City of Detroit

OFFICE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL 2 WOODWARD AVENUE. SUITE 216



Detroit, Michigan 48226 PHONE: (313) 224-4558 FAX: (313) 224-4091 markl@detroitmi.gov

Mark W. Lockridge, CPA Auditor General

MEMORANDUM

DATE:

February 15, 2017

TO:

Honorable City Council

Honorable Mayor Mike Duggan

FROM:

Mark W. Lockridge, CPA

Auditor General

RE:

Council Special Report on City Vehicles

CC:

Aliyah S. Sabree, Esq., City Council Liaison Stephanie Washington, City Council Liaison

Attached for your review is our Special Report on City Vehicles. On September 7, 2016, the Budget, Finance and Audit Standing Committee sent a Memorandum from Council Member Janee' Ayers requesting "the Office of the Auditor General provide an audit of city vehicles assigned to city employees and what the reasoning is for why a car is warranted for each position receiving one."

In response, the Office of the Auditor General conducted a review of city vehicles assigned to individuals. This memorandum serves to provide your Honorable Body with the results of our review.

The objectives of our examination were to determine:

- City vehicles assigned to City employees; and
- What the reasoning is for why a car is warranted for each position receiving one.

To achieve our objectives we requested every City department provide us with the following information:

 A list of vehicles issued to your department. The list should include whether the vehicle is assigned to an individual or is a "pool" vehicle that can be used

- by anyone within the department, the make, model, year, vehicle identification number (VIN), and City asset number.
- If a vehicle is assigned to an individual, include the individual's name, title and the reason why they need a City vehicle assigned to them as part of their job responsibilities.
- The list of vehicles would not include ambulances, fire trucks, under cover vehicles or police cars assigned as pool vehicles.

In addition, we; interviewed key personnel, examined other pertinent documents and performed random site visits for verification of vehicles.

Table A summarizes the Department's information concerning vehicles that are not specialized vehicles such as ambulances, police cars, etc. Table B is a list of individuals that have been assigned vehicles per their Department.

DEPARTMENT/AREA	City Ve	hicles	Total Number of Vehicles	Number of Pool Vehicles	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals
	Yes	No			
36th District Court	Х		2	2	C
Airport	Х		6	6	(
Animal Care and Control	Х		6	6	(
City Clerk	X		2	0	2
Election Commission	Х		6	4	2
City Council	Х		9	0	9
Department of Innovations and Technology	Х		4	4	(
Department of Public Works	Х		137	95	4:
Department of Transportation (DDOT)	X		105	83	2:
Detroit Police Department	Х		73	0	7:
Detroit Recreation Department	Х		25	24	
Detroit Water and Sewage Department	Х		412	408	
Fire Department	Х		19	0	1
General Services	Х		218	186	3
Housing & Revitalization Department	Х	,	1	1	
Law Department	Х		1	0	
Mayor's Office	Х		1	0	
Municipal Parking Department	. X		88	88	
Office of the Inspector General	X		1	1	
Office of the CFO	X		3	3	
Planning & Development Department	X		1	1	
Public Health	X		6	6	•
Public Lighting Department	Х		7	7	
Building Safety Engineering		Х			
Dept. of Administrative Hearings		X			
Greater Detroit Resource Recovery Auth.		X			
Human Resources & Labor Relations		X			
Human Rights		X			
Office of the Ombudsman		Х			
Office of the Auditor General		X			
Zoning Appeals		X			
TOTALS	653535		1133	925	2

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles			
	Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Heason Given
City Clark				30 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 -
	-1	1 J. Winfrey	City Clerk	To conduct City clerk business and administration of the Department of Elections
		1 V. Hudson	Deputy Clerk	This is a "pool vehicle" accessible by clerk personnel. Assigned to conduct City Clerk business.
TOTAL VEHICLES	2			
Election Commission				
	-	D. Baxter	Director	This is a "pool vehicle" accessible by Elections personnel. Assigned to conduct Elections business.
		G. Avery	Deputy Director	This is a "pool vehicle" accessible by Elections personnel. Assigned to conduct Elections business.
TOTAL VEHICLES	2			
City Council	0 100	3 77 8	N THE WHITE WAS THE	
	-1	B. Jones	Council President	To service constituents throughout the City of Detroit and on call 24/7.
	-1	1 J. Ayers	Council Member	To service constituents throughout the City of Detroit and on call 24/7.
	-1	1 J. Tate	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.
		S. Benson	Council Member	To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.

