraint and to regulate the force. I'm going to have a woman stand, her name is Mrs. Harris, please, Mrs. Harris stand please. This senior was at the charter meeting and she was expressing her constitutional right for displeasure of the process. She was put out of the meeting and surround with, at least, by 10 to 12 bigger officers. Now if she would've had a cardiac arrest let me tell you something, you'd be dealing with all the citizens of men who are saying you're dealing with my mama, my aunt, my sister, and my daughter. Know to whom much is given, it is required. And know that we gonna demand the top type of leadership that will allow our citizens to live in peace. And we will not have this type of unregulated policies and being able not to live peacefully in our meetings. We have the right to culturally express without intimidation. Know that, because if you don't know it there is one that sits high, he will make sure you know it.

**Maryland Jordan:** My name is Maryland Jordan, I came in disguise this evening but I'm gonna remove my glasses so that you can see my face. You got sworn in this evening Ms. Chair, but I'm gonna let you know something. You have to give us our respect. You can come in real bulldoggish but we know how to bark as well. This meeting, you can call out whoever you want to call out, you were appointed or elected and I have said it before, you think this group here is something, you don't know us very well, we will get you out. One way or another, and we will be respected at these meetings and you will not turn our police officers against us, because they will get it one way or another. Detroit People's Task Force.

**Crystal Bonner:** Hi my name is Crystal Bonner, retired Detroit Public School teacher, current employee with the department of health and human services as a special-education teacher. This is my first time coming to this meeting and I was disgusted. Absolutely disgusted. How dare a commissioner that was elected, be pulled out of here I'm that kind of disgraceful way. I thought the Commissioners' job was to serve the people. Am I mistaken? It doesn't seem like any regard is given to the citizens. And then for you lady in the red there threatening to throw me out, yea, she threatened to throw me out, how dare you. And I was mistaken to say that Willie Burton was my representative but it's actually you Mr. William Bell. I did not know this is how you operated, this is my first time coming to this meeting and this is rather disgusting. I came here to talk about how the police officers were guarding these Nazi people marching during the pride week. That is, that is not a violation of the 1st amendment right to remove them. Ok, because that organization is guilty of killing millions of Jews in Germany. And they're guilty of killing millions of black people right here in the United States. Whenever they try to march, you need to get the little van out there and you need to put their asses in there. That's what you should do. Don't you dare ever, in this country, especially the black city of Detroit. You're gonna let these racist dogs who are responsible for lynching people, some of them our relatives, march? How dare you, how dare you. It's a disrespect. That's what I came here to talk about. But seeing this display of this man being dragged out of here is crazy. And then being threatened to be thrown out by you. How dare you, you guys are supposed to serve us. Serve us. You can sit there with a smirk on your face if you want to lady, but you are wrong as two left shoes. And I am ashamed of you.

**Tonya Ellis:** I'm Tonya Ellis and I was here before, the same thing that young lady is here about. Where they just took my car and no reason at all. This is total disrespect to us, you didn't come here to protect and serve us. You came here to nail us as black people and people of color, jail us, and bail us. That's what your mission is that's why you don't live in this city because you don't give a rat's ass about us. You came to put us in that plantation called that prison. You come after we dead, if you came in our neighborhoods, you already got cameras. You got them on your badge, on your bodies, and you got them on your cars. You go by any of these police stations and all the cars is sitting up there in the lot. You get your tail feathers in these cars and start payroll our neighborhood where our houses are then we'll be safe. Your intention is not for us to be safe, your intention is for, to kill us every single day and put us in a bag and it's all good. That's the intention for these people because it the colonialism for us. Peace.

**Barbara Wynder:** Good after my name is Barbra Wynder, I'm a member of the Detroit Charter Commission. And I'm looking at the commission here and most of your faces seem to reflect that you are at least comparable to my age, and if not you certainly are old enough to remember the establishment of this commission. And this Commission was established because of reasons like

the police officers exercised earlier tonight in taking this commissioner out. I am incensed that a Board that represents the people would treat their comrades that way, your colleague that way. Simply because he was articulating what he thinks is his right to express. If the idea is to control the room, and I know that several of you know what control the room means because I know several of you who are sitting there and you know me. I will not say who you are, but if the idea is to control the room then bring the person out and control the room. You don't have to drag people out and arrest them. That is so demeaning and humiliating. Shame on you. The next thing that I want to say, and I'll be conscious of my time, is that I came here this afternoon to advise you to be alert because at the Charter Commission meeting, the rules and the constitution have been suspended. But I see that they've been suspended here as well so you must already know about it, I'm not bringing you any news. I would like however to piggy back on, what brother Eric had to say about the real problems. The real problems that nobody wants to solve is that people need jobs, people need work. I know finding jobs is not your position, but you need to talk to the people who are in your ear and let them know that that is what the need is. The need is jobs. If people are employed and going to work every day, as you know from the history of your parents my parents and your grandparents. You know that people who are busy and working everyday don't have time for crime, and they don't commit crimes. Thank you very much.

