



City of Detroit
OFFICE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL
2 WOODWARD AVENUE, SUITE 216
Detroit, Michigan 48226
PHONE: (313) 224-4558
FAX: (313) 224-4091
markl@detroitmi.gov

Mark W. Lockridge, CPA
Auditor General

MEMORANDUM

DATE: February 15, 2017

TO: Honorable City Council
Honorable Mayor Mike Duggan

FROM: Mark W. Lockridge, CPA
Auditor General

RE: Council Special Report on City Vehicles

CC: Aliyah S. Sabree, Esq., City Council Liaison Stephanie Washington, City Council Liaison

Attached for your review is our Special Report on City Vehicles. On September 7, 2016, the Budget, Finance and Audit Standing Committee sent a Memorandum from Council Member Janee' Ayers requesting "the Office of the Auditor General provide an audit of city vehicles assigned to city employees and what the reasoning is for why a car is warranted for each position receiving one."

In response, the Office of the Auditor General conducted a review of city vehicles assigned to individuals. This memorandum serves to provide your Honorable Body with the results of our review.

The objectives of our examination were to determine:

- City vehicles assigned to City employees; and
- What the reasoning is for why a car is warranted for each position receiving one.

To achieve our objectives we requested every City department provide us with the following information:

- A list of vehicles issued to your department. The list should include whether the vehicle is assigned to an individual or is a "pool" vehicle that can be used

by anyone within the department, the make, model, year, vehicle identification number (VIN), and City asset number.

- If a vehicle is assigned to an individual, include the individual's name, title and the reason why they need a City vehicle assigned to them as part of their job responsibilities.
- The list of vehicles would not include ambulances, fire trucks, under cover vehicles or police cars assigned as pool vehicles.

In addition, we; interviewed key personnel, examined other pertinent documents and performed random site visits for verification of vehicles.

Table A summarizes the Department's information concerning vehicles that are not specialized vehicles such as ambulances, police cars, etc. Table B is a list of individuals that have been assigned vehicles per their Department.

TABLE A – Summary of Vehicles Reported by Department					
DEPARTMENT/AREA	City Vehicles		Total Number of Vehicles	Number of Pool Vehicles	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals
	Yes	No			
36th District Court	X		2	2	0
Airport	X		6	6	0
Animal Care and Control	X		6	6	0
City Clerk	X		2	0	2
Election Commission	X		6	4	2
City Council	X		9	0	9
Department of Innovations and Technology	X		4	4	0
Department of Public Works	X		137	95	42
Department of Transportation (DDOT)	X		105	83	22
Detroit Police Department	X		73	0	73
Detroit Recreation Department	X		25	24	1
Detroit Water and Sewage Department	X		412	408	4
Fire Department	X		19	0	19
General Services	X		218	186	32
Housing & Revitalization Department	X		1	1	0
Law Department	X		1	0	1
Mayor's Office	X		1	0	1
Municipal Parking Department	X		88	88	0
Office of the Inspector General	X		1	1	0
Office of the CFO	X		3	3	0
Planning & Development Department	X		1	1	0
Public Health	X		6	6	0
Public Lighting Department	X		7	7	0
Building Safety Engineering		X			
Dept. of Administrative Hearings		X			
Greater Detroit Resource Recovery Auth.		X			
Human Resources & Labor Relations		X			
Human Rights		X			
Office of the Ombudsman		X			
Office of the Auditor General		X			
Zoning Appeals		X			
TOTALS			1133	925	208