. I ist of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DPW would not provide any		A Sharkat	_	
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		1 H. Crumpler		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		J. Schneider		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		1 D. Ford		
GETTING CLARIFICAITON OF THEIR LIST				Department of Public Works
			9	TOTAL VEHICLES
To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.	Council Member	G. Leland	-4	
Mobile Office Unit - to provide services to citizens in District 6.	Council Member	1 R. Castaneda-Lopez	شد	
To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.	Council Member	R. Castaneda-Lopez	-4	
To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.	Council Member	1 M. Sheffield	-1	
To conduct official City business and on call 24/7.	Council Member	1 A. Spivey		
Reason Given	Title	Vehicle Assigned To	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	DEPARTMENT/AREA

of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

name.				
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the		M. Peel City Engineering	1	
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		M. Schwarz City Engineering Division	-	=
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		M. Davis City Engineering Division	1	
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		J. Schultz Cily Engineering Division	1	
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		H. Glover City Engineering Division	1	×
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		L. Kennedy City Engineering Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		T. Ansari City Engineering Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		G. Winston City Engineering Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		D. Chieu Doung City Engineering Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		L. Anderson, City Engineering Division	-1	
Reason Given	Title	Vehicle Assigned To	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	DEPARTMENT/AREA

ale Accimed Vehicles Per The Department

B. Cook City Engineering Division E. Mojica City Engineering DPW would not provide any additional information other than the provide any addition	N. Re Engir T. Pa Divisi Divisi City
	N. Re Engir F. Yo Divisi Divisi
	N. Re Engin
	N. Re Engin
	N. Re Engir
	_
	1 A. Mu Engin
City Engineering	1 E. Mc
שתם מלוניתי להם לגורים אוסר	1 B. Co
C. Pasternak City additional information other than the name.	1 C. Pa
Vehicle Assigned To Title Reason Given	DEPARTMENT/AREA Assigned to Individuals

of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

		P. Henderson Street		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		D. Patel Street Maintenance Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		Mr. Thompson Solid Waste Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		Mr. Collins Solid Waste		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		Mr. Morris Solid Waste Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		Mrs Rodger Solid Waste Division	-1	
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		V. Patel City Engineering Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		D. Thomas City Engineering Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		R. Perez City Engineering Division		
DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.		M. Twyman City Engineering Division	_	
Reason Given	Title	Vehicle Assigned To	Number of Vehicles Assigned to individuals	DEPARTMENT/AREA

TABLE B - I ist of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
	grad.	S. Johnson Street Maintenance Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
	-4	C. Palm Street Maintenance Division		DPW would not provide any additional information other than the name.
		Curtis Jackson Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	-1	Clifford Jones Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	-	David Minor Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
		Vince Robinson Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
		James Morris Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
	1	Tony Blocker Traffic Engineering Division	Investigator	Field Investigation
TOTAL VEHICLES	42			
Department of Transportation				
		1 L. Stewart	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
		1 K. Johnson	Trans Opr Mgr.	24/7 Operational Staff
	-1	1 K. Jones	GM-Operations	24/7 Operational Staff
		1 D. Yuille	GM-Administration	24/7 Operational Staff
	-	S. Bogan	Transit Chef	24/7 Operational Staff
		1 A Mailett	Trans Onr Mor	24/7 Operational Staff
		1 A. Square	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	R. Granger	Sup Rolling Slock	24/7 Operational Staff
	-4	1 A. Stewart	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	D. Hughey	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
	1	1 K. Williams	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff

TARI F. R. I ist of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA Australia		בוסי סי ווומי	MOLE D - List of individuals vasiding a semicion of		
W. Emerson Mgr. II-Plant Maint	DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Reason Given
D. Hodges Sup Rolling Stock			W. Emerson	Mgr. II-Plant Maint	24/7 Operational Staff
L Tiller Trans Dist. Sup			D. Hodges	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
B. Trimarac Mgr. I Safety/Security 1 M. Dawley Sup Rolling Stock 1 M. Eason Sup Rolling Stock 1 B. Valliams Deput Director 1 B. Valliams Trans Opr Mgr. 1 L. Luckett GAM-Maintenance 1 D. Dirks Director ES 22 In Department 1 K. Flournoy GM - Operations 1 K. Flournoy GM - Operations 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager- 1 FARHAT Engineering Manager 1 JACKSON Maintenance Repair 1 FARHAT Engineering Manager 1 GARY BROWN Director 1 Fields Services Manager 1 Director 1 GARY BROWN Director 1 GARY BROWN Director			L Tiller	Trans Dist. Sup	24/7 Operational Staff
M. Dawley Sup Rolling Stock 1 M. Eason Sup Rolling Stock 1 M. Eason Sup Rolling Stock Deput Pricator 1 B. Williams Trans Opr Mgr. GM-Maintenance GM-Maintenance Director GM-Maintenance Director Trans Opr Mgr. GM-Maintenance Trans Opr Mgr. GM-Maintenance Trans Opr Mgr. GM-Maintenance Trans Opr Mgr. GM-Operations GM-Operations Trans Opr Mgr. Trans			B. Timarac	Mgr. I Safety/Security	24/7 Operational Staff
1 M. Eason 1 A. Jones 1 A. Jones 1 B. Williams 1 Trans Opr Mgr. 1 L. Luckett 1 D. Dirks 1 D. Dirks 1 D. Director ES 22 IX. Flournoy GM - Operations ES 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager- 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director Fields Services Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director Fields Services Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director Fields Services Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director Fields Services Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 2 Director Fields Services Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 2 Director Fields Services Manager 3 Director Fields Services Manager 4 Fields Services Management Team 5 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 6 Director Fields Services Management Team 7 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 9 Director			M. Dawley	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
1 A. Jones Deputy Director 1 B. Williams Trans Opr Mgr. 1 L. Luckett GM-Maintenance 1 D. Dirks Director 22 22 22 22 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 29 29 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20		-	M. Eason	Sup Rolling Stock	24/7 Operational Staff
Trans Opr Mgr. 1 L. Luckett GM-Maintenance 1 D. Dirks Director 22 nn Department 1 K. Flournoy GM - Operations ES 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director 1 GARY BROWN Director Fire Commissioner		ad.	A. Jones	Deputy Director	24/7 Operational Staff
ES 22 n Department 1 L. Luckett GM-Maintenance n Department 1 K. Flournoy GM - Operations ES 1 GM - Operations d Sewage Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Managerering Manager 1 GARY BROWN Director partment 73 partment 73 E. Jones Fire Commissioner		-1	B. Williams	Trans Opr Mgr.	24/7 Operational Staff
ES 22 In Department 1 K. Flournoy GM - Operations ES 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair 1 JACKSON Maintenance Repair 1 JACRAFUN CHAIG Engineering Manager Executive Manager Director 1 GARY BROWN Director 73 Fire Commissioner		-1	L. Luckett	GM-Maintenance	24/7 Operational Staff
ES 22 In Department 1 K. Flournoy GM - Operations ES 1 I JACKSON Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair I FARHAT Engineering Manager ES 1 GARY BROWN Director Partment 73 E. Jones Fire Commissioner			D. Dirks	Director	24/7 Operational Staff
In Department 1 K. Flournoy GM - Operations I JACKSON Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair I FARHAT I MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team I GARY BROWN Director Partment 73 Director Fire Commissioner	TOTAL VEHICLES	22			
ES 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager Maintenance Repair Executive Manager Executive Manager Director partment 73 1 E. Jones Fire Commissioner					
ES 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair MARTIN CRAIG Executive Managerent Team GARY BROWN Director ES 73 JE. Jones Fire Commissioner	Detroit Recreation Department				
ES 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager Maintenance Repair 1 MARTIN CRAIG Engineering Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Manager 1 GARY BROWN Director Partment 73 1 E. Jones Fire Commissioner		-	K. Flournoy	GM - Operations	emergencies.
d Sewage 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair 1 FARHAT Engineering Manager Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director partment 73 E. Jones Fire Commissioner	TOTAL VEHICLES	-			
d Sewage 1 JACKSON Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Manager 1 GARY BROWN Director 73 partment 73 Fire Commissioner					
Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair 1 FARHAT 1 MARTIN CRAIG 1 GARY BROWN Partment 73 Director Fire Commissioner	Detroit Water and Sewage			1	
1 FARHAT Engineering Manager 1 MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director Partment 73 Director Fire Commissioner		-1	JACKSON	Fields Services Manager- Maintenance Repair	24/7 Operation
MARTIN CRAIG Executive Management Team 1 GARY BROWN Director 4 73 Fire Commissioner			FARHAT	Engineering Manager	24/7 Operation
ES 4 Director Partment 73 Partment 1 E. Jones Fire Commissioner			MARTIN CRAIG	Executive Management Team	24/7 Operation
partment 73 partment Fire Commissioner		-	GARY BROWN	Director	24/7 Operation
partment 73 1 E. Jones Fire Commissioner	TOTAL VEHICLES	4			
1 E. Jones Fire Commissioner	Detroit Police Department	73			REQUESTED THAT WE KEEP THE
1 E. Jones Fire Commissioner					
Fire Commissioner	Fire Department				
		_	E. Jones	Fire Commissioner	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day