**Kenny Holloway:** Hi my name is Kenny Holloway, I'm very ashamed of all you guys because you in the position you in because of Coleman A. Young. Y'all got these jobs because of Coleman. Willie Bell, you know what it was like back in the 60s with STRESS and big 4 was out there whooping on black folk. And you guys turn around and turn your backs on us. You just as bad as they was. The lady in the red, I was up there talking she rolling her eyes and titles don't make you. So I want y'all to know that just because y'all have a title or a diploma. Because we got a lot of educated fools out here. So don't think you more than what we is. Because today you could be working and tomorrow you'll be like the rest of us out here. And it's sad that y'all don't support, as much as black folks been through, Y'all turn y'all backs, and still going through, y'all turn y'all back on us like we're nobody. How can y'all go home and live with y'all self. Y'all must don't have conscious. It's sad that y'all like that, it's very sad that y'all do that. You treat your own people like that. Let it be one of your kids. I lost a daughter you all know I talked before. Let it be one of yo kids out there, we got all these officers in here when they should be out there. I don't even see them in our neighborhoods. They don't even ride through there unless they chasing somebody and the precinct right around the corner. Y'all sad, y'all really are. I'm ashamed at how they tested us at the Charter Commission meeting and y'all act like it was nothing. We had all them officers over there telling us we can't talk. We ain't kids, we should be able to come and speak our mind. It's sad that y'all like that. And I know that y'all might not pay me no attention but y'all better pay god some attention because we his kids too. Y'all better watch out because you do us wrong it'll come back on you. You starting something, these young folks don't care about the streets, that's why they did what they did on the Lodge. And y'all fueling it up, fueling all this up. We don't want no another 67 riots. We don't want it and these young folks not scared of y'all, the police or nobody else. So y'all better wake up and smell the coffee.

**Malik Shelton:** My name is Malik Shelton and I'm a journalist for the Telegram newspaper. I just like to say that in all the years I've lived in Detroit I've never saw something so egregious. I mean it's like watching a d Nazi movie or something. How can the people in the city of Detroit have confidence in the Board of Police Commissioners when you sit there and allow one of your own members to be bum rushed and dragged out simply because they were speaking their mind? But at the same time you allow Neo-Nazi to march downtown escorted by the police while they make terrorist threats and actually do assault people. One of them assaulted a woman pushed her on the ground. This goes hand and hand with the facial recognition technology. When I was in high school I read a book called 1984 by George Orwell. And I was terrified by that. What's going on right now I'm this city is far worse than what happened in that novel in 1984. And all of you you're sitting up here in your positions, if you allow it to happen to other people, What makes you think it's not going to happen to you when you begin to express yourself? And those who are in position of power and author don't like what you saying. You can get dragged out of here and dragged to jail also. I've lived under several administrations in the city of Detroit, under several mayors. Mayor Young, Mayor Archer, Mayor Kwame Kilpatrick and Mayor Bing. But I have not seen even under none of those mayors, some of the outrageous acts that have been occurring lately in terms of assaulting the citizens of the city of Detroit. Could it be, could it have something to do with the current mayor? I'll let the people answer that question because ever since Dugan's been in office I been seeing some bad things going on in here, City of Detroit.

**Anna Crool:** Hi my name is Anna Crool, I live in the 5th district, I am taking off my disguise that is in protest of facial recognition. We all know that Project GreenLight was the implantation of the facial recognition program. It has been running, other people have shown evidence right here at this podium. I would like to continue what the gentleman was talking about. My friend Jessica was the lady that was pushed to the ground by the leader of the national socialist movement. The police did not arrest her for assault. But they just arrested Willie Bell after he was duly recognized by the chair. She didn't like what he was saying so she had him arrested, just like the Dugan 6 didn't like what Demeko was saying just the other day at the Charter Commission meeting.

Nazi's were allowed in the city of Detroit even after thorough investigation by the FBI because there was clear and present imminent danger posted all over social media by the national socialist movement. They said they were coming in to shoot up PRIDE. Craig did not share that information with the city council, he did not share that information with the public. He had every reason to say no you are not allowed in our city. But he is following Dugan's rules, that lets let the Nazis come in and shoot up PRIDE. That's my statement, I am a community activist. I live in Lafayette Park, and I have watched the police not arrest people seeding down Lafayette.

