

**Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners**

**Date of Meeting: May 30, 2019 – 3:00 PM**

Location: Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street, Detroit, MI 48226

**BOPC Chair Willie Bell called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (May 30, 2019)**

Detroit Police Commission Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Willie E. Bell, Chairperson	Yes	
Darryl D. Brown, Vice Chairperson	Yes	
Lisa Carter	Excused	
Elizabeth Brooks	Yes	
Eva Garza Dewaelsche	Excused	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Excused	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Jim Holley	Excused	
Evette Griffie	Excused	
Annie Mae Holt	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	6	

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for May 30, 2019.**

**The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes:  
Thursday, May 23, 2019**

**Chairman Willie Bell** said “Good Afternoon! I am Police Commissioner Willie Bell, I represent District #4. I serve as the Chair of the Board and will be conducting our meeting today. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance, thank you for joining us. For people viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for viewing our meeting. Commissioners Lisa Carter, Eva Garza Dewaelsche and Evette Griffie are attending the Mackinac Policy Conference representing their respective organizations and have asked to be excused from today’s meeting. Commissioners Jim Holley and Willie Burton have also asked to be excused. Today, we have invited Chaplain Derrick Hayes to provide the invocation.” Chaplain Derrick Hayes provided the invocation.

**Chairperson’s Report – Willie Bell** said “On behalf of the Board, I want to express our concern and support for fallen and injured officers. Our concerns for officer safety and citizen protection is ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers. I would ask Assistant Chief of Police James White during his remarks to provide us with any additional information related to injured and fallen officers.

The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas Holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters 3 weeks in the month on Thursdays at 3:00 PM. We also meet in the community every 2<sup>nd</sup> Thursday of the month at 6:30 PM.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our citizens are justified in asking “How does civilian oversight of law enforcement help you as a citizen within our community?” Our answer is, we protect the civil rights of citizens. Oversight organizations like the BOPC are at the forefront of investigating, reviewing and auditing individual cases of citizen complaints and patterns of operations by police agencies to eliminate misconduct, discriminatory police practices and unnecessary use of force by police. Our work is based on developing and supporting effective policing. Mutual trust and respect between the police and the community is critical toward increasing the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit. The Board of Police Commissioners exists to provide civilian oversight for the work of the Detroit Police Department. As a Board, we receive and investigate non-criminal citizens’ complaints, monitor the operations of the Department and work with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to make or modify police policy.

I want to point to several important items for your consideration and information. Again, I remind the Board, we are continuing to work with NACOLE (National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) to host the National Conference on September 22 thru 26, 2019 in Detroit. During the same time, Detroit will be celebrating our 45<sup>th</sup> year as a civilian oversight

organization on July 22, 2019. We are inviting law-enforcement and other civic minded individuals and organizations to join us at the conference. The planning process is well underway, and again we invite your participation. I want to again, thank Commissioner Elizabeth Brooks for her comprehensive report at our last meeting on NACOLE and the BOPC 45<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Dinner.

Typically, I provide some historical facts about the importance of the day in history. These facts give context to our work and reminds us of the contributions made by others. I am inspired by the work of many others who have come before me. One example of the spirit of volunteerism is shown in the work of Detroit City Council President Pro-Tem Mary Sheffield's grandfather, the late Horace Sheffield. Horace Sheffield was an African American labor leader who helped many black youth enter the automobile industry and trade unions by setting up a tutorial program at the Trade Union Leadership Council (TULC). On this day in history, Horace Sheffield was named to the Executive Committee of the Negro American Labor Council and would later be named as an International Vice President of the United Automobile Workers Union (UAW). Horace Sheffield is in part responsible for a long legacy of Black leadership in Detroit. Additionally, I want to note that on this day in history, according to Ken Coleman, a noted journalist and researcher on the history of Black Detroit. In 1987, the National Museum of the Tuskegee Airmen was opened at Historic Fort Wayne on Jefferson Avenue in Detroit. The Tuskegee Airmen are known for their bravery and their focus on defeating enemy forces in the many air battles during World War II. The *Tuskegee Airmen* were the first black military aviators in the U.S. Army Air Corps (AAC), a precursor of the U.S. Air Force. Trained at the *Tuskegee* Army Air Field in Alabama, they flew more than 15,000 individual sorties in Europe and North Africa during World War II. Some of the most famous members of the Tuskegee Airmen include Benjamin O. Davis Jr., Daniel "Chappie" James and Coleman A. Young Sr. Again, these historical events set the context for our work.