ed Vehicles Per The Department

Number of Vehicles Assigned To Individuals Vehicle Assigned To Title Peason Given	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day	Homeland Security Liaison	M. Jackson	_	48
Number of Vehicles Assigned To Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fornell 1 D. Fornell 1 S. Zack 2nd Deputy Comm. 1 L. Haton 1 G. Turner 1 S. Battle 1 J. King 1 R. Shinske Deputy Chief-Admin. Deputy Chief-Admin. 1 Vacant Deputy Chief-Operations Chief of EMS Chief of EMS	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a da	Deputy Chief of EMS		-4	
Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fomell 1 D. Fomell 1 S. Zack 2nd Deputy Comm. 1 L. Haton 1 G. Turner 1 S. Battle 1 J. King 1 R. Shinske Deputy Chief-Admin.	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a da	Chief of EMS	S. Larkins		
Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fornell 1 D. Fornell 2 Dep. Fire Commissioner 1 S. Zack 1 D. Hillman 2 Director of Special Projects 2 Chaplain 3 S. Battle 3 S. Battle 4 Chief Fire Marshall 5 Chief of Department 6 Chief-Admin.	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a da	Deputy Chief-Operations			W
Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fornell 1 D. Fornell 2 Dep. Fire Commissioner 2 Ind Deputy Comm. 2 Ind Deputy Comm. 2 Ind Deputy Comm. 3 L. Haton 4 Chaplain 5 S. Battle 5 Chief Fire Marshall 6 Chief of Department 6 Chief of Department	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a de	Deputy Chief-Admin.			
Number of Vehicles Assigned to individuals 1 D. Fornell Dap. Fire Commissioner 1 D. Hillman Dap. Fire Commissioner 1 D. Hillman Director of Special Projects 1 G. Turner Fire Marshall 1 S. Battle Chief Fire Marshall	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a de	Chief of Department	J. King	-4	
Number of Vehicles Assigned to individuals 1 D. Fornell 1 S. Zack 2nd Deputy Comm. 1 D. Hillman Director of Special Projects 1 G. Turner Fire Marshall	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a di	Chief Fire Marshall	S. Battle		
Number of Vehicle Assigned To Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fornell 1 S. Zack 2nd Deputy Comm. 1 D. Hillman Director of Special Projects 1 Chaplain	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a di	Fire Marshall			
Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fornell 1 S. Zack 2nd Deputy Comm. 1 D. Hillman Director of Special Projects	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a di	Chaplain	L. Halon		
Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fornell Dep. Fire Commissioner 1 S. Zack 2nd Deputy Comm.	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a dr	Director of Special Projects			
Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals 1 D. Fornell Title Dep. Fire Commissioner	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a de	2nd Deputy Comm.		-	
Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals Vehicle Assigned To Title	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a de	Dep. Fire Commissioner			
	Reason Given	Title	Vehicle Assigned To	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	DEPARTMENT/AREA