**Nicole Small:** My name is Nicole Small and I came here today in opposition of the facial recognition but after what has happened today I'm quite sure you don't really care about my opinion on facial recognition. I look at this board right now and I know a few of you were a part of the civil rights movement. And you turn around on sold standing on the shoulders of the sacrifices of those before you. You're going to sacrifice your own. And each and every one of you who sat here today and watched one of your colleagues be removed and thrown on the floor and arrested, how dare you. I have zero respect for that, zero respect for that. Each and every one of you, all the time I hear about the Charter Commission, they need to work together, you need to work together. You could've taken a recess, there were several other options but instead you had him removed. We had several members of the community in attendance at that Charter Commission meeting removed the other day. One not only being Meko Williams but another being mama Clementine. You're talking about a woman maybe standing 5 foot 1, 5 foot 2, less than 120 pounds. And you had over 12 police officers surrounding her, about to handcuff her. And even when they decided to escort her downstairs, there were 3 large men in the elevator with her alone. They wouldn't even let another senior citizen get in the elevator. You think about if that was your mother or grandmother how you would feel about that. Something needs to be done. If you don't do something about it, the people gone do something about it. And you don't have enough police officers, I can tell you that right now, because you're recruiting rate is not the best. You don't have enough police officers. We are not going to allow you to just come into our communities and tear us apart. I have witnessed many crimes in the city of Detroit and I have never seen you over police any of those crimes having officers come out. It's always about somebody driving, or now we coming to the community meetings striping is of our rights. This is deplorable behavior and shame on you that this is your first meeting and this is what you do.

**Clementine Harris:** My name is Dr. Clementine Harris, I was at the Charter meeting the other night. I felt victimized, dehumanized, because I was trying to voice my opinion and my disapproval of the way things were going with Carol, with the Commissioner, the Chair. I was escorted out, she said, "this is your second time", she pointed at me directly, personal. That's a code word that mean get her, take her out. You know, this is your second time. I'm a property owner here, I pay taxes, I'm a citizen of Detroit, I'm a teacher, I do volunteer teaching for my students. Trying to raise the 3rd grade scores, but get and still I'm thrown out as a citizen, to express my opinion, this is what I get. I felt very very. Yea I know I get full. Because I was so traumatized, I did not start to come today because the police officer, the blue I saw all around me was blue. I was trying to deal with this, I can't sleep at night. All this around was blue blue. As though I have a gun or something you know. Blue all around, would not even allow me to get my friend, a person who was riding with me, to give her the keys. The other police officer caught my hand, "you're under arrest give me your arm." All of this for what did I do? What did I do? Because I disagreed with the Chair person, and you gonna lock me up and pin me down.

**Michelle George:** Good evening to Chairwoman. This meeting, we, see I think we are in an apartheid system right now in Africa. But to the Chair Carter, and to the Commission, and to the deputy Chief LeValley, I just want to say that the issue is with the facial recognition, I would like a yes or no answer if you could just do it briefly, is this board going to decide to have facial recognition? And the reason I asked that is because I was at a city council meeting and they mentioned a republican in the state of Michigan, A legislature, he's banning facial recognition in the state of Michigan. So if this board continue, if you have facial recognition we're gonna have to file a, I hate to say this, we're gonna have to file a civil rights lawsuit against you. Because of that disparity. So if the Legislature did that, I'd behoove to you not to do that. Also, I want to talk about the law enforcement program that I hope that it would continue, because the young man I mentioned before I spoke to at the school board meeting. There's money out there we would just have to talk with Dr. Vitti to make sure that program continues. Not just in one school, in all schools. Also, I want to talk about the investigation. The investigation where the 14yr old veteran, the African American was accosted by his colleague and in handcuffs. Is that case being investigated? The reason I said that is because at the last police commissioners meeting there was a presentation on the integrity unit with Police and drugs and I just felt that was a cover up not to bring up the case what is happening with that officer. But what I'm trying to say to you all is that Detroit is right under an apartheid system. We're in a constitutional crisis. Because at that Charter Commission you have people with emergency management, the tentacles are across this city. So as the citizens you are seeing a civil unrest. Dr. King talked about that. And citizens are not going to stand by and allow you to discriminate. So we will move with that civil rights complaint. Thank you.