Today, we have two action items on the agenda. The first is a resolution honoring the life and service to the community of Bishop Sidney C. Griffin. Commissioner Shirley Burch requested this resolution and will read it into the record at the appropriate time. The second action item is a request from the Chief of Police James Craig to promote Captain Kari Sloan to the rank of Commander. A copy of the request for this promotion was included in your Tuesday package. I would ask that at the end of the Chair's report, that one of the Commissioners in attendance move this promotion.

We have three presentations today. The first is the review of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter Budget of the Detroit Police Department. I understand that DPD has a new Agency Chief Financial Officer (CFO), who will be making this presentation. The name of the new DPD Agency CFO is Nevrus Nazarko. The second presentation will be on proposed directive 307.06 - Use of Traffic Light-Mount Cameras and Facial Recognition Technology. You may recall that Mayor Mike Duggan announced as part of his State of the City address that the City would begin to use this advance surveillance technology. The Chief of Police has submitted a proposed directive for our review to integrate this technology into the work of the Department. The presentation today, is NOT an opportunity to vote on the directive, instead it is a request that I made to have the Department present to the Board the directive in advance of our next community meeting. At the next community meeting, scheduled for June 13, 2019, we want to hear from the community about their concerns related to the Department's use of advance surveillance technology. This will in fact be the BOPC's public hearing on advance surveillance technology. Again, this hearing is scheduled for June 13, 2019 at St. John Lutheran Church located at 4950 Oakman Boulevard, Northwest Detroit, in the 2<sup>nd</sup> Police Precinct. The third presentation today will be the monthly report from the Office of the Chief Investigator who will summarize the citizen complaints filed with OCI. Dr. Polly McCalister will make the OCI presentation.

Under the DPD Chief's Report, I am requesting an update on our crime statistics and any critical issues facing the Police Department.

At the end of the meeting we will have public comments from the audience. Please make sure you print your name on a speaker's card. Cards are located in the back on the table or can be obtained by seeing Mr. Robert Brown. He will need your card before the beginning of public comments. We will hold each speaker to the allotted 2 minutes. I ask that everyone turn off your cell phones and other electronic devices. This request does not include the devices held by DPD personnel as many of you are on emergency standby. I ask DPD personnel to put their phone on vibrate so that ringing phones will not interrupt our meeting.

**Commissioner Shirley Burch** read into the record a resolution honoring the work and life of Bishop Sidney C. Griffin (Posthumously).

#### **RESOLUTION HONORING BISHOP SIDNEY C. GRIFFIN, SR**

**WHEREAS** Bishop Dr. Sidney C. Griffin, Sr. has served, since 1986 as Pastor of Pilgrim Baptist Church, located in Detroit, Michigan. In the ministry over 33 years, he is a powerful man of God, as he spread the gospel throughout the country. In 1977, he married the lady that God created just for him, Reverend Dr. Yvette Griffin; and

**WHEREAS** Bishop Griffin, Sr. served on several religious, civic and community organizations, including several that have been important partners to the Board of Police Commissioners in the area of public safety and justice. He was a member the Council of Baptist Pastors of Detroit and Vicinity, Inc., past Chairman of the Pastoral Care Committee, Vice President of the Common Word Alliance, Clergy United, NAACP, Black United Fund, Youth Volunteer Community Service, Fundamental Fairness, United Way and Chairman of the Board of Clear Purpose Foundation; and

**WHEREAS** Bishop Griffin, Sr. was elected and re-elected and served faithfully for six years as Moderator of the Metropolitan Missionary Baptist District Association and Auxiliaries from 2005 to 2011; and

**WHEREAS** Bishop Griffin, Sr. was educated in the Detroit Public School System graduating from Northern High School. He graduated from the University of Detroit (Magna Cum Laude), the Detroit Urban Institute with a Doctor Divinity Degree, and in 1988, he received an Honorary Doctorate of Humanities. Also, in 1988 he organized a community-based program of Pilgrim, called Survival Inc. Under his pastorate, many people have come to know and love Jesus Christ as their savior and confidante. He touched many lives during his life; and

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners speaking for the citizens of the city of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department acknowledges the dedication and service of Bishop Dr. Sidney C. Griffin, Sr. His love for people, vibrant spirit, and courageous voice to ministry has been an inspiration to all. He will be greatly missed by the greater Detroit community, and we extend condolences to his family and loved ones. **DETROIT BOARD OF POLICE COMMISSIONERS**

**Commissioner Darryl Brown** moved the resolution honoring the work and life of Bishop Sidney C. Griffin (Posthumously).