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

														GeneraliServices	I O I A C V C I C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C	או אהנוכן הס							DEPAR I WENT/AREA Assigned
- Cici	1 Cilan Morr	1 Alphi	1 Jim Revait	1 Thon	1 Debo	1 Chris	1 Carlo	1 Denr	1 Arier	1 Todd	1 Ray Tyler	1 LaJu	1 Vince	TO THE PROPERTY OF THE PERSON		19	1 L. Wood	1 K. Wyatt	1 D. Bradley	1 A. Green	1, S, Halsell	1 A. W	Assigned to Individuals
- From money	Morrow	Car	Revait	Thomas Cunningham	1 Deborah Howard	1 Chris Romeo	1 Carlos Coronado	1 Dennis Crawford	1 Ariene Kirby	1 Todd Mistor	Tyler	1 LaJuan Counts	Vincent Anwunah				ood	yatt	radley	raen	alsell	1 R. Whitaker	Adincia Vasidisan i A
	Floricultura Sunarvisor	Street Frind Foreman	Forestry Foreman	Park Maintenance Foreman (OOC)	Park Maintenance Supervisor	Park Maintenance Supervisor	Associate Forester	Park Maintenance Sub-Foreman	Asst. Forester	Superintendent	Supervisor	Asst Director	Manager			91	Counseling Unit	Chief-Communications	Chief-Community Relations	Chief of Training	Radio Shop	Communication Director	
	Crew/Site Survey During Shift	Crew/Site Survey During Shift	Crew/Site Survey During Shift. Emergency Work.	Crew/Site Survey During Shift	Crew/Site Survey During Shift	Crew/Site Survey During Shift	Crew/Site Survey During Shift	Crew Supervision During Shift	Crew/Site Survey During Shift	Division Supervision	Patrol	Reason not provided	Reason not provided				To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day	To respond to emergencies and department business 24 hours a day	

TABLE B - List of Individuals Assigned Vehicles Per The Department

DEPARTMENT/AREA	Number of Vehicles Assigned to Individuals	Vehicle Assigned To	Title	Heason Given
	_	1 Rosemary Edwards	Asst. Superintendent	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
		Tony Rumphy	Asst. Forester	Craw/Site Survey During Shift
		Angela Hipps	Manager 1	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
	-1	Sleve Coleman	Street Fund Supervisor	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
		Valerie Massey	Manager	Reason not provided
		Ken Johnson	Foreman	Reason not provided
		Jessica Knight	Manager	Reason not provided
		Barrett Irving	Supervisor	Reason not provided
		Bill Webster	Asst Superintendent	Reason not provided
		Marty Guinn	Superintendent	Reason not provided
		Dorothy Young	Security	Patrol
	1	Johnnie Haynes	Superintendent	Reason not provided
		Joe Fidel	Security	Patrol
	1	Kenneth Howell	Forestry Foreman (OOC)	Crew/Site Survey During Shift. Emergency Work.
		Norman Wallace	Senior Tree Artisan	Forest Survey During Shift
		Les Ellison	Park Development Foreman	Crew/Site Survey During Shift
		Edward Dickerson	Storeroom	Fuel Management
	-1	Michael Shearer	Supervisor	Reason not provided
		Johnnie Haynes	Superintendent	Reason not provided
TOTAL VEHICLES	32			
law Department		T. Butler	Municipal Adjuster	investigation of alleged claims.
Mauric Office		1M O'Claireacain	Denuity Mayor	To conduct City business.
TOTAL	208			