**Tahara Ahmed:** good evening my name is Tahara Ahmed and I am protesting the facial recognition. So I'm wearing a mask that I created and I'll be making many more. Especially if you pass this illegal, unconstitutional law. I am disgusted, first meeting here for the Board of Police Commissioners and I watch you wrestle, watch the police wrestle Willie Burton down and drag him out in handcuffs. This is disgusting man, I'm telling you, we looking at a new fascism in Detroit made Mayor Dugan and his cohorts. I'd like to let police Chief Craig know that your time is up. You were appointed by the emergency manager Kevin Orr. And you have been acting just like Kevin want you to act. You have not been supervising your police officers, it's been incident after Incident in which police officer were fighting each other on an undercover issue. There's another incident where 2 people die because the police officer was chasing them, and they broke the chase off and watched them crash into a tree and never got them medical care. I'm disgusted because this is a new police state and what we're going to do is have civil disobedience in this city. I grew up down the street on Elmhurst and Linwood in 1967 when we got invaded by the police and the army in which they began shooting in our house. We lived on the top floor and we had to sleep with the TV on the floor as little kids. It is no different than that time. And I am saying and vowing to all my fellow citizens we will start civil disobedience this year in 2019 to represent our disgust and take over our city again.

**Buela Walker:** Hi good evening everyone my name is Buela Walker. I am the Chief Coordinator of Hydrate Detroit, and what we do at hydrate Detroit, since 2014, we wrestle with the Detroit water and sewage department about the high ass water rates. And I came here today to let all of you know that I am very disgusted about the arrest of my colleague and my brother Demeko Williams at the charter meeting. Where he has founded Hydrate Detroit we all use the water. Everybody up there uses the water. And my friend my brother who has been there for me since 2014, was arrested for speaking out against the comradery here in the city of Detroit. Here at Hydrate Detroit we have witnessed death and destruction of people not living without running water. So I tell you what here on this board, you want to police my brother, Demeko Williams. You keep policing him who's going to go down and tell Gary Brown to stop going up on the high ass water rates. And if I was there you probably would've took me too because him and me is like salt and pepper. So again I say to you, you come down to the Charter meetings, you got Hydrate Detroit and a lot of other water organizations who are fighting them high ass water rates. We have lost count to how high the water rates keep going. And if you lock Buela Walker up and Demeko Williams, who's gonna fight for you to take a fucking bath. Because ain't nobody else gonna do it. So I tell you be mindful of who you locking up and arresting because once you lock up all the grassroots activists, Mike Dugan, just like trump did, is out the White House. So I just want you to know that I am highly disgusted with you locking my brother Demeko Williams up. He is my friend.

**D'Etta Wilcoxson:** Board of Police Commissioners I am D'Etta Wilcoxson, I have gone on record indicating that I am diametrically opposes to facial recognition. I told you in capsule form why I was opposed to it. One, we as Americans are entitled to the presumption of innocence, we are not required to prove we are innocent. The government is required to prove that we are guilty. And if facial recognition is in place in the city of Detroit, it means our constitutional rights are being violated. Secondly, the research indicates that facial recognition has a very high probability of inaccuracy as it relates to African Americans in particular. I'm here this evening to ask a question of the police department. And I'm really talking to the record, because I think the record needs to reflect that there were conscious Detroiters at this particular point in our history who raised what we regard as relevant issues. One, if there is no policy that has been approved by this Board for facial recognition for the police department, and the city council has not approved monies for the facial recognition. How is it according to the reports that facial recognition has been in place in the city of Detroit for more than a year. How is that? I also understand based on the research, that there are reports indicating that our city received a grant for facial recognition purposes. You cannot impose a grant on the people without it going through proper procedures and proper procedures, as it has been laid out by this Board, is for you to approve the policy and then pass it on to the city council. You have not done that. The record needs to reflect that you have a job to do and we expect you to do it according to the dictates of your service.

**Peter Rhoades:** My name is Peter Rhodes and currently I'm the last speaker. Last time I was here about 6 months ago I got a homework assignment about recreational marijuana use and I turned in my homework assignment, answered questions and I have an update. The Greenacre's Woodward Civic Association still wants overlay zoning along 8 mile. We want a hard cap of 28 facilities city wide. We want strong licensing, we want a strong police unit to supervise it. And we also want community benefits. If you had 28 recreational marijuana facilities, each chipping in at least \$50,000 to community benefits to solve the problems that the people in the town hall meeting decide they want to address in a church or nonprofit that they choose, you would have \$1.4 million to solve that problem. That's a good thing. Now the state of Michigan has new emergency rules that just came out, they take effect November 1st. City council has to act before November 1st and have everything in place or it's gonna be too late. If the Detroit police department and the Board of Police Commissioners want to add or chip in their comments for recreational marijuana, now is the time. Don't wait until October because that'll be too late. Also city council Member Tate is truly an

obstructionist concerning everything concerning the marijuana industry. Good luck. But I finished within 2 minutes that means I get a slice of cake. Thank you.

**Chairperson Carter:** Indicating that if there is no other business before the Board he would accept a motion to adjourn. **Motion to Adjourn, Dewaelsche, Griffie, Second.**

**Motion to Adjourn.** Chairperson Carter adjourned the meeting at 8:38 PM.