**Commissioner William Davis, Second.**

**VOTE – Yes = 6, No = 0, MOTION APPROVED**

**Commissioner Annie Holt** moved to support the Chief of Police's recommendation to promote **Captain Kari Sloan** to the rank of Commander. **Commissioner William Davis, Second.**

**VOTE – Yes = 6, No = 0, MOTION APPROVED**

**COP Police Report: Assistant Chief of Police James White** representing Chief of Police James Craig reported that crime is continuing to trend downward as against last year. Assistant Chief James White reported crime and Statistical data utilizing DPD Department report dated May 30, 2019. Assistant Chief White reported year-to date data by category including, -11% decrease in Homicides, Sexual Assaults 13% increase, Aggravated Assaults -5% decrease, non-fatal shootings -2% decrease, Robbery -10% decrease, Carjacking -40% decrease, Burglary -6% decrease, Larceny -5% decrease, Stolen Vehicle -5% decrease and Part 1 offenses -5% decrease. AC White reported on injured officers and their respective conditions. White also highlighted June 7, 2019 ribbon cutting of the remodel physical fitness facilities at the Detroit Police Academy and a special event entitled the Run across Michigan to honor injured officers. Responding to Commissioner's inquiries AC White also reported on various incidents including an auto related incident in Highland Park, MI resulting from a drag race, a carjacking that took place on May 27<sup>th</sup> involving an army veteran and concerns expressed by Commissioner Davis about "street walkers in northwest Detroit.

- Presentations to the Board: (A) Budget Report / DPD Fiscal: Quarter #3, Nevrus Nazarko**  
**(B) Proposed Directive 307.6 Use of Traffic Mount Cameras and Facial Recognition Technology**  
**(C) OCI Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallister, OCI Chief Investigator**

**(A) Budget Report / DPD Fiscal: Quarter #3, Nevrus Nazarko** reported on Overall, 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter Budget Variance –Revenues, (\$26,486,640) or (60.8%), Expenditures, \$20,780,435 or (8.7%). Third Quarter to Annual Amended Budget Variance, Revenue (29.2%, Expenditures, 69.1%. Annualized Revenue and Expenditures Projections, Revenue, \$60,784,000 (Variance = \$2,259,586), Expenditures, \$314,844,863 (Variance = \$92,307).

Type	Annualized 2019 Amended	Annualized 2019 Projected	Variance
Salary & Wages	\$ 213,074,975	\$ 214,269,201	(\$ 1,194,226)
Benefits	\$ 56,975,887	\$ 57,295,584	( \$319,697)
Professional Contract Serv.	\$ 4,830,993	\$ 4,650,762	\$ 180,231
Operating Supplies	\$ 6,676,516	\$ 6,675,516	\$ 0
Operating Services	\$ 24,459,767	\$ 23,697,767	\$ 762,000
Capital Equipment	\$ 986,954	\$ 986,954	\$ 0
Capital Outlays	\$ 969,502	\$ 962,502	\$ 0
Other Expenses	\$ 6,963,577	\$ 6,299,577	\$ 664,000
<b>Total Expenditures</b>	<b>\$ 314,937,171</b>	<b>\$ 314,844,863</b>	<b>\$ 92,307</b>

Mr. Nazarko indicated that the variances are largely due to salary, wages and benefits (\$1,513,924) and Operating Expenditures \$1,606,321. Mr. Nararko also indicated that the tax collections cycle were also responsible for the low revenues (Municipal Income Tax \$23.7 Million) and the city project a increase of \$2.4 increase in the Utilities User's Tax. Mr. Narzarko also reported on Forfeiture Income for the 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter (\$55,000) federal, \$1.3 Million local (Wayne County).