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
City Clerk				
	1	J. Winfrey	City Clerk	To conduct City clerk business and administration of the Department of Elections
	1	V. Hudson	Deputy Clerk	This is a "pool vehicle" accessible by clerk personnel. Assigned to conduct City Clerk business.
TOTAL VEHICLES	2			
Election Commission				
	1	D. Baxter	Director	This is a "pool vehicle" accessible by Elections personnel. Assigned to conduct Elections business.
	1	G. Avery	Deputy Director	This is a "pool vehicle" accessible by Elections personnel. Assigned to conduct Elections business.
TOTAL VEHICLES	2			
City Council				
	1	B. Jones	Council President	To service constituents throughout the City of Detroit and on call 24/7.
	1	J. Ayers	Council Member	To service constituents throughout the City of Detroit and on call 24/7.
	1	J. Tale	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.
	1	S. Benson	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	A. Spivey	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.
	1	M. Sheffield	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.
	1	R. Castaneda-Lopez	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.
	1	R. Castaneda-Lopez	Council Member	Mobile Office Unit - to provide services to citizens in District 6.
	1	G. Leland	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.
TOTAL VEHICLES	9			
Department of Public Works				GETTING CLARIFICATION OF THEIR LIST
		D. Ford		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
		J. Schneider		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
		H. Crumpler		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
		A. Shaukai		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	L. Anderson, City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	D. Chieu Doung City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	G. Winston City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	T. Ansari City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	L. Kennedy City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	H. Glover City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	J. Schultz City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	M. Davis City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	M. Schwarz City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	M. Peel City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	C. Pasternak City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	B. Cook City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	E. Mojica City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	R. Murphy City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	N. Reddick City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	F. Young City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	T. Patton City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	Ricardo City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	City Engineering Division D. Lerche		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	K. Again City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	M. Twyman City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	R. Perez City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	D. Thomas City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	V. Patel City Engineering Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	Mrs Rodger Solid Waste Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	Mr. Morris Solid Waste Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	Mr. Collins Solid Waste Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	Mr. Thompson Solid Waste Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	D. Patel Street Maintenance Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	P. Henderson Street Maintenance Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	S. Johnson Street Maintenance Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	C. Palm Street Maintenance Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	1	Curtis Jackson Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	1	Clifford Jones Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	1	David Minor Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	1	Vince Robinson Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	1	James Morris Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	1	Tony Blocker Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
TOTAL VEHICLES	42			
Department of Transportation (DDOT)				
	1	L. Stewart	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	K. Johnson	Trans Opr Mgr.	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	K. Jones	GM-Operations	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	D. Yulle	GM-Administration	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	S. Bogan	Transit Chef	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	R. Brown	Transit LT	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	A. Mallett	Trans Opr Mgr.	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	A. Square	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	R. Granger	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	A. Stewart	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	D. Hughey	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	K. Williams	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	W. Emerson	Mgr. II-Plant Maint	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	D. Hodges	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	L. Tiller	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	B. Timarac	Mgr. I Safety/Security	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	M. Dawley	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	M. Eason	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	A. Jones	Deputy Director	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	B. Williams	Trans Opr Mgr.	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	L. Luckett	GM-Maintenance	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	D. Dirks	Director	24/7 Operational Staff
TOTAL VEHICLES	22			
Detroit Recreation Department				
	1	K. Flournoy	GM - Operations	To cover City business; respond to emergencies.
TOTAL VEHICLES	1			
Detroit Water and Sewage Department				
	1	JACKSON	Fields Services Manager-Maintenance Repair	24/7 Operation
	1	FARHAT	Engineering Manager	24/7 Operation
	1	MARTIN CRAIG	Executive Management Team	24/7 Operation
	1	GARY BROWN	Director	24/7 Operation
TOTAL VEHICLES	4			
Detroit Police Department				
	73			REQUESTED THAT WE KEEP THE NAMES CONFIDENTIAL
Fire Department				
	1	E. Jones	Fire Commissioner	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	D. Fomell	Dep. Fire Commissioner	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	S. Zack	2nd Deputy Comm.	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	D. Hillman	Director of Special Projects	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	L. Halon	Chaplain	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	G. Turner	Fire Marshall	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	S. Battle	Chief Fire Marshall	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	J. King	Chief of Department	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	R. Shinske	Deputy Chief-Admin.	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	Vacant	Deputy Chief-Operations	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	S. Larkins	Chief of EMS	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	R. Burch	Deputy Chief of EMS	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	M. Jackson	Homeland Security Liaison	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	R. Whitaker	Communication Director	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	S. Halsell	Radio Shop	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	A. Green	Chief of Training	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	D. Bradley	Chief-Community Relations	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	K. Wyatt	Chief-Communications	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
	1	L. Wood	Counseling Unit	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day
TOTAL VEHICLES	19			
General Services				
	1	Vincent Annunah	Manager	Reason not provided
	1	Lajuan Counts	Asst Director	Reason not provided
	1	Ray Tyler	Supervisor	Patrol
	1	Todd Mistor	Superintendent	Division Supervision
	1	Arlene Kirby	Asst. Forester	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift
	1	Dennis Crawford	Park Maintenance Sub-Foreman	Crew Supervision During Shift
	1	Carlos Coronado	Associate Forester	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift
	1	Chris Romeo	Park Maintenance Supervisor	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift
	1	Deborah Howard	Park Maintenance Supervisor	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift
	1	Thomas Cunningham	Park Maintenance Foreman (OOC)	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift
	1	Jim Revait	Forestry Foreman	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift. Emergency Work.
	1	Nellis Carr	Street Fund Foreman	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift
	1	Elian Morrow	Floriculture Supervisor	Crew/ Site Survey During Shift

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	1	Rosemary Edwards	Asst. Superintendent	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
	1	Tony Plunphy	Asst. Forester	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
	1	Angela Hipps	Manager 1	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
	1	Steve Coleman	Street Fund Supervisor	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
	1	Valerie Massey	Manager	Reason not provided
	1	Ken Johnson	Foreman	Reason not provided
	1	Jessica Knight	Manager	Reason not provided
	1	Barrett Irving	Supervisor	Reason not provided
	1	Bill Webster	Asst Superintendent	Reason not provided
	1	Marty Gulinn	Superintendent	Reason not provided
	1	Dorothy Young	Security	Patrol
	1	Johnnie Haynes	Superintendent	Reason not provided
	1	Joe Fidel	Security	Patrol
	1	Kenneth Howell	Forestry Foreman (OOC)	Crew/Site Survey During Shift, Emergency Work.
	1	Norman Wallace	Senior Tree Artisan	Forest Survey During Shift
	1	Les Ellison	Park Development Foreman	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
	1	Edward Dickerson	Storeroom	Fuel Management
	1	Michael Shearer	Supervisor	Reason not provided
	1	Johnnie Haynes	Superintendent	Reason not provided
TOTAL VEHICLES	32			
Law Department	1	T. Butler	Municipal Adjuster	Investigation of alleged claims.
Mayor's Office	1	M. O'Clairacain	Deputy Mayor	To conduct City business.
TOTAL	208			