Mr. Nararko also agreed to provide the Board with a copy of his presentation, a list of equipment purchases, notifications of budget amendments, an updated grant schedule and a list of the capital revisions by police precinct.

**(B) Proposed Directive 307.6 Use of Traffic Mount Cameras and Facial Recognition Technology, AC James White, Neil Tamble and Sergeant Rommel** each emphasized cameras are a valuable tool to improve safety for residents. Sgt. Rommel identified for uses of cameras (1) support criminal investigations and improve quality of life (2) conduct virtual patrols (3) provide situational awareness to first responders and (4) request the public's help to identify suspects.

DPD Members Can in utilizing cameras	DPD Members Cannot in utilizing cameras
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use cameras legitimate law enforcement purposes</li> <li>- investigations / criminal activity</li> <li>- pursuit</li> <li>- monitor ongoing situation in which criminal activity is or reasonably expected to occur</li> <li>• Create or analyze intelligence gathered from cameras after establishing reasonable suspicion</li> <li>• Comply with federal, state and local law</li> <li>• Delete video images within 30 days unless pending litigation compels keeping the video</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use footage to enforce non-criminal traffic, pedestrian and or civil infractions</li> <li>• Assess immigration status/engage in immigration enforcement</li> <li>• Use facial recognition unless there is reasonable suspicion unless use is relevant to an active investigation</li> <li>• Use facial recognition with live video streams</li> </ul>

**(C) OCI Monthly Report, Dr. Polly McCallster,** reported from April 2019 OCI accepted and processed 87 citizen complaints. OCI has received 111 complaints in April 2019 as compared to 79 in March 2018, by allegations - use of profanity, incident involving "hit & run" incidents, and electronic evidence (Body Worn Cameras and Electronic Control Weapons). McCallster also reported on false allegations via Body Worn Cameras. Below, please see a table for closed March 2019 Citizen Complaints.

72 OCI CCRs CLOSED – April 2019						
106 ALLEGATIONS' FINDINGS						
Allegation	Total	Admin_ Closure (27%)	Exonerated (16%)	Inconclusive (19%)	Sustained (16%)	Unfounded (22%)
Arrest (1%)	6	3	3	0	0	0
Demeanor (24%)	31	5	1	10	8	7
Entry (1%)	1	0	1	0	0	0
Force (3%)	5	1	0	2	0	2
Harassment (2%)	5	1	0	2	0	2
Procedure (43%)	42	11	9	4	9	9
Property (6%)	3	1	1	0	0	1
Search (1%)	1	0	1	0	0	0
Service (18%)	12	7	1	2	0	2
Total (135 CCRs Closed)	106	29	17	20	17	23

**BOPC Standing Committee Reports: None.**

**Report from Secretary to the Board: Mr. Hicks** presented and summarized 2 items as incoming items into the BOPC on the agenda as follows,

1. Communication from Chief re: Proposal for Detroit's renewal, Protection and Gain.

2. DPD Fiscal, 3rd Quarter.

**Old Business: None**

**New Business: None.**

**Announcements:** The next regular BOPC meeting is scheduled for June 6, 2019 @ 3:00 PM at Detroit Public Safety Headquarters, 1301 Third Street, Detroit, MI 48226. The next month's Community Meeting is scheduled for 6:30 PM June 13, 2019 at St. John Lutheran Church (2<sup>nd</sup> Precinct) located at 4950 Oakman Boulevard, Detroit, MI 48204.

**Oral Communications – Public Comment.** **Ms. Faith** reminded the Board of the words of former Commissioner Crawford, there are no broken people and asked if a person has knowledge of a un-safe neighborhood or location who should they contact? Referred to Commander Hayes. **Alvin Stokes** thanks the Chaplain Corp and provided the name of P.O. Harris who is planning a September retirement. Mr. Stokes requested a resolution to honor the service of the officer. **Eric Blount** expressed concerns about facial recognition technology as discussed in the presentation. He indicated that such technology could be used to negatively impact issues of immigration, race and other biases. Mr. Blount also inquired into the policy of DPD regarding tattoos. **Scotty Bowman** indicated that video of the May 15, May 22 and April 4 BOPC meetings have recording difficulties. He also objected to the use of facial recognition technology.

**Motion to Adjourn.** **Chairman Bell** adjourned the meeting at 4:42 PM.